

In 2015, Ukraine made a minimal advancement in efforts to eliminate the worst forms of child labor. Despite new initiatives to address child labor, Ukraine is receiving this assessment because it continued to implement a law that delayed advancement in eliminating the worst forms of child labor. Ukraine enacted legislation in 2014 that required the State Labor Service to request approval from the Cabinet of Ministers before conducting any inspection not related to a criminal investigation. This bureaucratic restriction effectively imposed a moratorium on inspections during the reporting period. Otherwise, the Government made efforts by providing training to a significant number of law enforcement personnel on the application of laws against child trafficking, adopting a new State Program for Countering Human Trafficking, and developing a comprehensive curriculum on human trafficking prevention for use in schools. Children in Ukraine are engaged in child labor, including in street work and in the worst forms of child labor, including in pornography. The legal framework lacks prohibitions on possessing child pornography or benefitting from its proceeds, and the age of consent for sexual relationships is not clearly defined, which puts children at risk of prosecution in cases of commercial sexual exploitation. In addition, national policies related to child labor lack sufficient funding for effective implementation. Ukraine's armed conflict with Russian-backed separatists in the east of the country continued, which may have impacted the Government's ability to address the worst forms of child labor.



I. PREVALENCE AND SECTORAL DISTRIBUTION OF CHILD LABOR

Children in Ukraine are engaged in child labor, including in street work.(1-3) Children are also engaged in the worst forms of child labor in commercial sexual exploitation, including pornography.(1, 3-5) Table 1 provides key indicators on children's work and education in Ukraine.

Table 1. Statistics on Children's Work and Education

Children	Age	Percent
Working (% and population)	5-14 yrs.	4.4 (182,714)
Attending School (%)	5-14 yrs.	96.5
Combining Work and School (%)	7-14 yrs.	5.0
Primary Completion Rate (%)		110.4

Source for primary completion rate: Data from 2014, published by UNESCO Institute for Statistics, 2015.(6)

Source for all other data: Understanding Children's Work Project's analysis of statistics from Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey 4, 2012.(7)

Based on a review of available information, Table 2 provides an overview of children's work by sector and activity.

Table 2. Overview of Children's Work by Sector and Activity

Sector/Industry	Activity
Agriculture	Farming, activities unknown (1-3)
Industry	Construction,* activities unknown (1, 2, 8) Mining,† including loading, transporting, and sorting of coal (5, 9, 10)
Services	Street work,* including distributing advertising leaflets,* washing cars,* sales activities in kiosks,* and begging* (1-3)
Categorical Worst Forms of Child Labor‡	Use in the production of pornography (1, 3-5) Commercial sexual exploitation sometimes as a result of human trafficking (2, 3, 8, 11, 12) Use in armed conflict by non-state armed groups (13-17)

Ukraine

MINIMAL ADVANCEMENT – EFFORTS MADE BUT CONTINUED LAW THAT DELAYED ADVANCEMENT

Table 2. Overview of Children’s Work by Sector and Activity (cont)

Sector/Industry	Activity
Categorical Worst Forms of Child Labor‡	Forced begging sometimes as a result of human trafficking* (2, 4, 8, 12, 18)

* Evidence of this activity is limited and/or the extent of the problem is unknown.

† Determined by national law or regulation as hazardous and, as such, relevant to Article 3(d) of ILO C. 182.

‡ Child labor understood as the worst forms of child labor *per se* under Article 3(a)–(c) of ILO C. 182.

In 2015, Ukraine’s armed conflict with Russian-backed separatists in the east of the country continued, which may have impacted the Government’s ability to address the worst forms of child labor.(13, 19) The conflict in eastern Ukraine had created an estimated 1.4 million Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs), including more than 170,000 children.(20) The inability of many IDP families to access adequate shelter and available social benefits puts children at increased risk of exploitation in the worst forms of child labor, including human trafficking.(21) The Ministry of Social Policy (MSP) noted an increased vulnerability to both domestic and international human trafficking among the IDP community, and there have been reports of kidnapping of girls from conflict-affected areas for commercial sexual exploitation and labor exploitation.(8, 18) In addition, authorities have, in some cases, refused to grant Roma IDPs the same level of assistance as other IDPs, putting Roma children at an even greater risk of exploitation.(22) An estimated 10,000 Roma people have been displaced by the conflict.(23)

During the reporting period, a variety of sources, including the OSCE Special Monitoring Mission in Ukraine, reported that children as young as age 15 continued to take part in active combat as part of Russian-backed militant groups.(13, 14, 16, 17, 24) Reports indicate that children ages 15 to 17 were actively recruited to participate in militarized youth groups that teach children to carry and use weapons. Children who excel in this training are encouraged to form their own reconnaissance and sabotage groups and begin to fight.(25) A Ukrainian government official reported that one children’s battalion associated with this training program, the St. George the Victor Battalion, may include children as young as 12 years.(16, 25, 26) The recruitment of children by militant groups took place both on territory not under the control of the central Government and in areas where the Government was unable to enforce national prohibitions against the use of children in armed conflict.(13) Russian-backed militants also continued to use children as informants and human shields during the reporting period.(13)

Children from Ukraine are trafficked both transnationally and domestically for commercial sexual exploitation and forced begging.(12, 18) Homeless, orphaned, and poor children, especially those living in state-run institutions, are at high risk of being trafficked and are targeted by recruiters for child pornography.(3, 11, 12) Commercial sexual exploitation of children, including for pornography, remains a serious problem in Ukraine.(2, 5)

Although Ukraine’s Constitution and Law on General Secondary Education guarantee free universal education, a reduction of educational facilities associated with the decreasing population of school-age children may limit access to education for children living in rural areas, for Roma children, and for children with disabilities.(5) Due to discrimination, Roma children are also sometimes denied access to education, placed in segregated schools exclusively for Roma children, or erroneously placed in special education schools.(2, 27, 28)

II. LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOR

Ukraine has ratified all key international conventions concerning child labor (Table 3).

Table 3. Ratification of International Conventions on Child Labor



Convention	Ratification
 ILO C. 138, Minimum Age	✓
ILO C. 182, Worst Forms of Child Labor	✓
 UN CRC	✓
UN CRC Optional Protocol on Armed Conflict	✓
UN CRC Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography	✓

Table 3. Ratification of International Conventions on Child Labor (cont)

Convention	Ratification
 Palermo Protocol on Trafficking in Persons	✓

The Government has established laws and regulations related to child labor, including its worst forms (Table 4).

Table 4. Laws and Regulations Related to Child Labor

Standard	Yes/No	Age	Related Legislation
Minimum Age for Work	Yes	16	Article 188 of the Labor Code; Article 150 of the Criminal Code; Article 21 of the Law on the Protection of Childhood (1, 29-31)
Minimum Age for Hazardous Work	Yes	18	Article 190 of the Labor Code; Article 21 of the Law on the Protection of Childhood (30, 31)
Prohibition of Hazardous Occupations or Activities for Children	Yes		Order No. 46 on the approval of the list of heavy work and work with dangerous and harmful working conditions, in which the employment of minors is prohibited; Article 150-1 of the Criminal Code (8, 9, 29)
Prohibition of Forced Labor	Yes		Article 43 of the Constitution of Ukraine; Article 1 of the Law on Employment; Articles 149, 172, and 173 of the Criminal Code (29, 32, 33)
Prohibition of Child Trafficking	Yes		Article 149 of the Criminal Code (29)
Prohibition of Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children	Yes		Articles 301–303 of the Criminal Code; Articles 10 and 21 of the Law on the Protection of Childhood; the Law on Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of Ukraine on Combating the Distribution of Child Pornography; Articles 1, 6, and 7 of the Law on the Protection of Public Morality (29, 31, 34, 35)
Prohibition of Using Children in Illicit Activities	Yes		Article 304 of the Criminal Code; Articles 10 and 21 of the Law on the Protection of Childhood (29, 31)
Minimum Age for Compulsory Military Recruitment	Yes	18	Article 15 of the Law on Military Duty and Military Service; Decree No. 447 On Measures to Improve the Defense Capabilities of the State (36, 37)
Minimum Age for Voluntary Military Service	Yes	18	Article 15 of the Law on Military Duty and Military Service (37)
Compulsory Education Age	Yes	17‡	Articles 12 and 20 of the Law on General Secondary Education (38)
Free Public Education	Yes		Article 53 of the Constitution of Ukraine; Article 2 of the Law on General Secondary Education (32, 38)

‡ Age calculated based on available information. (38)

In Ukraine, the minimum age for work is 16. However, the Labor Code allows children to be employed at age 15 with parental consent. In secondary or vocational schools, students may perform light work at age 14 with parental consent, provided that the work does not interfere with their education and is not harmful to their health.(30) Research found that children in vocational training programs for hazardous occupations are permitted to perform hazardous work for less than 4 hours a day, beginning at age 14, as long as occupational health and safety standards are met.(1, 39) Moreover, the CEACR noted that the minimum age for such work is 2 years below the international minimum age of 16 for entering hazardous vocational training.(39)

The Law on General Secondary Education states that children should begin school at age 6 and continue for 11 years of compulsory education. As a result, most children are 17 when they complete compulsory education.(38)

Existing criminal laws in Ukraine continue to have gaps in fully protecting children from the worst forms of child labor. While the Criminal Code prohibits commercial exploitation of children, it does not specifically define an age of consent for sexual relations, which has contributed to the prosecution of children ages 16 and 17 for the crime of prostitution.(1) In addition, there is no law that prohibits the possession of child pornography or benefitting from its proceeds.(1)

III. ENFORCEMENT OF LAWS ON THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOR

The Government has established institutional mechanisms for the enforcement of laws and regulations on child labor, including its worst forms (Table 5).

Ukraine

MINIMAL ADVANCEMENT – EFFORTS MADE BUT CONTINUED LAW THAT DELAYED ADVANCEMENT

Table 5. Agencies Responsible for Child Labor Law Enforcement

Organization/Agency	Role
State Labor Service (SLS)* within the Ministry of Social Policy (MSP)	Enforce labor laws, including laws on child labor, by conducting inspections.(13)
Department on Adoption and Children's Rights Protection within the MSP	Identify children involved in the worst forms of child labor, most of whom are in the informal sector.(1, 2)
Criminal Police for Children's Affairs	Identify and investigate the involvement of children in the worst forms of child labor.(1, 2) Refer children determined to be in need of assistance during criminal investigations to social services offered by the MSP.(40) Transferred from the Ministry of Internal Affairs to the Juvenile Prevention Division in the Department of Preventive Activity of the newly formed National Police during 2015.(41)
Criminal Juvenile Police	Address crimes committed by minors and against minors.(1) Transferred from the Ministry of Internal Affairs to the Department of Preventive Activity within the newly-formed National Police during 2015.(41)
Department for Combating Crimes Related to Human Trafficking	Enforce laws against child trafficking. Transferred from the Ministry of Internal Affairs to the newly-formed National Police during 2015.(18)
National Police*	Enforce criminal laws against the worst forms of child labor, including child trafficking.(13)
State Migration Service	Assist refugees and migrants in need in the country, including victims of human trafficking.(1, 40)
State Border Guards Services	Protect the country's borders and identify cases of human trafficking.(40)
Office of the Ombudsman for Children's Rights	Monitor protection of the rights of children and fulfillment of international obligations to protect children's rights, including preventing child labor. Coordinate the development of laws on child protection.(42) Inform the public of children's rights.(42)
National Referral Mechanism	Identify victims of human trafficking, including children, and refer victims to appropriate government agencies for assistance and the provision of services. Led by the MSP.(8)

* Agency responsible for child labor enforcement was created during the reporting period.

In February 2015, the State Labor Inspectorate and the State Service of Mining Supervision and Industrial Safety were combined into one agency, the State Labor Service (SLS).(43, 44) This change came as part of a government-wide initiative to improve efficiency among executive agencies, including those responsible for inspection. The SLS retains the full legal mandates of the State Labor Inspectorate, including enforcement of child labor laws.(43, 44)

During the reporting period, the Government began enacting a program to reform criminal law enforcement.(13, 45) As part of this program, the Government established a new police force in July 2015.(45) A source reported that laws regulating crimes against children continued to be enforced after July, and that the structure of the new police force will be subject to continued reform in 2016.(13)

Labor Law Enforcement

In 2015, labor law enforcement agencies in Ukraine took actions to combat child labor, including its worst forms (Table 6).

Table 6. Labor Law Enforcement Efforts Related to Child Labor

Overview of Labor Law Enforcement	2014	2015
Labor Inspectorate Funding	Unknown	Unknown
Number of Labor Inspectors	616 (13, 41)	320 (13)
Inspectorate Authorized to Assess Penalties	Yes (46)	Yes (3)
Training for Labor Inspectors		
■ Initial Training for New Employees	Yes (46)	Yes (13)
■ Training on New Laws Related to Child Labor	N/A	N/A
■ Refresher Courses Provided	No (13)	No (13)
Number of Labor Inspections	5,038 (46)	22 (13)
■ Number Conducted at Worksite	5,038 (46)	22 (13)
■ Number Conducted by Desk Reviews	0 (46)	0 (13)
Number of Child Labor Violations Found	202 (46)	2 (13)

Table 6. Labor Law Enforcement Efforts Related to Child Labor (cont)

Overview of Labor Law Enforcement	2014	2015
Number of Child Labor Violations for Which Penalties Were Imposed	197 (46)	0 (13)
■ Number of Penalties Imposed That Were Collected	Unknown	N/A
Routine Inspections Conducted	Yes (46)	Yes (13)
■ Routine Inspections Targeted	Unknown	No (13)
Unannounced Inspections Permitted	No (46)	No (13)
Unannounced Inspections Conducted	No (46)	No (13)
Complaint Mechanism Exists	Yes (46)	Yes (13)
Reciprocal Referral Mechanism Exists Between Labor Authorities and Social Services	Yes (46)	Yes (13)

Although the budget for the SLS is unknown, a source reported that funding levels were inadequate. Significant cuts to the SLS's budget resulted in involuntary furlough days for inspectors, some of whom worked as little as one week per month during the reporting period, leading to an increase in resignations and a significant decrease in the number of labor inspectors.(13) The SLS reported that the number of labor inspectors was insufficient to adequately enforce child labor laws. Insufficient funding for supplies, such as vehicles and fuel, also negatively impacted labor inspection.(13) According to the ILO's recommendation of one inspector for every 20,000 workers in transitioning economies, Ukraine should employ roughly 870 labor inspectors in order to adequately enforce labor laws throughout the country.(47-49)

Two laws adopted in December 2014 also significantly restricted the ability of the SLS to carry out inspections during the reporting period.(13) During the first six months of 2015, the SLS and most other regulatory agencies were required to request approval from the Cabinet of Ministers before conducting any inspection not connected to a criminal investigation.(13, 50, 51) Regulatory agencies were also required to seek approval from the Cabinet of Ministers to conduct an inspection of any business with an annual income less than \$750,000 throughout the reporting period. The Government estimates that about 80 percent of businesses are covered under this provision, which will remain in force through the end of 2016.(51, 52) Due to these substantial bureaucratic barriers, inspections nearly ceased in 2015.(13)

No fines were imposed for the use of child labor during the reporting period; however, the SLS reported that fines established for labor infractions, which range from \$35 to \$115, are too low to serve as effective deterrents.(1, 13, 46)

Criminal Law Enforcement

In 2015, criminal law enforcement agencies in Ukraine took actions to combat the worst forms of child labor (Table 7).

Table 7. Criminal Law Enforcement Efforts Related to the Worst Forms of Child Labor

Overview of Criminal Law Enforcement	2014	2015
Training for Investigators		
■ Initial Training for New Employees	Unknown	Yes (13)
■ Training on New Laws Related to the Worst Forms of Child Labor	N/A	Yes (13)
■ Refresher Courses Provided	Yes (46)	Yes (13)
Number of Investigations	Unknown	Unknown (13)
Number of Violations Found	15 (8, 46)	Unknown (13)
Number of Prosecutions Initiated	Unknown (46)	Unknown (18)
Number of Convictions	Unknown (46)	Unknown (18)
Reciprocal Referral Mechanism Exists Between Criminal Authorities and Social Services	Yes (46)	Yes (3)

During the reporting period, the IOM trained 135 police officers, investigators, and social workers on combating child trafficking and victim referral, in cooperation with the Ministry of Internal Affairs (MOI) and the MSP.(13) In cooperation with the MOI and the Prosecutor General's Office, the IOM also trained an additional 196 law enforcement personnel, including prosecutors and investigators on human trafficking.(13)

Ukraine

MINIMAL ADVANCEMENT – EFFORTS MADE BUT CONTINUED LAW THAT DELAYED ADVANCEMENT

In the past, concerns have been raised that the training of judges was not adequately sensitive to the situation of child trafficking victims who may have been used to commit crimes while being trafficked.(1) In 2015, 101 judges received training on the application of current legislation in court hearings on trafficking-related cases, including procedures for victim and witness protection during trial, application of current child labor laws, and understanding the vulnerability of victims.(13, 41) However, these trainings may have been insufficient to address this concern on a systemic level.

Children who are discovered to be in dangerous situations during the course of criminal investigations are referred to the MSP system of Shelters and Centers for Socio-Psychological Rehabilitation of Children.(1) Although the National Referral Mechanism (NRM) for victims of trafficking continued to operate, the MSP lacked sufficient authority and financial resources to establish and run the NRM efficiently.(8)

During 2015, the National Police identified six child trafficking victims.(13) Data on child trafficking and other crimes related to labor exploitation of children are not disaggregated from overall law enforcement statistics; therefore, full data on the number of investigations, prosecutions, and convictions were unavailable.(11)

IV. COORDINATION OF GOVERNMENT EFFORTS ON THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOR

The Government has established mechanisms to coordinate its efforts to address child labor, including its worst forms (Table 8).

Table 8. Mechanisms to Coordinate Government Efforts on Child Labor

Coordinating Body	Role & Description
Ministry of Social Policy (MSP)	Lead the Government's efforts to combat child labor and human trafficking, including by drafting legislation and government regulations on these issues.(1, 11)
Interagency Council on Family, Gender Equality, Demographic Development, Prevention of Violence in the Family, and Counter-Trafficking Issues	Coordinate efforts to address the worst forms of child labor, including the trafficking of children. Chaired by the MSP. Members include representatives from the ministries of Justice, Education, Security, Health, and Foreign Affairs, and from international and local NGOs.(1, 53)
Interagency Working Group to Protect the Rights of Civilians, Including Women and Children, During the Anti-Terrorist Operation in the Eastern Regions of Ukraine	Protect Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) and other civilians from the negative consequences of the ongoing military operations in Ukraine, including the increased rates of domestic and transnational human trafficking. Established by the MSP, members include representatives from the Secretariat of the Verkhovna Rada Commissioner for Human Rights, the Authorized Representative of the President of Ukraine for Children's Rights, and other government agencies and NGOs.(21) The group met four times in 2015. Accomplishments include finalizing the new State Program for Countering Human Trafficking and conducting a review of the application process for victim status.(18)

V. GOVERNMENT POLICIES ON THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOR

The Government of Ukraine has established policies related to child labor, including its worst forms (Table 9).

Table 9. Policies Related to Child Labor

Policy	Description
National Action Plan (NAP) to Implement the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (2010–2016)	Aims to protect children, including from labor exploitation, through raising awareness, rehabilitating victims found in the worst forms of child labor, providing access to education, and creating a child labor monitoring system.(1, 40, 54)
State Program for Countering Human Trafficking (2016–2020)†	Guides the work of the National Coordinator on Combating Human Trafficking and contains specific actions and timetables for preventing, protecting, and prosecuting trafficking crimes.(18)
USAID Country Development Cooperation Strategy (2012–2016)	Aims to support the development of democratic practices, economic growth and development, and increased integration into European structures. Includes a special objective on countering trafficking in persons that involves piloting a National Referral Mechanism (NRM) for victims of human trafficking and improving methods for rehabilitation and reintegration of victims, including children.(55)

† Policy was approved during the reporting period.

A lack of sufficient funding hampers the ability of the ministries to implement actions called for under the National Action Plan to Implement the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the State Program for Countering Human Trafficking.(1, 8)

VI. SOCIAL PROGRAMS TO ADDRESS CHILD LABOR

In 2015, the Government of Ukraine funded and participated in programs that include the goal of eliminating or preventing child labor, including its worst forms (Table 10).

Table 10. Social Programs to Address Child Labor

Program	Description
Global Action Program on Child Labor Issues Project	USDOL-funded project implemented by the ILO in approximately 40 countries to support the priorities of the Roadmap for Achieving the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labor by 2016 established by the Hague Global Child Labor Conference in 2010. Aims to improve the evidence base on child labor and forced labor through data collection and research in Ukraine.(56) In 2015, the project assisted the State Statistical Service in analyzing data and preparing a draft report based on the National Child Labor Survey conducted in 2014. The project also conducted a rapid assessment of street children during the reporting period.(56)
Shelters and Centers for Socio-Psychological Rehabilitation of Children†	MSP-operated program to provide protection in 18 short-term shelters and 75 long-term rehabilitation centers for children in need, including street children. Short-term shelters provide accommodation for up to 90 days and rehabilitation centers offer accommodation for up to 12 months.(1, 8, 11, 18, 21) The rehabilitation centers also provide regular social, medical, psychological, and other types of services for non-residents.(8, 18)
Centers for Social Services for Family, Youth, and Children†	Government-run program to provide services for victims of human trafficking, among other populations in need. As of 2015, 656 shelters were available to assess victims' needs and draft rehabilitation plans.(1, 18)
Anti-Trafficking Awareness-Raising Programs*†	In 2015, the Ministry of Education and Science developed a comprehensive human trafficking prevention curriculum for use in schools, which was made available to educators during the reporting period. Secondary and vocational school students also attended trainings on human trafficking prevention, which were reportedly also made part of the required school curriculum during the reporting period.(18)
Multiplication of the Anti-Trafficking National Referral Mechanism in Ukraine†	Joint program by the MSP and the OSCE to train officials in several regions of Ukraine to identify and provide services to trafficking victims. Involves collaborative work among local agencies and non-governmental partners.(11)
Countering Trafficking in Persons Project (2004–2018)	USAID-funded project implemented by the IOM to reduce trafficking in persons by building the capacity of Ukrainian institutions to address the problem by strengthening the NRM and increasing government funding for counter-trafficking efforts.(57)
Free School Lunches†	Government-sponsored program that provides free school lunches to certain categories of children, including those from families with many children, families of Chernobyl victims, low-income families, and families in some rural areas.(58)
Decent Work Country Program (2012–2015)	Government and ILO 3-year joint program that included a social protection component to improve the social status of migrant workers, develop and implement a national occupational safety and health program, and strengthen the labor inspection system.(59)
Strengthening and Protecting Children's Rights in Ukraine (2013–2015)	\$670,000 project funded by the Government of Norway and implemented by the Council of Europe in partnership with the Government of Ukraine. Aimed to strengthen the protection of human rights in Ukraine through the prevention of violence against children, including commercial sexual exploitation.(60, 61)
UNICEF Country Program (2012–2016)	Aims to decrease social exclusion and disparities affecting children and ensure that socially excluded children benefit from quality health care and social services.(62)

* Program was launched during the reporting period.

† Program is funded by the Government of Ukraine.

Ukraine has a variety of service providers for victims of human trafficking; however, the MSP must confer the official status of “victim of trafficking” on child trafficking victims in order for them to access available government services.(8, 11, 18) Research found delays in this practice often result from the insufficient provision of documentation to the MSP by local administrations, although the trafficking victim status application rejection rate significantly decreased in 2015.(8, 11, 18)

During the reporting period, the MSP and the IOM conducted a seminar for heads of Child Welfare Services on the responsibilities of their agencies in the identification and referral of child trafficking victims who are placed in Centers for Psycho-Social Rehabilitation of Children and other state institutions. The goal of this training was to build the capacity of these agencies to proactively identify and refer child trafficking victims.(18)

Although the MSP provides services for children in shelters and social-psychological rehabilitation centers, the current availability of shelters and trained personnel is insufficient to fully address the extent of the child labor problem.(63) The Centers for Social

Ukraine

MINIMAL ADVANCEMENT – EFFORTS MADE BUT CONTINUED LAW THAT DELAYED ADVANCEMENT

Services for Family, Youth, and Children have historically experienced a large turnover of staff due to an excessive workload and low pay.⁽⁶⁴⁾ In addition, the centers remain understaffed after budget cuts enacted in 2014 resulted in the layoff of 12,000 social workers.⁽⁶⁵⁾ This restricted the centers in their ability to efficiently address the main needs of trafficking victims in 2015. Likewise, high turnover in the regions, where local agencies are responsible for identifying trafficking victims under the NRM, has hampered the provision of services to victims.⁽¹¹⁾

VII. SUGGESTED GOVERNMENT ACTIONS TO ELIMINATE THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOR

Based on the reporting above, suggested actions are identified that would advance the elimination of child labor, including its worst forms, in Ukraine (Table 11).

Table 11. Suggested Government Actions to Eliminate Child Labor, Including its Worst Forms

Area	Suggested Action	Year(s) Suggested
Legal Framework	Ensure that laws prohibit all children under age 16 from working in hazardous occupations during vocational training.	2011 – 2015
	Ensure that laws treat children ages 16 and 17 as victims of commercial sexual exploitation rather than as offenders.	2012 – 2015
	Ensure that laws prohibit possessing child pornography and benefitting from its proceeds.	2012 – 2015
Enforcement	Increase the budget of the SLS, in order to increase the number of inspectors, and make information on the budget publicly available.	2011 – 2015
	Provide labor inspectors with appropriate training, including by institutionalizing periodic refresher training for all inspectors, and provide them with the resources required to carry out inspections, such as adequate transportation and fuel.	2011 – 2015
	Address legal provisions that have created obstacles to conducting labor inspections. Strengthen the Labor Inspectorate by initiating targeted inspections based on analysis of data related to risk-prone sectors and patterns of serious incidents, and ensure that inspectors have sufficient ability to conduct both complaint-based and targeted inspections as needed, including unannounced inspections.	2014 – 2015
	Ensure that fines are imposed for violations of child labor laws, and that they are sufficient to effectively deter employers from violating child labor laws.	2013 – 2015
	Ensure that judges treat children who are victims of commercial sexual exploitation and other worst forms of child labor as victims and not as offenders.	2013 – 2015
	Ensure that the MSP has the necessary funding and authority to effectively establish and operate the National Referral Mechanism.	2014 – 2015
	Track and make data on the number of investigations, prosecutions, convictions, and implemented penalties related to violations of all criminal laws on the worst forms of child labor publicly available.	2014 – 2015
	Provide sufficient funds to implement the National Program for Combatting Trafficking and the NAP, including implementing the mandated child labor monitoring system.	2010 – 2015
Government Policies	Ensure that all IDPs are aware of the resources available to them and that internally displaced children are able to access adequate shelter and receive available social benefits, regardless of their ethnicity.	2014 – 2015
Social Programs	Assess children's access to rural schools and develop programs to facilitate access to education for Roma children, disabled children, and children in rural areas.	2010 – 2015
	Ensure that all children who are victims of human trafficking are able to access government services available for victims. Ensure that all reasonable efforts are made to obtain needed documentation when considering whether to grant trafficking victim status to children.	2013 – 2015
	Increase the number of shelters and socio-psychological rehabilitation centers for children and the number of trained personnel staffing these shelters, in order to fully meet the demand for their services. Provide sufficient funding to return the number of social workers to the level prior to budget cuts.	2013 – 2015
	Take steps to reduce turnover in the Centers for Social Services for Family, Youth, and Children and in local agencies that are part of the National Referral Mechanism to ensure that victims of human trafficking are provided with the services they require.	2012 – 2015

REFERENCES

- U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, January 17, 2014.*
- U.S. Department of State. “Ukraine,” in *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices- 2013*. Washington, DC; February 27, 2014; <http://www.state.gov/j/drl/rls/hrrpt/humanrightsreport/index.htm#wrapper>.
- Disability Rights International. *No Way Home: The Exploitation and Abuse of Children in Ukraine’s Orphanages*. Washington, DC; 2015. <http://www.driadvocacy.org/wp-content/uploads/No-Way-Home-final2.pdf>.
- ILO Committee of Experts. *Individual Observation concerning Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) Ukraine (ratification: 2000) Published: 2012*; accessed June 23, 2014; <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/>
- UN Committee on the Rights of the Child. *Consideration of Reports Submitted by States Parties Under Article 44 of the Convention: Concluding Observations: Ukraine*. Geneva; April 21, 2011. Report No. CRC/C/UKR/CO/3-4. <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dcb87f22.html>
- UNESCO Institute for Statistics. *Gross intake ratio to the last grade of primary. Total*. [accessed December 16, 2015]; <http://data.uis.unesco.org/>. Data provided is the gross intake ratio to the last grade of primary school. This measure is a proxy measure for primary completion. This ratio is the total number of new entrants in the last grade of primary education, regardless of age, expressed as a percentage of the population at the theoretical entrance age to the last grade of primary. A high ratio indicates a high degree of current primary education completion. Because the calculation includes all new entrants to last grade (regardless of age), the ratio can exceed 100 percent, due to over-aged and under-aged children who enter primary school late/early and/or repeat grades. For more information, please see the “Children’s Work and Education Statistics: Sources and Definitions” section of this report.
- UCW. *Analysis of Child Economic Activity and School Attendance Statistics from National Household or Child Labor Surveys*. Original data from Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey 4, 2012 Analysis received December 18, 2015. Reliable statistical data on the worst forms of child labor are especially difficult to collect given the often hidden or illegal nature of the worst forms. As a result, statistics on children’s work in general are reported in this chart, which may or may not include the worst forms of child labor. For more information on sources used, the definition of working children and other indicators used in this report, please see the “Children’s Work and Education Statistics: Sources and Definitions” section of this report.
- U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, February 24, 2015.*
- Government of Ukraine. *Approval of the list of heavy work and work with dangerous and harmful working conditions, in which the employment of minors is prohibited*, 46, enacted March 31, 1994. <http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/z0176-94>.
- Ghazi Balkiz. “Inside Ukraine’s Illegal Mines.” *nbcnews.com* [online] May 3, 2014 [cited 2015]; <http://www.nbcnews.com/storyline/ukraine-crisis/inside-ukraines-illegal-mines-n95786>.
- U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, March 12, 2014.*
- U.S. Department of State. “Ukraine,” in *Trafficking in Persons Report- 2015*. Washington, DC; July 27, 2015; <http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/countries/2015/243556.htm>.
- U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, February 1, 2016.*
- Joachim Bartz, and Arndt Ginzler. “War Crimes in the Ukraine Conflict? Child Soldiers on the Front,” *Germany: Frontal 21*; November 10, 2015; television broadcast; <http://www.zdf.de/ZDF/zdfportal/blob/40934000/1/data.pdf>.
- Mark Krutov. “17 year old militant, to whom Putin gave a watch and an iPad, is asking for “Radio Svoboda [online] October 30, 2015 [cited <http://www.svoboda.org/articleprintview/27335711.html>].
- U.S. Department of State official. E-mail communication to USDOL official. February 26, 2016.
- OSCE Special Monitoring Mission to Ukraine. *Latest from OSCE Special Monitoring Mission (SMM) to Ukraine based on information received as of 19:30 (Kyiv time), 3 June 2015*. Kyiv; June 4, 2015. <http://www.osce.org/ukrainesmm/160931>.
- U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, March 3, 2016.*
- Shaun Walker. “As Russia enters war in Syria, conflict in Ukraine begins to wind down.” *The Guardian*, London, October 1, 2015. <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/oct/01/as-russia-enters-war-in-syria-conflict-in-ukraine-begins-to-wind-down>.
- UNHCR. *Ukraine Situation: UNHCR Operational Update*. Geneva; July 15, 2015. <http://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/UNHCR%20UKRAINE%20Operational%20update%2015JUL15.pdf>.
- Group of Experts on Action Against Trafficking in Persons. *GRETA Report concerning the implementation of the Council of Europe convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Ukraine*. Strasbourg, Secretariat of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings; September 19, 2014. http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/trafficking/docs/Reports/GRETA_2014_20_FGR_UKR_w_cmnts_en.pdf.
- The Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre. *Time to act: Internal displacement on the rise in Ukraine*. Geneva; October 22, 2014. <http://www.internal-displacement.org/europe-the-caucasus-and-central-asia/ukraine/2014/time-to-act-internal-displacement-on-the-rise-in-ukraine>.
- WHO Europe. *WHO and partners increase focus on Roma population in Ukraine*, WHO, [online] April 23, 2015 [cited May 10, 2016]; <http://www.euro.who.int/en/health-topics/health-determinants/roma-health/news/2015/04/who-and-partners-increase-focus-on-roma-population-in-ukraine>.
- Krutov, M. “17 year old militant, to whom Putin gave a watch and an iPad, is asking for “Radio Svoboda; October 30, 2015; radio broadcast; 2015; <http://www.svoboda.org/articleprintview/27335711.html>.
- Donetsk People’s Republic. “War and the contribution of children.” *dnr.one* [online] January 23, 2016 [cited 2016]; <https://dnr.one/novosti/151vojnauivkladdetej>.
- Oksana Denisova. “What’s happening on the other side?” *Gazeta.zn.ua* [online] January 22, 2016 [cited <http://gazeta.zn.ua/internal/chtonatombereguglavaatcopolozheniianepodkontrolnyhterritoryahdonbassa.html>].
- UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. *Concluding observations on the sixth periodic report of Ukraine*. Geneva; May 23, 2014. <http://health-rights.org/index.php/cop/item/concluding-observations-on-the-sixth-periodic-report-of-ukraine>.
- OSCE, Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights. *Situation Assessment Report on Roma in Ukraine and the Impact of the Current Crisis*. Warsaw. <https://www.osce.org/odihr/124494?download=true>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Criminal Code of Ukraine*, enacted 2001. <http://www.legislationline.org/documents/section/criminal-codes>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Labor Code of Ukraine*, enacted December 10, 1971. <http://www.wipo.int/wipolex/en/details.jsp?id=6186>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on the Protection of Childhood*, enacted April 26, 2001. <http://zakon4.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2402-14/print1415035498920514>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Constitution of Ukraine*, enacted June 28, 1996. <http://www.president.gov.ua/en/content/constitution.html>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on Employment*, No. 803-XII, enacted March 1, 1991. <http://www.brama.com/law/business1/empllaw.txt>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on the Protection of the Public Morality*, enacted November 20, 2003. <http://zakon4.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1296-15/print1415035498920514>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of Ukraine on Combating the Distribution of Child Pornography*, No. 105, enacted January 20, 2010. <http://zakon4.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1819-17/print1415035498920514>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Decree on Measures to Enhance the Defense Capacity of the State*, No. 447, enacted May 1, 2014. <http://zakon4.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/447/2014/print1415035498920514>.
- Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on Military Duty and Military Service*, enacted March 25, 1992. <http://zakon4.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2232-12/print1415035498920514>.

Ukraine

MINIMAL ADVANCEMENT – EFFORTS MADE BUT CONTINUED LAW THAT DELAYED ADVANCEMENT

38. Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on General Secondary Education*, No. 651-XIV, enacted May 13, 1999. <http://osvita.ua/legislation/law/2232/print/>.
39. ILO Committee of Experts. *Observation concerning Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) Ukraine (ratification: 1979) Published: 2014*; accessed October 24, 2014; <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/>.
40. U.S. Embassy- Kyiv official. E-mail communication to USDOL official. May 13, 2014.
41. U.S. Embassy- Kyiv official. E-mail communication to USDOL official. May 9, 2016.
42. Government of Ukraine. *Decree on Regulations on the Ombudsman for Children under the President of Ukraine*, No. 811, enacted August 11, 2011. http://www.president.gov.ua/en/content/up_pr_dyt.html?PrintVersion.
43. Government of Ukraine. *Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine on optimization of central executive bodies*, enacted September 10, 2014. <http://zakon5.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/4422014%D0%BF>.
44. Government of Ukraine. *Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine on approval of the State Labor Service of Ukraine*, enacted September 10, 2014. <http://zakon5.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/962015%D0%BF/print1457036391599749>.
45. Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on the National Police*, enacted July 2, 2015. <http://zakon5.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/580-19/print1457302129145147>.
46. U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, January 14, 2015*.
47. CIA. *The World Factbook*, [online] [cited March 18, 2016]; <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/fields/2095.html#131>. Data provided is the most recent estimate of the country's total labor force. This number is used to calculate a "sufficient number" of labor inspectors based on the country's level of development as determined by the UN.
48. ILO. *Strategies and Practice for Labour Inspection*. Geneva, Committee on Employment and Social Policy; November 2006. <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/relm/gb/docs/gb297/pdf/esp-3.pdf>. Article 10 of ILO Convention No. 81 calls for a "sufficient number" of inspectors to do the work required. As each country assigns different priorities of enforcement to its inspectors, there is no official definition for a "sufficient" number of inspectors. Amongst the factors that need to be taken into account are the number and size of establishments and the total size of the workforce. No single measure is sufficient but in many countries the available data sources are weak. The number of inspectors per worker is currently the only internationally comparable indicator available. In its policy and technical advisory services, the ILO has taken as reasonable benchmarks that the number of labor inspectors in relation to workers should approach: 1/10,000 in industrial market economies; 1/15,000 in industrializing economies; 1/20,000 in transition economies; and 1/40,000 in less developed countries.
49. UN. *World Economic Situation and Prospects 2012 Statistical Annex*. New York; 2012. http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/policy/wesp/wesp_current/2012country_class.pdf. For analytical purposes, the Development Policy and Analysis Division (DPAD) of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs of the United Nations Secretariat (UN/DESA) classifies all countries of the world into one of three broad categories: developed economies, economies in transition, and developing countries. The composition of these groupings is intended to reflect basic economic country conditions. Several countries (in particular the economies in transition) have characteristics that could place them in more than one category; however, for purposes of analysis, the groupings have been made mutually exclusive. The list of the least developed countries is decided upon by the United Nations Economic and Social Council and, ultimately, by the General Assembly, on the basis of recommendations made by the Committee for Development Policy. The basic criteria for inclusion require that certain thresholds be met with regard to per capita GNI, a human assets index and an economic vulnerability index. For the purposes of the Findings on the Worst Forms of Child Labor Report, "developed economies" equate to the ILO's classification of "industrial market economies;" "economies in transition" to "transition economies," "developing countries" to "industrializing economies, and "the least developed countries" equates to "less developed countries." For countries that appear on both "developing countries" and "least developed countries" lists, they will be considered "least developed countries" for the purpose of calculating a "sufficient number" of labor inspectors.
50. Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on amending and rendering invalid some legal acts of Ukraine*, No. 6, enacted December 28, 2014. <http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/76-19/print1457042151023332>.
51. State Regulatory Service. *The Moratorium on Inspections is not Ending*, State Regulatory Service, [online] June 22, 2015 [cited March 4, 2016]; <http://dkrp.gov.ua/info/4463>.
52. Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on On Amendments to the Tax Code of Ukraine and Certain Legislative Acts of Ukraine on tax reform*, enacted December 28, 2014. <http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/71-19/print1457042151023332>.
53. Government of Ukraine. *Resolution on the Interagency Council on Family, Gender Equality, Economic Development, Domestic Violence Prevention, and Combating Human Trafficking*, No. 1087, enacted September 5, 2007. <http://zakon0.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1087-2007-%D0%BF>.
54. Government of Ukraine. *Law of Ukraine on the National Program "National Action Plan to implement the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child" until 2016*. March 5, 2009. <http://zakon4.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1065-17>.
55. USAID. *Ukraine Country Development Cooperation Strategy 2012-2016*. Washington, DC. http://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1863/USAID_Ukraine_CDSCS_2012-2016.pdf.
56. ILO-IPEC. *Global Action Program on Child Labor Issues*. Technical Progress Report. Geneva; November 5, 2015.
57. USAID. *Countering Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Project: International Organization for Migration (July 20, 2004 – January 1, 2018)*. USAID, [online] April 28, 2014 [cited April 28, 2014]; <http://www.usaid.gov/where-we-work/europe-and-urasia/ukraine/democracy-human-rights-and-governance>
58. U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, January 12, 2011*.
59. ILO Budapest. *ILO Budapest Newsletter* Budapest; June 12, 2012. http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---europe/---ro-geneva/---sro-budapest/documents/publication/wcms_192675.pdf.
60. *Strengthening and Protecting Children's Rights in Ukraine*, Council of Europe, [online] [cited March 17, 2015]; <http://www.coe.int/en/web/kyiv/45>.
61. Council of Europe. *Council of Europe project "Strengthening and protecting children rights in Ukraine" Calendar of Activities (2014)*; September 1, 2014. <https://rm.coe.int/CoERMPublicCommonSearchServices/DisplayDCTMContent?documentId=09000016800930df>.
62. UNICEF. *Country programme document 2012-2016*; 2011. http://www.unicef.org/about/execboard/files/Ukraine_final_approved_2012-2016_20_Oct_2011.pdf.
63. U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, January 30, 2013*.
64. U.S. Embassy- Kyiv. *reporting, February 21, 2013*.
65. U.S. Embassy- Kyiv official. E-mail communication to USDOL official. February 20, 2015.