### MEASUREMENT, AWARENESS-RAISING, AND POLICY ENGAGEMENT TO ADDRESS CHILD LABOR AND FORCED LABOR (THE MAP 16 PROJECT)

### Country Findings

Grantee: International Labour Organization (ILO) | Project Duration: December 2016 – June 2024

# **(1)** PROJECT DETAILS

Award: Total funding as of Fiscal Year 2023, \$23,945,000.

Goal: Help build and apply the critical knowledge needed to inform policy choices to combat child labor and forced labor and to support measures to address these challenges in key countries, regions, and sectors.

**Countries and Regions:** Global, Argentina, Colombia, Fiji, India, Jordan, Kosovo,<sup>1</sup> Mauritania, Montenegro, Morocco, Niger, Serbia, Sri Lanka, and Timor-Leste.<sup>2</sup>



Assess achievement of project objectives, challenges encountered, intended and unintended effects, lessons learned, emerging good practices, and project sustainability.

## Sevaluation methodology

The mixed-methods evaluation consisted of extensive document review, **190 key informant interviews**, **7 focus group discussions**, and an **online perception survey with 198 training participants**.

Evaluation fieldwork was conducted from August 2023 to November 2023, in person for Argentina, India, and Kosovo and remotely for Fiji, Niger, Serbia, Sri Lanka, Timor-Leste, and the global and research components.<sup>3</sup>

Respondents included project staff, key partners, trainees, representatives of national statistical offices, labor ministries, academic institutions, trade unions, and employers' organizations. Interviews were also conducted with the ILO Regional Initiative: Latin America and the Caribbean Free of Child Labour (RILAC) technical secretariat representatives in Peru and Costa Rica, ILO staff in Argentina, and a key government stakeholder in Mexico to assess the RILAC child labor risk model.

# **EVALUATION LIMITATIONS**

**Most country components were already closed** by the time the evaluation started, which made it challenging to coordinate fieldwork logistics and reach all stakeholders.

**Challenges in remote data collection** due to poor phone reception and internet connectivity.

Training participant lists for the online survey had **incomplete contact information** or were often too large, so survey participants had to be sampled.

**Lower response rate** (11 percent) for the online survey of training participants due possibly to the large time lag between training implementation and survey dissemination.

<sup>1</sup> This designation is without prejudice to positions on status and is in line with UN Security Council resolution 1244

<sup>2</sup> The evaluation did not cover all the priority capacity-building countries under MAP 16 because some country components had been closed for more than a year at the time of the evaluation.
<sup>3</sup> Evaluation results reflect project progress as of November 2023, however, MAP 16 activities continued until June 2024.

### COUNTRY FINDINGS BRIEF CONTENTS

This brief covers the achievements, lessons learned, promising practices, and challenges from the 8 countries covered in this evaluation. To navigate to a specific country, please use the hyperlinks below.





A brief detailing the overall global and research findings for the MAP 16 project can be found <u>here</u>.







Workshop with labor inspectors in La Pampa Province.



Conducted, published, and disseminated research, including analysis of national survey data, to improve understanding of child labor and family dynamics, study on perceptions about gender stereotypes and sexual division of labor, and study on statistical relationship between social protection measures.

Held a research dissemination workshop that increased awareness among provincial labor ministries in Corrientes and Misiones **about forced labor in the forestry sector** and, as a result, **the provincial labor ministries increased the number of inspectors responsible for conducting** 

inspections of forestry-related enterprises.

The Secretary of Social Security **used research results to extend social security benefits coverage** from 16 to 18 years of age.

As a result of regional workshops, Jujuy and La Pampa provinces validated and committed to use the national inspection administration procedures and standards.

The Federal Public Revenue Administration **used information from a regional workshop to develop an inspection protocol** for division inspectors to help them identify child labor cases. CHALLENGES

There was a missed opportunity to include judges in regional workshops. It is crucial to include justice representatives, particularly judges, in capacity-building activities, as although the number of child and forced labor complaints have increased, very few are actually prosecuted.

Training was too theoretical for some labor inspectors. Project design should include training that is more practical and less theoretical, including practice conducting inspections and using new skills and tools such as inspection protocols.

Labor inspectorate and trade unions have limited resources to provide training at a level equal to that provided by the project.



Studies should be **strongly linked with awareness-raising and advocacy activities**, increasing the ability to use emerging research to shape public policy and other government programs.

Working at the **provincial level** is of value because the provinces have significant autonomy.

# PROMISING PRACTICES

The project disseminated research findings through a range of **innovative communication tools** such as PowerPoint presentations, brochures, infographics, and YouTube videos.

Rather than develop new training for labor inspectors, employers, and trade unions, the **project worked with these social partners** to add child labor topics, content, and tools to their planned training programs. Building on existing initiatives rather than developing new ones creates efficiency and helps ensure success because it does not generate more work for stakeholders.

The project helped labor inspectors **include child labor and forced labor** in their inspections.

### **TRAINING OPINION SURVEY RESULTS**



N=43

**93%** of respondents felt that the trainings were either relevant or highly relevant

40% of respondents often used new knowledge and skills in their work

**37%** of respondents thought the training was highly effective in improving their capacity to combat child labor



FIJ

# 

Helped the Ministry of Employment Productivity and Industrial Relations (MEPIR) develop the child labor component for its paperless national labor inspection system and produced a report on the characteristics of child labor: COVID-19 and Child Labor in Fiji: A Situational Assessment.

Developed and piloted the joint labor inspection protocol for the worst forms of child labor with MEPIR, the Fiji Police Force, and the Ministry of Women, Children and Poverty Alleviation (MWCPA). The protocol was also used to train 212 relevant personnel including labor inspectors, social welfare officers, police officers, teachers, etc.

Conducted **online awareness**raising activities to support

the first ever World Day Against Child Labor (WDACL)<sup>4</sup> in Fiji, including gathering pledges from government, employers, and trade unions, publishing the **ILO/UNICEF op-ed piece** for national media and guide for journalists, and conducting a **session on combatting child labor** through labor inspections.

Provided **entrepreneur training** to women in the Qauia community, women dairy farmers in Naitasiri, and women entrepreneurs in the Western Province.

Supported **revisions to the National Child Labor Policy** (NCLP), including draft lists of hazardous occupations and light work for children, National Action Plan for Child Labor (NAPCL), and draft child protection provisions.



Projects need **adequate resources and time** to have impact.

It is important to **determine level of political willingness** and develop advocacy strategies or shift focus.

Child labor training can be institutionalized in employers' organizations by incorporating it into the human resource training mandates.



**Collaboration** with MEPIR, the Fiji Police Force, and the MWCPA to pilot joint labor inspection protocol.

Close **cooperation with Ministry of iTaukei Affairs** to reach rural indigenous communities for child labor awarenessraising activities.



The government has not approved key policies (National Child Labour Policy, National Action Plan on Child Labour, hazardous occupations, labor inspection protocol). Note that the new government appears committed to approving these policies.

National elections led to **frequent transfers of government officials**, which created delays because of the need to orient new officials and "get them up to speed."

Lack of resources hindered opportunities for continuing training and awareness raising.

The paperless labor inspection information system is not having full impact because MEPIR **lacks required hardware** to make the system fully operational.

Difficulties rescheduling activities and moving activities to virtual formats during the **COVID-19** pandemic.

### TRAINING OPINION SURVEY RESULTS



94% of respondents felt that the trainings were either relevant or highly relevant

61% of respondents often used new knowledge and skills in their work **48%** of respondents thought the training was highly effective in improving their capacity to combat child labor

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Every June the ILO <u>World Day Against Child Labour</u> brings together governments, employers and workers organizations, and civil society to focus attention on the global extent of child labor and the action and efforts needed to eliminate it.





Awareness program engaging local community in Jamui, Bihar.



Collaborated with district administration, Workers Information and Support Centre, Jan Shikshan Sansthan (Skill Training Centers), and volunteers **to link eligible child labor families with government services.** 

Provided technical support to Uttar Pradesh to revise its **State Action Plan** for elimination of child labor.

**Conducted training and workshops on child labor** at the state and the district levels for **stakeholders** including department of labor and representatives of civil society organizations.

Involved stakeholders representing civil society organizations, UNICEF, lawyers, and media personnel in national consultation for creating public awareness.



By engaging with the most highly placed government official in Jamui in the state of Bihar, the District Magistrate, the project was able to **enlist the involvement of other ministries** to provide critical services to vulnerable families.

Strong collaboration with the labor department **at the district level.** 

### **TRAINING OPINION SURVEY RESULTS**



85% of respondents felt that the trainings were either relevant or highly relevant

86% of respondents often used new knowledge and skills in their work 64% of respondents thought the training was highly effective in improving their capacity to combat child labor

**LESSONS LEARNED** 

Recurring training programs for frontline

awareness of programs and policies on

organizations to stress that accurate and

timely child labor data is needed to ensure

child labor surveys are conducted at both

workers are needed to increase

Future projects should continue to

collaborate with nongovernmental

Engagement with ILO constituents,

organizations and women's self-help

groups, can help sustain the initiative

beyond the project implementation period.

including employers and workers

state and district levels.

child labor.



**Government priorities shifted** from child labor to out of school children.

**Change in project staff** at the national and international levels caused delays and discontinuity in planning and implementation.

India lacks a stand-alone child labor survey to capture child labor information and the national census does not include questions on child labor. To help ensure availability of recent child labor data, the project initially planned to update relevant sections of the National Child Labour Project survey questionnaire. However, due to a lack of interest on the part of government officials, project staff opted to abandon the plan to update the existing survey instruments.

Short duration contracts with local implementing partners made it difficult retain staff and deliver results.

Despite efforts in Chattisgarh, Bihar and Uttar Pradesh, only Uttar Pradesh incorporated child labor knowledge into a State Action Plan.

The **COVID-19** pandemic was a disruptor, making it difficult to conduct field visits and engage with frontline workers.

N=19



# KOSOVO



Ceremony of certification of trainers for SCREAM and Youth@Work.

**ACHIEVEMENTS** 

Stakeholders completed and validated the Hazardous Child Labor (HCL) list and the light work list.

Supported the establishment of **Child Protection Teams** in municipalities and assisted the teams in drafting action plans.

Developed manuals and guidelines to support improved service delivery to children engaged in HCL, and trained staff of Centers for Social Works to improve child labor case management.

**Trained education personnel** on child labor, including on the implementation of the ILO Supporting Children's Rights through Education, Arts and Media (SCREAM) methodology, and trained school inspectors and quality assurance coordinators on child labor and school dropout prevention, with these efforts showing promise of sustainability.

Conducted and published a rapid assessment that **led to the development of a roadmap to eliminate child labor in the agriculture sector.** 

The Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Rural Development now bans the use of HCL by subcontractors and incorporates training on HCL in its farmer training program.

#### **TRAINING OPINION SURVEY RESULTS**



**100%** of respondents felt that the trainings were either relevant or highly relevant

77% of respondents often used new knowledge and skills acquired in their work



The number and diversity of stakeholders should be adjusted to project resources and life cycle.

**Capacity building activities** for the most relevant stakeholders should be increased to improve training effectiveness and enhance sustainability.

Focus should be on core project activities and **ensure adequate resources** to implement them.



ILO tripartite process/participatory and inclusive approach on its work in regulatory frameworks resulted in ownership of project outputs by Kosovo authorities.

Historical technical support to the government, ILO expertise in addressing HCL, and the country coordinator's expertise resulted in **higher buy-in and quality of deliverables.** 

The quality of the trainings and workshops was highly rated by majority of stakeholders. **Sharing products from workshops and additional follow-up** have helped in strengthening cooperation.



Because the project worked with a large number of stakeholders, the number of planned activities with some important stakeholders (judges, prosecutors, and social workers) did not fully meet their needs.

The process of drafting laws and secondary legislation was **time consuming** and influenced by **political** and **legislative agendas**.

Despite advancing laws on paper, implementation was hindered by the **lack of functioning systems of protection within Kosovo institutions**. For example, while the penal code obligates the reporting of hazardous child labor cases, there is no effective reporting system in place.

Participation of **judges and prosecutors** in the trainings was low.

The Social Services Division underwent frequent changes: Initially part of the Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare, it was moved first to the Ministry of Health then to Ministry of Finances, and later to the Ministry of Justice. The changes delayed work on the hazardous child labor list and child labor database.



### NIGER



Joint mission Ministry of Employment, Labour and Social Protection and ILO to regional labor inspectorate in Tahoua.

# **ACHIEVEMENTS**

Established National Steering the construction sector, Committee for Child Labor, which provides critical leadership and coordination among key child labor actors to inform policies and interventions.

Began updating the National **Action Plan on Child Labour** (NAPCL) including holding stakeholder awarenessraising workshops. Even though work on the NAPCL had to be suspended due to the political situation, it was highlighted as the most sustainable achievement.

Conducted awareness-raising workshops on hazardous child labor for employers in

farmers, and stakeholders in the mining sector and organized radio debates to raise awareness about child labor.

Conducted trainings on child labor for employers, trade unions, and inspectors. Labor inspectorate officials noted that the training improved the inspectors' abilities to identify cases of child labor in the field, ask relevant questions about age and working conditions, and take measures to protect the children.



It is important to have strong political commitment, as project engagement from the labor ministry created motivation and support.

Training effectiveness could be improved by increasing the number of labor inspectors trained and improving methodology so inspectors can practice and apply acquired skills in the field, including where to refer child labor cases.

Developing and implementing a **project** sustainability plan at the early stages of the project could help ensure the sustainability of key outcomes.

## **PROMISING PRACTICES**

The National Steering Committee on Child Labor provided valuable advice and guidance and facilitated collaboration and coordination among key child labor actors.



Due to **political instability.<sup>5</sup>** some activities, especially those related to the National Action Plan on Child Labor (NAPCL), were suspended.

Due to security concerns, staff travel was limited, and activities related to mobile schools<sup>6</sup> were cancelled.

Government resources to continue training and awareness-raising activities are limited.



Awareness raising event on the World Day against Child Labour held in Guidan Roumdji refugee camp on 12 June 2023.

TRAINING OPINION SURVEY RESULTS



100% of respondents felt that the trainings were either relevant or highly relevant

91% of respondents often used new knowledge and skills in their work

83% of respondents thought the training was highly effective in improving their capacity to combat child labor

<sup>5</sup> Following the military coup of July 2023, the democratically elected government was dissolved, and instructions were given by the United Nations coordinator and the ILO Country Office in Abidjan to suspend all support to the bodies and institutions created by the new military authorities. As a result, activities related to the validation of the NAPCL were suspended because they involved consultations with the government and parliamentarians.

<sup>6</sup> Mobile schools are alternative schooling facilities that travel to remote areas to provide educational opportunities for children who otherwise would not have access to education.

N=9



### SERBIA



Participants of the training on child labor held on 19 October 2023 in Novi Sad, Serbia.

## **ACHIEVEMENTS**

Completed and submitted recommendations to align national laws with international standards. a draft list of light work, and a draft amended Decree on Hazardous Child Labor to corresponding ministries. Of these, the first two are likely to be incorporated into the new labor law when approved (expected in 2026).

Collaborated with UNICEF to develop a set of indicators to identify child labor in the formal and informal sector.

Developed two draft amendments of instruction to protect children against child labor, one for professionals in the social protection system

and another for labor inspectors.

Conducted training course to strengthen social protection systems to prevent child labor, which was accredited and offered to social protection professionals, with the active role and supervision of the Republic Institute for Social Protection.

Revised the special protocol for labor inspection and draft amendments of instruction for labor inspectors to protect children against child labor.

Piloted and published results of the child labor module for the labor force survey and trained the statistical office.



## **LESSONS LEARNED**

It is critical to reach families with children at high risk for child labor in rural areas and to conduct more awareness-raising and education activities in communities at risk.

There is a need to focus more on using media to communicate child labor messages to the public.

Employers require child labor trainings tailored to their needs, particularly by risk areas and sectors.



MAP 16 built on CLEAR<sup>7</sup> project success, leveraging pre-established relationships with stakeholders to kickstart activities.

In response to government resistance in approving various child labor policy documents, the project shifted its focus to awareness raising.



Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, some activities were temporarily suspended or significantly delayed.

After national elections, there were changes of key personnel and new government personnel were reluctant to agree to what the previous government had agreed to support.

Integration of child labor module in future labor force surveys has not yet been approved.

Draft light work list and recommendations to align national laws with international standards have not been incorporated into the new labor law yet.

Activities to evaluate the existing roadmap to eliminate child labor and to develop a new roadmap were cancelled due to a lack of interest from relevant stakeholders.

### TRAINING OPINION SURVEY RESULTS



94% of respondents felt that the trainings were either relevant or highly relevant

22% of respondents often used new knowledge and skills in their work

56% of respondents thought the training was highly effective in improving their capacity to combat child labor

<sup>7</sup> The United States Department of Labor-funded Country Level Engagement and Assistance to Reduce Child Labor (CLEAR) project was implemented by ILO from November 2013 to June 2018.





## SRI LANKA



Supporting children to make safe career choices help them to avoid child labor in their school to work transition. With the Ministry of Education, the ILO MAP 16 project in Sri Lanka trained 133 master trainers and empowered over 2,400 families across the country.

# **ACHIEVEMENTS**

**Produced a package of materials on innovative interventions** for eliminating hazardous child labor and trained labor inspectors, 146 child services officers, and police on how to use them.

Produced a **child labor communication strategy** currently in use by the Sri Lanka Department of Labor (DOL) and posted messages on the Department's YouTube page.

**Developed a school-to-work manual for parents**, approved by the Ministry of Education, used to train more than 2,400 parents of children in 20 schools.

Improved the quality of the **Commercial Sex Exploitation of Children (CSEC) study** conducted under the USDOL Country Level Engagement and Assistance to Reduce Child Labor (CLEAR) project and developed recommendations for the government.

Developed a comprehensive communication strategy on child labor that helped with awareness-raising and is still being used by the Sri Lanka DOL.



Need to protect identities of case victims meant plan to produce child labor impact stories had to be abandoned.

On-going consultation with government is critical on planned activities to determine need, interest, and priorities.

To be effective, child labor awareness programs must be implemented at the provincial level and involve local decisionmakers and community leaders.



School-to-work manual for parents was considered highly effective and popular with parents, and the Ministry of Education continues to use it.

The **child labor communication strategy was an important achievement** because it helped raise awareness about child labor.

<sup>8</sup> The economic crisis included shortages of fuel and power and in response to mass protests, the government set curfews and restricted movement. The combination of factors forced the project and its stakeholders to restrict travel.



The **lack of government interest and support** led to the **cancellation** of about 50 percent of planned outputs and activities.

Due to a small sample and confidentiality requirements, the project **could not publish the results** of its analysis of National Child Protection Authority hotline data.

Plans to add a child labor module to the Labor Inspection Application System (LISA) were abandoned because DOL does not consider it an effective child labor monitoring tool and is in the process of replacing LISA with another monitoring tool.

The government **did not pursue the CSEC study** and plans to engage in policy dialogue concerning the recommendations were cancelled.

Some project activities were **suspended** for nearly eight months in response to the **political and economic crisis** in 2022.<sup>8</sup>

Plans to establish an Alliance 8.7 coordination group were **cancelled** as the **government already has a Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) committee** monitoring progress on achieving SDGs.



## TIMOR-LESTE



On June 7, 2022, ILO MAP 16 and UNICEF met with H.E José Ramos-Horta, the President of Timor-Leste, to discuss the findings of an ILO and UNICEF survey on the "Drivers of Child Labour in Timor-Leste" which examines the knowledge, attitudes and practices related to child labor in the country. Conducted **Knowledge**, attitudes, and practices (KAP) survey, awareness campaigns based on survey results, and organized workshops to share and discuss KAP findings with the government.

Finalized the **child labor survey** and disseminated the report.

National Action Plan on Child t Labor (NAPCL), drafted under p the GAP 11 project, was completed and submitted to the Ministry of Economic Affairs for approval.

Developed the **hazardous work decree** and **labor inspection** guidelines and protocols. Organized **seminars** on ILO conventions and **workshops** for school inspectors and community policing officials.

Submitted **minimum age standards** to the Ministry of Economic Affairs for endorsement.

Conducted child labor trainings in 13 municipalities for parents, students, teachers, school inspectors, police, and labor inspectors. S LESSONS LEARNED

Adequate resources and time are required to have impact.

**Strong communication** between municipalities and the capital, Dili, increases effectiveness.

Reaching **rural villages** with child labor awareness-raising activities is critical.

Qualified research consultants are required to produce **high-quality research**.

# PROMISING PRACTICES

The child labor survey and KAP study provided clear evidence, recommendations, and actions.

The **General Inspector of Work's support** was key to project achievements.



Due to the **COVID-19** pandemic, some activities were rescheduled or delayed.

The government has not yet approved key policies, including the NAPCL, hazardous occupations decree, labor inspection protocol, and minimum age standards.

National elections caused inefficiencies because it was very difficult to engage government officials in dialogue and approval processes, and once the new government was formed project conversations had to be restarted.

**Overall, more resources** and a **longer implementation period** were needed for the project.

There was also a **lack of resources** to continue the municipality-level training and raise awareness in all target villages.

Collaboration with employers and trade unions was less than expected.

#### **TRAINING OPINION SURVEY RESULTS**



100% of respondents felt that the trainings were either relevant or highly relevant

**53%** of respondents often used new knowledge and skills in their work **94%** of respondents thought the training was highly effective in improving their capacity to combat child labor



For more information contact NORC at the University of Chicago:

Ridhi Sahai | <u>sahai-ridhi@norc.org</u>

Kareem Kysia | <u>kysia-kareem@norc.org</u>

#### Created by:

NORC at the University of Chicago



For: U.S. Department of Labor

