Assessment Report

Task 5.1.5: Assess Efforts of Governments, Industry, and Workers' Organizations to Address Child Labor and Forced Labor in the Cocoa Sectors in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire

Mei Zegers

United States Department of Labor

Bureau of International Labor Affairs

Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking

Contract Number: 1605DC-18-A-0036

Order Number: 1605C2-23-F-00006

Research on Efforts to Eliminate Child Labor and Forced Labor in the Cocoa Sector in High-Risk Countries

JUNE 2024



Contents

Acro	nyms and	d oth	er Abbreviations		iv	
Execu	utive Sun	nmar	у		1	
1.	Introdu	ıctior	1		1	
2.	Methodology				2	
3.		_		or: Changes in Approaches from 2019 to 2023, ices	10	
4.	Update 4.1			Tain Causes of Child and Forced Labormpowerment		
	4.2	Leg	al and Policy Framew	orks, Governance, and Data Management and Use	21	
	4.2	2.1	Legal and Regulator	y Frameworks	21	
	4.2	2.2	Policy Frameworks	and Governance	22	
	4.2	2.3	Data Collection and	Management	24	
	4.3	Ad۱	ocacy, Awareness Ra	aising, and Behavior Change Communications	25	
	4.4 FLMI		- -	diation, Traceability, and Certification Systems and (CLN		
	4.4	4.1	Landscape Approac	hes to Include Child-Labor-Free Zones—	28	
	4.4	4.2	Certification and Tra	aceability	31	
	4.5	Ger	neral Education/Voca	tional Skills	31	
	4.6	Imp	proved Technologies,	Occupational Safety, and Health	33	
	4.7	Hea	alth and Other Service	es	33	
	4.8 Marg			erventions Address the Needs of Vulnerable and	33	
5.	, Develo	pmer s Chil	nt Partners (including ld Labor and Forced L	re and Ghana Governments, Industry, International U.S. Government), and Workers' Organizations to abor in the Cocoa Sectors in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire		
	5.2	USI	OOL-ILAB		38	
	5.3	U.S	. Department of Hom	neland Services' Customs and Border Protection	40	
	5.4 of St			r International Development and United States Departm d Combat Trafficking in Persons		
	5.5	Priv	ate-Sector Efforts		42	
	5.6	Inte	International Organizations			

	5.6	.1 The Internat	ional Monetary Fund and World Bank	44
	5.6	.2 European Du	ue Diligence Requirements	46
	5.6	.3 United Natio	ons Agencies and Other International Development Agencies .	48
	5.7	Nongovernmenta	al Organizations	50
	5.8	Civil Society Orga	anizations:	52
	5.9	Workers' Organiz	zations	54
	5.10	Farmer-Based	Organizations	55
	5.11	Child Labor Co	coa Coordinating Group	63
	5.12	Multistakeholo	der Platforms	65
	5.13	Good Practices	o Overview	71
6.	_		ollaboration and Creating Synergies: Human-Centered	78
7.	Conclus	ions and Recomm	endations	79
Appe	ndix A. R	eferences		A-1
Appe	ndix B. Li	st of Interviewees		B-1

Exhibits

Exhibit 1. Thematic Study Dimensions	. 3
Exhibit 2. Framework of Key Dimensions of Reducing Child and/or Forced Labor	. 4
Exhibit 3. Stakeholder Interviews	. 5
Exhibit 4. Criteria to Define Good Practices	. 7
Exhibit 5. Main Areas of Change and Recommendations	13
Exhibit 6. Support That Should Receive Attention to Support and Strengthen Workers' Organizations and Farmer-Based Organizations to Address CL/FL Among Their Members	59
Exhibit 7. List of European Initiatives on Sustainable Cocoa	69
Exhibit 8. Good Practices, According to Research Stakeholders	76
Exhibit 9. Recommendations	81

Acronyms and other Abbreviations

ACCEL Africa Accelerating Action for the Elimination of Child Labour in Supply Chains in

AfCFTA African Continental Free Trade Area

AIR American Institutes for Research

ARSO African Organisation for Standardisation (ORAN—Organisation Africaine

Régionale de Normalisation)

Beyond Chocolate Partnership for a more sustainable Belgian cocoa sector

CACAO Cooperatives Addressing Child Labor Accountability Outcomes

CAP Community Action Plan

CAYAT Coopérative Agricole de Yakasse-Attobrou

CCP Cocoa Communities Project: Towards Child Labor Free Cocoa Growing

Communities in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana through an Integrated Area Based

Approach

CIGCI Côte d'Ivoire-Ghana Cocoa Initiative

CIM Comité interministériel de lutte contre la traite, l'exploitation et le travail des

enfants (CIM; Interministerial Committee in the Fight Against Child Trafficking,

Child Exploitation, and Child Labor)

CISL-Dignité La Confédération Syndicale Internationale Dignité

Child labor and forced labor CL/FL

CLCCG Child Labor Cocoa Coordinating Group

CLEF Child Learning and Education Facility

CLFZ Child labor free zone

CLMRS Child Labour Monitoring and Remediation System

CNS Comité National de Surveillance des Actions de Lutte Contre la Traite,

l'Exploitation et le Travail des Enfants (National Monitoring Committee on

Actions to Combat Trafficking, Exploitation, and Child Labor)

COCOBOD Ghana Cocoa Board

DISCO **Dutch Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa**

ECLIC Eliminating Child Labor in Cocoa

ELAN Early Learning and Nutrition Facility

ΕIJ **European Union**

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization **FBO** Farmer Based Organization

FESATI-CG La Fédération des Syndicats Autonomes de la Côte d'Ivoire

FLIP Forced Labor Indicators Project

FRISCO French Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa **GAWU** General Agricultural Workers Union **GCCP** Ghana Civil-Society Cocoa Platform

GISCO German Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa

GPS **Global Positioning System**

IABA Integrated area-based approach ICI International Cocoa Initiative

ICCO International Cocoa Organization IDH The Sustainable Trade Initiative

Bureau of International Labor Affairs **ILAB**

ILO International Labour Organization

IOM International Organization for Migration (OIM in French)

ISCO Initiatives on Sustainable Cocoa

JICA Japan International Cooperation Agency

KIT Royal Tropical Institute (In Dutch Koninklijk Instituut voor de Tropen) Kuapa Kokoo Cooperative Cocoa Farmers and Marketing Union Limited KKFU

KNUST Kwame Nkrumah University of Science

LEAP Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty Program

MATE MASIE Making Advances to Eliminate Child Labor in More Areas with Sustainable

Integrated Efforts

MOCA Mobilizing Community Action and Promoting Opportunities for Youth in

Ghana's Cocoa-Growing Communities

NGO Nongovernmental organization

Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development OECD

Occupational safety and health OSH

PPP Public-private partnership

Plateforme Ivoirienne pour le Cacao Durable (Côte d'Ivoire Platform for PICD

Sustainable Cocoa)

RESTORE Resilient Ecosystems and Sustainable Transformation of Rural Economies

project

SDG Sustainable Development Goal SOSTECI Système d'Observation et de Suivi du Travail des Enfants en Côte d'Ivoire

SUWCOF Sunyani District Women Cocoa Farmers Union

Swiss Platform for Sustainable Cocoa SWISSCO

TVEST Technical and vocational education and skills training

UGTCI L'Union Générale des Travailleurs de Côte d'Ivoire

UN **United Nations**

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

USAID United States Agency for International Development

USDOL United States Department of Labor

UNATRCI L'Union Nationale des Travailleurs de Côte d'Ivoire

UNSTATS **United Nations Statistics Division**

VSLA Village Savings and Loan Associations

WASH Water, sanitation, and hygiene

WCF World Cocoa Foundation

WIND Work Improvement in Neighbourhood Development

Executive Summary

The United States Department of Labor's Bureau of International Labor Affairs (USDOL-ILAB) has contracted with the American Institutes for Research® (AIR®) to research, identify, and develop indicators of progress and to assess efforts to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sectors of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana.

Based on a participative process, this report covers the analysis of stakeholders' implementation of efforts, with emphasis on the period since 2019. The main research questions focused on (a) the identification of the initiatives and good practices of governments, industry, and workers' and farmer-based organizations (FBOs) to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sectors in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana; (b) identification of the challenges of and the extent to which and workers' organizations and FBOs are actively and meaningfully involved in efforts to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sectors; and (c) a review of the efforts under and outside the Child Labor Cocoa Coordinating Group (CLCCG) to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sector.

The main stakeholders asked to contribute to the research were the governments of Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire; private-sector cocoa representatives; international development agencies; and international and national civil societies, including workers' organizations and FBOs. The specific individuals contacted were selected on the basis of their membership in the CLCCG or as identified in mapping exercises of key cocoa production stakeholders.

This research was based on a systems approach to data gathering, analysis, and interpretation. The approach identifies interrelationships, dependencies, and feedback loops to analyze dynamics, identify patterns, and make informed planning decisions for maximum results. A thorough literature review of 613 documents and websites was conducted for the analysis covered in the report. Interviews were conducted with 79 individuals.

One-day workshops were conducted in May 2023 in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana to discuss the development of a repository of progress indicators. These workshops also provided some information that was useful for the report. Further useful information resulted from email correspondence with representatives of 14 types of stakeholders that particularly focused on issues regarding needed support to strengthen the capacities of workers' organizations and FBOs to address child labor and forced labor. Data analysis was primarily conducted using the qualitative data analysis software Atlas.ti and with Mind Mapping software.

Most research limitations fell into three categories. First, although child labor and forced labor are both considered throughout our research, much more information is available on child labor. There has been increasing attention, as well as strategy development, to address forced labor in cocoa among key stakeholders. However, there have been very few *in-depth* initiatives aimed at addressing this issue in cocoa, aside from examples such as the Forced Labor Indicators Project (FLIP), and a collaboration between the Rainforest Alliance, International Cocoa Initiative and Solidaridad. Given the lack of existing data on forced labor initiatives, it is difficult to cover forced labor in the same depth as child labor. Second, some studies have identified good practices to reduce child labor in cocoa production, but these do not cover the breadth of approaches and initiatives used. Ideally, good practices should be identified through independent studies instead of through self-assessment of implementers. Independent studies may include evaluations of projects, but these are limited in number on this specific subject matter. Third, throughout the report we refer to a broad range of types of strategies and initiatives; although there are some commonalities, there are also major differences that need to be taken into account because they limit comparability.

Main Findings

The research confirmed that there is no one way to approach child labor and forced labor reduction; rather, it is the combination of implemented strategies and practices that will lead to greater success in reducing child labor and forced labor. Since 2019, there have been positive changes in terms of strengthened collaboration, coverage, and (new) directions in the efforts to reduce child and forced labor in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. However, there are still many aspects that need attention to reach higher levels of impact on the reduction of child labor and forced labor.

Currently, the focus on eliminating child labor at a household level has rightly expanded to consider many contextual issues and child well-being overall. This means focus on encompassing the availability of social services—including education and social protection coverage—functioning of workers' organizations and FBOs and their voices, and deforestation and other environmental issues. In addition, the need to ensure that child labor is reduced consistently in communities, and not just among children currently working in cocoa, has gained recognition.

Ctors

¹ Verité (2023), Forced Labor Indicators Project (FLIP) in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. https://verite.org/forced-labor-indicators-project/

² Rainforest Alliance (2021), Project Profile: Tackling Forced Labor and Child Labor in the Ghanaian Cocoa and Gold Mining Sectors, Available from: https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/in-the-field/tackling-forced-labor-and-child-labor-in-ghana-sectors-project/. Rainforest Alliance.

For this reason, broader landscape approaches³, which include many areas of focus in common with rural development initiatives, are increasingly discussed during planning for more effective and impactful results to reduce child labor and forced labor. Landscape approaches consist of multi-stakeholder collaborations that engage stakeholders within a delimited geographic area to attain defined development goals.

Associated with integrated area-based approaches (IABA), the creation of child-labor-free zones (CLFZ) has been tested and is being scaled up to address consistently the child labor challenges in cocoa production areas.

There are many multistakeholder platforms, each with its own history and main orientation/vision to address all these issues. Although there is overlap of many multistakeholder platforms on certain topics, such as advocacy for farmer living incomes, there are varying priorities or areas of emphasis. Multistakeholder platforms are essential to achieving real results on the reduction of child labor and forced labor, but the research findings indicate that streamlining and avoiding redundancies will be more effective and efficient.

Poverty remains the main cause and a fair income for all involved in cocoa production is necessary. However, poverty is not the only cause of child labor and forced labor. In fact, this research reaffirms that addressing only one aspect, such as poverty, will not solve the challenges of child labor and forced labor in the cocoa value chain. A multipronged approach is necessary, using a synergistic collaboration among stakeholders—that is, from the governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana with inputs and support from the private sector to multi- and bilateral donors to national and international technical experts. Notably, the voices of workers' organizations and FBOs are essential to ensuring the appropriateness of measures undertaken, as well as to reaching farmers throughout the cocoa-producing areas.

Poverty reduction means fair pricing of cocoa and real remuneration directly to farmers to improve the socioeconomic situation of their households and reduce dependency on child labor and forced labor. Support for the diversification of incomes to reduce dependency on cocoa is important and especially so to spread risk in case of natural or other disasters. Improved availability and management of savings and credit schemes, and also better access to social protection mechanisms, are other aspects to consider. Improved roads to reduce the cost of transport of production inputs for cocoa and the cocoa beans themselves can also indirectly contribute to greater efficiencies, which should be used to benefit farmers. Further, improving

ES-3 | AIR.ORG

³ IDH (2023), How Landscape Approaches Can Tackle Deforestation and Shape the Future of Sustainable Supply Chains: The Case of the Cocoa Sector. Available from: https://www.idhsustainabletrade.com/news/how-landscape-approaches-can-tackledeforestation-and-shape-the-future-of-sustainable-supply-chains-the-case-of-the-cocoa-sector/#:~:text=Landscape%20approaches%20refer%20to%20multi,sustainability%20performance%20in%20that%20area. ISEAL Alliance (2022), Effective company actions in landscapes and jurisdictions. Guiding Practices. Volume 1.0. London: ISEAL Alliance.

efficiency and safety in cocoa production contributes to increased incomes. Application of methods to reduce accidents and illnesses caused by occupationally unsafe production technologies helps to simultaneously reduce the loss of income from such events.

While awareness of the dangers of child labor has increased in both Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, forced labor remains a subject that is not sufficiently covered. Awareness raising on subjects such as how and where to report child labor and forced labor and available grievance mechanisms for community members is still too limited.

There is still scope for better collection and consolidation of data at local and national levels on child labor and forced labor reduction initiatives and their impact on informing decision making. Data gathering and sharing of data to ensure that lessons learned, implementation challenges identified, and good practices were used to inform future efforts was a challenge repeatedly identified throughout the research. Although the various multistakeholder platforms discuss some of the data, the concrete use of data for planning still needs greater attention, using methodologically appropriate means.

The need to strengthen technical and logistics capacities at a local level to provide services to cocoa communities remains clear. The reduction of dependence on nonstate actors (international development agencies including foundations, NGOs) instead of on local government to provide services is necessary for long term sustainability. For this purpose, increased funding of local government services is key to enabling direct work with and sustainably of communities on child labor and forced labor reduction. Together with technical strengthening and support for logistics, including transport, impact of child labor and forced labor reduction initiatives will be exponentially increased, particularly if accompanied by improved infrastructure, such as schools, health provision structures, and improved roads.

There are increased efforts to involve and strengthen workers' organizations and FBOs, but their potential to contribute to addressing child labor and forced labor is not being fully realized. Although not all cocoa farmers are members of cooperatives and other farmer associations, many are. Efforts to encourage more farmers to organize and formalize them are underway, thus increasing the reach of workers' organizations and FBOs. The necessity of increasing focus on including their voices and their local representatives to contribute to reduction of child labor and forced labor in cocoa is evident.

This research found that there is still scope to improve the functioning of the CLCCG. Some aspects are similar to the need to join in streamlining the multistakeholder platforms. However, it is crucial to expand membership of the CLCCG to create greater diversity of inputs from key stakeholders. Further, as is relevant throughout all initiatives, the more concrete integration of specific forced labor reduction methods and initiatives can be scaled up.

The conclusions and recommendations presented in this research require a comprehensive and flexible approach to implementation. Continuous verification of the effects of the steps undertaken to reduce child labor and forced labor will be necessary on a regular basis and in an integrated manner.

Recommendations are clustered around eight thematic types that this research identified as needing more focus and streamlining for initiatives to achieve greater impact on reducing child labor and forced labor in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. The thematic areas and main focus of key recommendations are briefly summarized here. Detailed recommendations, their priority level, and main proposed responsible entities for their implementation are listed in the "Conclusions and Recommendations" section of the report.

- 1. Alignment among stakeholders and with producer government strategies/plans to
 - increase efforts of international stakeholders to recognize and work with the Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana governments on a national strategy and planning level for child labor and forced labor reduction, as well as with local government offices in cocoa-producing areas;
 - increase emphasis and funding by stakeholders to better align and network with one another and create synergies to reduce child labor and forced labor; including USAID's initiatives in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana with the USDOL, and
 - plan and integrate efforts on FL with those on CL.

2. Poverty reduction to

- strengthen efforts to increase cocoa farmers' incomes through a multiprong approach to
 ensure at least a living income for cocoa-farming households; strengthen social protection
 mechanisms and their implementation, improving working conditions to ensure
 nonhazardous work for older children, youth, and adults (decent work);
- use data to strengthen knowledge management quality at all levels;
- increase and strengthen collaboration to ensure that national data systems function for planning and other purposes;
- undertake research to determine the exact geographic and cocoa-farming-household coverage by child labor and forced labor initiatives; and
- link between tracing and mapping with labor monitoring systems—e.g., Child Labor Monitoring and Remediation Systems (CLMRS), Système d'Observation et de Suivi du Travail des Enfants en Côte d'Ivoire (SOSTECI), Ghana Child Labour Monitoring System (GCLMS), of coverage levels and improvements in reduction of child labor and forced labor.

3. Awareness raising to

- continue raising awareness and increase focus on community behavior change methods
 to actually change behavior, continue to improve the presentation of child labor and
 forced labor subjects in the media (in producer and consumer countries), and increase
 focus on forced labor issues; and
- integrate information in awareness raising on how to
 - report cases of child labor and forced labor;
 - use grievance mechanisms on any (other) issues that farmers and their families may face; and
 - access services to improve cocoa production and sales.
- 4. Local government service provision at the community level to
 - conduct capacity analysis to identify the strengths, weaknesses, and opportunities of all government services and actors on local development planning and implementation to reduce child labor and forced labor;
 - develop and implement, on the basis of results per district/sous-préfecture, adapted technical capacity-strengthening programs and logistics support (including for transport to and from communities) and identify funding mechanisms;
 - strengthen local government child protection systems and integrate prevention and reduction of child labor into the system ensuring comprehensive identification of interrelated child protection—related subjects;
 - improve quality and access to general education and technical and vocational education and skills training (TVEST), including well-planned school feeding programs and education on children's rights and decent work in agriculture, and ensure that TVEST extends to cover innovative and agriculture-related subjects with use of modern/appropriate technologies; and
 - increase construction of physical infrastructure.
- 5. Landscape approach and IABA with the creation of CLFZ to
 - develop mechanisms to integrate efforts to reduce child labor and forced labor in cocoa into broader schemes, notably, IABA/CLFZ and landscape approaches in specific geographic areas; and
 - work with local government, schools, and other stakeholders in the zone to create a childpositive and decent work environment.

6. Strengthening the role of workers' organizations and FBOs to

- define and ensure fair representation of cocoa farmers and workers in the governance framework of the national strategies on sustainable cocoa and in the elaboration and monitoring of periodic national action plans on child labor and forced labor;
- strengthen capacities of workers' organizations/FBOs on child labor and forced labor issues and establish mechanisms for workers' organizations/FBOs to use to address child labor and forced labor;
- develop a monitoring and evaluation mechanism to measure progress on child labor and forced labor reduction initiatives by workers' organizations and FBOs;
- design and/or disseminate existing tools developed to address child labor and forced labor to be used within workers' organizations and FBOs; and
- include non-agriculture-based workers' organizations such as teachers' unions, health workers'/midwives' organizations in efforts to address child labor and forced labor in cocoa.

7. CLCCG strengthening to

- review implications of expansion and level of expansion of CLCCG membership to be more representative of stakeholders associated with the cocoa value chain;
- ensure that CLCCG objectives are realistic, based on evidence that they are achievable
 within the timelines to be set, and in the new national action plans on child labor, and
 eventually on forced labor, in both countries; and
- Scale up attention to forced labor, consider renaming the Child Labour Monitoring and Remediation System (CLMRS) and CLCCG to indicate that forced labor is a labor rights subject to be included in the activities.

1. Introduction

Farmers and their families should be sufficiently supported . . . to thrive, not just to barely survive.

— Stakeholder, workers' representative

USDOL-ILAB has contracted with the American Institutes for Research® (AIR®) to analyze efforts to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sectors of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana and identify potential indicators to measure progress. This report covers the analysis of stakeholders' implementation of efforts, with emphasis on the period since 2019. The report also includes a review and the identification of good practices of the governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, the private sector, workers' and farmer-based organizations (FBOs) and other civil society groups, and international and national development agencies.

The main research questions were as follows:

- 1. What are the specified efforts of governments, industry, and workers' organizations to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sectors?
- 2. What are the best government and industry practices in management, reporting, and verification to ensure the production of cocoa products without the use of child labor and forced labor?
- 3. How are workers' organizations actively and meaningfully involved in efforts to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sectors?
- 4. What challenges do these groups encounter in their efforts and what could improve?
- 5. What are the efforts since 2019, under the Child Labor Cocoa Coordinating Group (CLCCG) and outside the CLCCG to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sector?

Here in Section 1, we describe the organization of this report. Next in Section 2, we describe the methodology used to gather and analyze the information and the limitations of this approach for data analysis. Following this, Section 3 covers changes in approaches used to reduce child labor and forced labor from 2019 to 2023, remaining gaps, and good practices and Section 4 gives an overview of main causes of child labor and forced labor. Next, Section 5 provides a synthesis of efforts of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana governments, industry, international development partners, workers' organizations to address child labor and forced labor in cocoa sectors in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. Section 6 follows and discusses some aspects to consider in building more effective collaboration and creating synergies. Finally, Section 7 presents conclusions and recommendations.

The answers to the questions have been addressed and integrated throughout the analysis. For Question 5, the answers are covered in Sections 3 and 5. However, activities of the CLCCG members are covered throughout the report wherever relevant.

2. Methodology

The methodology bridges the data collection period from the beginning of 2023 until October 2023. This period included the development of a repository of performance indicators, already covered in a separate report. Data for the report were collected simultaneously with and after the submission of the first draft of the report on performance indicators.

The main stakeholders asked to contribute to the research were the governments of Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire; private-sector cocoa representatives; international development agencies; and international and national civil society, including workers' organizations and FBOs. The specific people contacted were selected on the basis of their membership in the CLCCG or on mapping exercises of key cocoa production stakeholders.

2.1 Conceptual Approach

This research is based on a systems approach to data gathering, analysis, and interpretation.^{4,5,6} The systems approach focuses on all the different elements that influence the process of reducing child labor and forced labor by analyzing the way they impact and influence each other. The systems approach also identifies interrelationships, dependencies, and feedback loops to analyze dynamics, identify patterns, and make informed planning decisions for maximum results. Further, the systems approach also acknowledges that changes in one part of the system can have ripple effects on other parts and that the system as a whole is more than the sum of its individual components. This approach provides a holistic perspective to problem solving and decision making.

This research confirmed that using a systems approach that included a network of stakeholders who implemented an array of complementary methods was essential for progress on reducing child labor and forced labor.

⁴ Parsons, B., Dhillon, L., & Keene, M. (Eds.). (2020). Visionary evaluation for a sustainable equitable future. Information Age Publishing.

⁵ EvalCommunity for a Better World. (2023). Systems theory in evaluation: Understanding complex social systems. https://www.evalcommunity.com/career-center/systems-

theory/#: ``: text = Systems%20 Theory%20 is %20 an %20 approach%20 to %20 evaluation%20 that %20 emphasizes%20 the, rather%20 than the system of the syst%20just%20individual%20components

⁶ Williams, B., & Hummelbrunner, R. (2010). Systems concepts in action. Stanford Business Book.

This research was organized around thematic dimensions shown in Exhibit 1 below, that were updated and adapted from a previous analysis, conducted between 2018 and 2019, on child labor in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. The adaptation included consideration of forced labor in the framework.

Exhibit 1. Thematic Dimensions

	Program and Policy Sectors/Approaches								
	Legal and Policy Frameworks, Data, and Governance	Advocacy, Awareness and Behavior Change Communications		Child Protection	General Education/ Vocational Skills	Economic Empowerment / Social Protection	Improved Technologies, Occupational Safety, and Health	Health/ Other Services	Results CL/FL
National									
District									
Community									
All									

The eight main dimensions were further delineated in a framework of components in a system to address child labor and forced labor as shown in Exhibit 2. Each dimension includes consideration of key existing strategies, legal and regulatory frameworks, and implementation initiatives.

Following the analysis, it was clear that the thematic dimensions and their components were still applicable and relevant to understanding the key issues regarding the reduction of child labor and forced labor.

These aspects can be delineated much further into subcomponents and networks. It should be emphasized that all the different aspects are interrelated and can influence one another, sometimes in unexpected ways. For this reason, while reading the report, the conclusions and recommendations presented in this research should be understood as requiring a comprehensive and flexible approach to implementation. Continuous verification of the effects of the steps undertaken to reduce child labor and forced labor will be needed on a regular basis and in an integrated manner.

⁷ Based on a study that reviewed relevant documentation and included 137 interviews with key stakeholders. Zegers, M. C. R., & Ayenor, G. K. (2021, June). Ending child labour and promoting sustainable cocoa production in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. European Commission. [Studies conducted by the International Cocoa Initiative, International Labour Organization, UNICEF, and others.]

Result: Reduced Child and Forced Labor in Cocoa Production General Education/Vocational Skills Legal and Policy Frameworks, Data, and Governance Support uniforms, Reduce distance Decent No hazardous No forced Data knowledge Local supplies work child labor governance labor management Improve quality Farm mapping/field work, GPS, Strategies to reduce cross-border Support for or no and other digital technologies and domestic trafficking school fees School/training center infrastructure Police and Strengthening Strengthening community-Student teacher/ Lesson materials labor cooperatives, farmerbased organizations trainer ratio based organizations inspection Disciplinary Match education with labor Pedagogy methods market needs Advocacy, Awareness, and Behavior Change Communications Institutions and capacities Child and Forced Labor Monitoring, Remediation, strengthened across all key child and **Economic Empowerment** Traceability, and Certification Systems forced labor reduction mechanisms and dimensions Formalization: cooperatives, Decent wages/price Implementation Linkages to Integration in associations, etc. for product logistics local legal and policy frameworks governance Social protection coverage Livelihoods/ Community-Ease of use diversification based traceability Feasibility reach Transparency monitoring tools remote producer level system Business and skills training Available market Improved Technologies, Clarity Cost Human resources Time needed Occupational Safety, and Health traceability tools Job placement/ Micro-finance Business services enterprise start-up Labor-saving Safe, efficient **Child Protection** devices tools, equipment households and working conditions Violence against children: Child protection Migration and General Health/Other Services neglect, (sexual) abuse and systems displacement exploitation strengthening Access to water, fuel, etc. Occupational safety General health Social service workers, management and health Justice for children (justice Mental health and Psycho-social services system) Birth certificates social support Justice services

Exhibit 2. Framework of Key Dimensions of Reducing Child and/or Forced Labor

4 | AIR.ORG Task 5.1.5 Assessment Report

2.2 Data collection

Document Review and Analysis

A thorough literature review of 613 documents and websites was conducted for the analysis covered in the current report. The documents and websites that were reviewed included the wide-ranging subjects covered across the thematic dimensions listed in Exhibit 1. They also included information about conceptual issues, strategies, initiatives, and progress made to reduce child and forced labor.

Interviews and Other Stakeholder Inputs

The initial phase of the research concentrated on ensuring that relevant main stakeholders from the national and international communities were aware of the research and willing to contribute to it. They were informed formally by a letter of introduction. This was followed up with official communications between the USDOL and relevant Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire government representatives.

A first round of interviews with 20 stakeholders was conducted with key international stakeholders between February and April 2023. This was followed with field visits by national consultants in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana to interview key local stakeholders in Kumasi, Ghana, from May 2 to May 5, 2023, and in Soubré, Côte d'Ivoire, from May 30 to June 3, 2023. Additional stakeholders were interviewed between May 2 and October 10, 2023, to obtain inputs into the research process. Ultimately 79 stakeholders were interviewed as shown below in Exhibit 3 with more details provided in Appendix B.

Exhibit 3. Stakeholder Interviews

Type of Organization	Number of Interviews Conducted
International NGO	27
Civil Society	17
Private Company	10
Government Official	25
Total Number of Interviews	79

The information collected from the initial key stakeholders during the first rounds through the middle of May 2023 addressed changes in stakeholders' initiatives and networking over the previous 3 to 4 years, good practices, and possible performance indicators. Subsequent interviews from June onward focused less on indicator identification and more on:

- updates regarding the way changes in approaches and collaboration had occurred since 2019;
- identification of good practices to the extent feasible during the same period; and
- the role of workers' organizations and FBOs to reduce child labor and forced labor and the way this could be further strengthened to increase impact.

One-day participatory workshops were held with stakeholders in Ghana (May 11, 2023) and Côte d'Ivoire (May 23, 2023). These workshops were conducted with a primary objective of obtaining inputs into the development of the progress indicator repository. The workshop discussions did, however, also cover inputs from participants, to identify important aspects concerning ongoing successes, challenges, and remaining gaps for consideration for the analysis covered in this report.

The workshops invited a diverse set of stakeholders including national and local civil servants; consultants assigned to specialized child labor and forced labor government offices; civil society representatives including from workers' and employers'; international and national NGOs/foundations; private-sector representatives; and academics involved in managing, measuring, or studying issues related to child labor and forced labor.

Feedback from stakeholders was further invited and provided through email correspondence to complement the interviews and deepen analysis of specific subjects that needed further input. Stakeholders who were not interviewed or from whom additional input was desired were contacted for this purpose. Topics included recommendations on strengthening inputs from workers' organizations and FBOs. Another topic focused on obtaining inputs on using specific planning methods such as the United Nations Development Programme's (UNDP) portfolio approach⁸ and design thinking⁹ methods. The email approach allowed for a more specific and detailed exchange than using a form that could be filled in. Representatives of 14 different stakeholder groups (UN agencies, private-sector representatives, civil society groups including workers and FBO representatives, projects) all provided information to round out the findings.

2.3 Data Analysis

The AIR team's literature and interview analysis consisted of continuous review of incoming information and analysis. Three main data analysis tools were used. The qualitative data software Atlas.ti¹⁰ was used to organize and analyze all data collected in interviews and other communications with the stakeholders. The lead researcher had developed a set of codes around

⁸ UNDP. (2022). *System Change: A guidebook for adopting portfolio approaches*. UNDP.

⁹ E.g., UNICEF. (2018). *Human-centered (child-centered) design thinking in support of the design process of the new UNICEF Malawi country programme.* UNICEF.

¹⁰ Atlas.ti. Feature overview. https://atlasti.com/features.html

the research questions, thematic dimensions, and their components (see the Framework in Exhibit 4) to use in Atlas.ti. Mind Mapping¹¹ software was used to facilitate and support the analysis. The mind mapping provided the basis for the analysis of the interrelations among the components of the systems analysis.

In addition, Google forms were developed to register information and good practices. Spreadsheets were drawn up to organize specific information regarding the actions of the different stakeholders and the potential good practices.

A set of criteria was developed to help define and rate potential good practices, shown in Exhibit 4 below. The criteria were based on past analyses of the AIR team to identify good practices in other complex assignments. These criteria aimed to balance different elements that should be considered to determine whether a practice might be assessed as being a "good" one. It should further be noted that the AIR research team had preferred not to use the terms "best" or "potential" good practice. The level of distinction required to determine whether a practice is really "best" is challenging to assess and not preferable. There is no need to use the word "potential" given that a good practice should be able to be sufficiently identified beyond its being only a potentially good practice.

Exhibit 4. Criteria to Define Good Practices

Criteria	Description
1. Effective and successful	A good practice has proved its strategic relevance as the most effective way to achieve a specific objective; the practice has been successfully adopted and has had a positive impact on individuals and/or communities.
2. Innovative and creative	The design and implementation are innovative and/or creative.
3. Environmentally, economically, and socially sustainable	A good practice meets current needs, particularly the essential needs of people working in cocoa production, without compromising the ability to address future needs.
4. Sensitive to gender and vulnerable groups	A description of the practice must show the way women and other vulnerable groups (as relevant) are included to reduce reliance on child labor and forced labor. Other vulnerable groups may include elderly farmers, youth, domestic and international migrants/refugees, and people with disabilities.
5. Technically feasible	Technical feasibility is the basis of a good practice; it is easy to learn and to implement.
6. Inherently participatory	Good practice involves project stakeholders through meaningful participation and ownership.

¹¹SimpleMind. Home. https://simplemind.eu/

	Participatory approaches are essential as they support a joint sense of ownership of decisions and actions.
7. Replicable and adaptable	A good practice should have the potential for replication and should therefore be adaptable to similar objectives in varying situations.

2.4 Challenges and Limitations

Forced labor. Although child labor and forced labor are both considered throughout our research, much more information is available on child labor. There has been increasing attention and strategy development to address forced labor in cocoa among key stakeholders. However, there are so far very few in-depth initiatives aimed at addressing this issue of forced labor in cocoa, aside from examples such as the Forced Labor Indicators Project (FLIP)¹² and a collaboration between the Rainforest Alliance, International Cocoa Initiative and Solidaridad.¹³ FLIP is primarily aimed at strengthening the capacity of key stakeholders to identify cases of forced labor and harmonize approaches for identifying and addressing forced labor risk. These are very important goals because initiatives to reduce forced labor can only be effectively implemented if stakeholders understand and can identify cases of forced labor. The FLIP project definitions of forced labor are based on International Labour Organization (ILO) definitions 14 the countries have recognized.

Forced labor has been receiving more attention in the cocoa sector over the course of the last few years but there is, frankly, not much information to analyze yet. This is primarily because, even though some strategies and plans mention forced labor, direct actions for reducing forced labor in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana are still few in number. Given the lack of existing data on forced labor initiatives, it is difficult to cover forced labor in the same depth as child labor. The research team also noted that there is some disagreement among stakeholders on the way to address and integrate forced labor into or alongside approaches to reduce CL. Discussions about forced labor initiatives and other related topics are discussed in greater detail below.

Good practices identification. Although there have been some studies to identify good practices to reduce child labor in cocoa production, these do not cover the breadth of approaches and initiatives used. Some good practices are very broad, such as general awareness raising methods and messages in communities, whereas others are more targeted. A targeted practice could be, for example, support for children from a particular community to be provided with transport to

¹² Verité. (2023). FLIP in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. https://verite.org/forced-labor-indicators-project/

¹³ Rainforest Alliance (2021), Project Profile: Tackling Forced Labor and Child Labor in the Ghanaian Cocoa and Gold Mining Sectors, Available from: https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/in-the-field/tackling-forced-labor-and-child-labor-in-ghanasectors-project/. Rainforest Alliance.

¹⁴ ILO. (2012). ILO indicators of forced labour. Special action programme to combat forced labour. ILO.

go to school. Of course, such a practice may also eventually be generalized to all children who live at substantial distance from their schools.

Ideally, good practices should be identified through independent studies instead of through selfassessment by implementers. Independent studies may include evaluations of projects. They may also be independent assessments of various initiatives that are part of larger government or private-sector programs that may be implemented outside of a project context. The quantity of studies specifically to identify good practices to reduce child labor and forced labor, including through evaluations, is limited. Consequently, for this research, the researchers decided to combine information including from a wide range of sources—project evaluations, meta evaluations that include analysis of multiple evaluations, and self-assessments of implementing agencies.

Because of these factors, the identified good practices provide some indication of the types of approaches that provide more chances of being effective and having greater impact on the reduction of child labor and forced labor. However, these indications should not be considered absolute but rather be seen as providing guidance on the types of initiatives that are shown to have success—particularly because the context and other types of efforts being undertaken can affect the success of the implementation of an identified good practice.

Comparability of initiatives. Throughout the report we refer to a broad range of types of strategies and initiatives. Although there are some commonalities, there are also major differences. Comparability of these is consequently limited, and readers should constrain themselves from drawing absolute conclusions. There is no one way to approach child labor and forced labor reduction; rather, the combination of strategies and practices implemented will lead to greater success in reducing child labor and forced labor.

Consider, for example, that although some projects and initiatives are similar because they implement Child Labor Monitoring and Remediation Systems (CLMRS), others are vastly different. For instance, UNICEF engages in strengthening child protection systems, which includes addressing child labor as part of a more comprehensive effort to consolidate child protection across communities. UNICEF supports governments in implementing these systems. Fair trade certification systems aim to certify that cocoa producers and other stakeholders in the cocoa value chain have complied with sustainability and decent work requirements. Certified cocoa products brought to the market are thus assessed as having met these requirements. The fairtrade certification systems are not centered on development progress indicators, although they can keep track of the number of certified farmers/cooperatives. Of course, having a certification system can also contribute to ensuring that farmers and other stakeholders in the cocoa value chain take actions to protect their products.

3. Addressing Child and Forced Labor: Changes in Approaches from 2019 to 2023, Remaining Gaps, and Good Practices

Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana together continue to produce 65% of the world's cocoa. ¹⁵ Challenges around the prevalence of child and forced labor, deforestation and climate change issues related to cocoa production persist. OXFAM found in a study published in May 2023 that, on average, cocoa farmers in Ghana reported that they are still 16% worse off than before the COVID-19 pandemic. ¹⁶ The journal *Confectionery Production*, which is aimed at the confectionery, chocolate, sweet bakery and snack industries to report on technical and business news, recognized this situation, referring to the study on its own website. ¹⁷

3.1 Main Changes Being Undertaken in Approaches to Reduce Child and Forced Labor

Producer governments, consumers, human rights and environmental sustainability groups, ¹⁸ and United Nations agencies advocate increasingly to address human rights and environmental challenges related to the cocoa value chain. Consumer country governments, including the United States, the European Union (EU), Japan, are likewise drawing more attention to these issues. Most private-sector companies in the cocoa value chain recognize these challenges and are growing their programs and support to reduce them.

The current research finds that, over the course of the last 4 years, some major positive changes could be identified, but much remained to be done. Based on the documentation, interviews and other collected information, ¹⁹ the analysis noted several main areas of change. Positive changes over the last few years primarily needed to be brought to scale to cover more farming households and their farmer-based organization (FBO) representatives. ²⁰ Some other positive changes also needed greater participation, data sharing, adjustments, and strengthening to be more effective.

¹⁵ African Union, Specialized Technical Committee (STC) on Finance, Monetary Affairs, Economic Planning and Integration. (2021). Developing integrated and complementary value chains for sustainable recovery and reinforcing operationalization of the African Continental Free Trade Area (AfCFTA). https://au.int/en/stc-finance-2021

¹⁶Study of 400 cocoa farmers. OXFAM International. (2023, May). Chocolate giants reap huge profits as promises to improve farmers' incomes "ring hollow." https://www.oxfam.org/en/press-releases/chocolate-giants-reap-huge-profits-promises-improve-farmers-incomes-ring-hollow

¹⁷ Confectionery Production. (2020). Environmental and human rights groups unite for declaration urging cocoa sustainability action. https://www.confectioneryproduction.com/news/30546/environmental-and-human-rights-groups-combine-for-landmark-declaration-urging-cocoa-sustainability-action/

¹⁸ Including workers' and farmer-based organizations that advocate for decent work conditions and better incomes for cocoa farmers to reduce their poverty.

 $^{^{\}rm 19}$ Written and other exchanges with stakeholders (see "Methodology" section).

²⁰ E.g., associations, cooperatives, workers' and employers' organizations

Remaining gaps and ideas for new initiatives that could help to improve impact to reduce child labor and forced labor were also identified and will be covered in the remainder of this report.

There are changes from the macro international level down to the community and household levels. Several multi-country international platforms are growing and collaborating more intensively. These include the CLCCG, the European and Japan country Initiatives for Sustainable Cocoa (ISCO's)²¹ while the International Cocoa Initiative (ICI) also continues to increase its membership. Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana are both part of Alliance 8.7.²² Alliance 8.7 is a multistakeholder collaboration to support governments in achieving Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) Target 8.7, which includes eradication of forced labor, human trafficking, and child labor.²³

International legislation has also started to increase focus on the reduction of child and forced labor. This includes the African Organization for Standardization (ARSO) 1000. ²⁴ This African standard outlines the criteria for cocoa farmers, whether as an individual, a Farmer Group, or a Farmer Cooperative referred to as a "Recognized Entity," to adhere to improved management systems. It encompasses performance standards for organizing their management, aiming to improve efficiency and align with the economic, social, and environmental aspects essential for sustainable cocoa bean production.

Further, as detailed in Section 5, the European Union has adopted Due Diligence Requirements under a directive on corporate sustainability due diligence.²⁵ In 2023, a regulation setting out the details of the prevention of deforestation and that also mentions respect for labor rights was adopted. ²⁶

²¹ Beyond Chocolate, DISCO, SWISSCO, GISCO. (2021). The national platforms for sustainable cocoa in Europe: Alignment & collaboration. PDF. Beyond Chocolate, DISCO, SWISSCO, GISCO. For Japan there is the Platform for Sustainable Cocoa in Developing Countries not formally called JISCO at the time of writing. JICA. (2022). Press release. Action Plan to Eliminate Child Labour in the Cocoa Industry by the Platform for Sustainable Cocoa in Developing Countries.

 $https://www.jica.go.jp/Resource/english/news/press/2022/20221012_42.html \#: ``text=The \% 20 Platform \% 20 For \% 20 Sustainable \% 20 Cocoa \% 20 in \% 20 Developing \% 20 Countries \% 20 (the \% 20 Cocoa, \% 20 Cocoa Mically Mically \% 20 Cocoa Mically Mically \% 20 Cocoa Mically Mic$

²² Both are Pathfinder countries

²³ United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Sustainable Development. Alliance 8.7. https://sdgs.un.org/partnerships/alliance-87

²⁴African Organization for Standardization (ARSO) & Organisation Africaine de Normalisation (ORAN) (2021), Catalogue of African Regional Standards (ARS), Addis Ababa: ARSA/ORAN.

https://www.arso-oran.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/Catalogue-of-African-Regional-Standards-ARS-June-2021_TC.pdf ²⁵ European Commission. (2022). Press release. Just and sustainable economy: Commission lays down rules for companies to respect human rights and environment in global value chains. European Commission. https://single-market-economy.ec.europa.eu/news/just-and-sustainable-economy-commission-lays-down-rules-companies-respect-human-rights-and-2022-02-23 en

²⁶ Official Journal of the European Union. (2023). Regulation (EU) 2023/1115 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 31 May 2023 on the making available on the Union market and the export from the Union of certain commodities and products associated with deforestation and forest degradation and repealing Regulation (EU) No 995/2010. European Parliament and the Council of the European Union.

Closer to the source of cocoa from Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, the two countries are working to harmonize their sales policies and strengthen their impact on trade issues.²⁷ The goal of international policy cooperation in this respect is to maximize producer country national gains from cocoa exports. The aim is to address issues such as cocoa pricing but also to move away from only supplying cocoa beans for further processing in consumer countries to participation in the processing of cocoa beans. Efforts are being undertaken, for example, to engage in cocoa grinding, processing into cocoa paste, and other intermediate products and final products such as chocolate. Several interviewees confirmed that Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana are indeed increasingly collaborating on all aspects of cocoa production and sale but also on child labor and forced labor and environmental protection issues. The Côte d'Ivoire-Ghana Cocoa Initiative (CIGCI)²⁸ was established to facilitate collaboration between the two countries and is currently functioning for this purpose with objectives to

- achieve remunerative prices and improve the livelihoods (i.e., income level) of cocoa farmers:
- process, promote, and enhance consumption and utilization of cocoa;
- promote, foster, and defend the common interest of member countries in the international cocoa market;
- learn, innovate, and collaborate in tackling challenges facing cocoa production;
- share scientific, economic, and technical information on cocoa for mutual benefit; and
- harmonize cocoa production and marketing policies of member countries.

Exhibit 5 lists the main positive areas of change since 2019 in approaches to closing gaps in child labor and forced labor reduction processes. Respondents who provided the inputs summarized in Exhibit 4 were mostly CLCCG members but also members of other groups, especially representatives of workers' organizations and FBOs. Interviewees added suggestions to further improve initiatives being undertaken and to increase the closing of gaps in order to achieve greater impact on child labor and forced labor reduction. These suggestions, summarized in the second column of Exhibit 5, also helped inform the recommendations included in this report.

²⁷ African Union, Specialized Technical Committee (STC) on Finance, Monetary Affairs, Economic Planning and Integration. (2021). Developing integrated and complementary value chains for sustainable recovery and reinforcing operationalization of the AfCFTA. https://au.int/en/stc-finance-2021

²⁸ The CIGCI secretariat was established in 2021. The CIGCI membership consists of the Côte d'Ivoire Conseil du Café-Cacao and the Ghana Cocoa Board (COCOBOD) but is open to other African cocoa-producing countries. Côte d'Ivoire-Ghana Cocoa Initiative (CIGCI), About us (CIGCI). https://www.cighci.org/about-us/

Exhibit 5. Main Areas of Change according to Stakeholders and Recommendations

Main	Identified Areas of Positive Change Since 2019	Suggestions to Strengthen Positive Change According to Stakeholders
Stakeh	older alignment	
1.	There is increased emphasis among stakeholders ²⁹ to better align and network with one another to reduce child labor and forced labor. ³⁰	Scale up alignment among stakeholders to include their representatives more comprehensively. Increase emphasis on moving away from mainly engaging in information sharing when meeting in multistakeholder platforms to increasing collaboration and joint efforts to reduce child labor and forced labor.
2.	There is more recognition of the role of the producer governments as full partners in addressing the issues.	Increase effort to recognize and work with the Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana governments at the national strategy and planning level but also with local government offices in cocoa-producing areas.
Econoi	mic empowerment	
3.	There has been growth in the emphasis on poverty reduction, including on ensuring a living income to aid in reducing farmers' dependence on child labor and forced labor.	Strengthen efforts to increase cocoa farmers' incomes and ensure that additional financial support intended for cocoa farmers is actually shared at the farm gate.
4.	There is increased attention to providing social protection (including social safety nets). ³¹	Review social protection needs of cocoa farmers and workers, including the way to increase access to safety nets (e.g., cash transfers to vulnerable families), pensions, and health and agricultural production insurance. ³²
CLMRS and child protection		
5.	Implementing agencies and foundations report that there is greater coverage of cocoa communities with programs such	Undertake research to determine the exact geographic and cocoa-farming household coverage of CL/FL reduction initiatives. Scale up initiatives and monitor increases in coverage and quality of coverage.

²⁹ "Stakeholders" are henceforth defined in the study as comprising producer and consumer governments and their representatives, cocoa workers and farmer representatives, and other national/international civil society groups, private-sector companies, United Nations agencies, and other national and international development organizations.

³⁰ E.g., Confectionery Production. (2020). Environmental and human rights groups unite for declaration urging cocoa sustainability action. Confectionery Production. https://www.confectioneryproduction.com/news/30546/environmental-and-human-rights-groups-combine-for-landmark-declaration-urging-cocoa-sustainability-action/

³¹ Social protection is linked to poverty reduction, decent work protections, and human rights more generally. Social safety nets fall under social protection more broadly and can comprise cash, in-kind transfers, social pensions, public works, and school feeding programs targeting poor and vulnerable households.

World Bank. (2019). Safety nets: Social safety net programs protect families from the impact of economic shocks, natural disasters, and other crises. https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/safetynets

³² This list of social protection components to consider is not exhaustive and may include other social protection components.

Main Identified Areas of Positive Change Since 2019

Suggestions to Strengthen Positive Change According to Stakeholders

as the Child Labor Monitoring and Remediation System (CLMRS).

6. Interest in using a broader child well-being, child-positive approach, is growing because of the understanding that a simple household or child-labor-only approach is insufficient to successfully address child labor in cocoa.

Strengthen links between child labor initiatives and national and local child protection systems provision, including attention to strengthening local government service provision on identifying cases, remediation, monitoring, and follow-up.

A related aspect is that there is increased concern that CLMRS and similar methods are not efficient and consequently, in parallel, that broader systems and development—oriented approaches can create more impact with less cost.

This view is sometimes linked to increased attention to ensuring that child labor is not seen as a stand-alone subject but should be addressed through strengthened national and local child protection systems.

7. There is increased focus on establishing integrated area-based approach (IABA) to create child-labor-free zones (CLFZ), as part of an adaptation of agriculture broader landscape approaches³³ to reduce child labor overall. The aim is to ensure that children³⁴ do not stop work in cocoa production only to work in other forms of

Develop mechanisms to integrate efforts to reduce child labor and forced labor in cocoa into broader schemes (CLFZ, landscape approaches) to reduce child and forced labor in specific geographic areas.

Determine ways private-sector companies can prove that they are protecting their cocoa value chains while simultaneously supporting, but not necessarily being held responsible for, reducing child labor in other value chains or other forms (e.g., in domestic work, palm oil production, gold mining).

³³ Landscape approaches consist of multi-stakeholder collaborations that engage stakeholders within a delimited geographic area to attain defined development goals. IDH (2023), How Landscape Approaches Can Tackle Deforestation and Shape the Future of Sustainable Supply Chains: The Case of the Cocoa Sector. Available from:

https://www.idhsustainable trade.com/news/how-landscape-approaches-can-tackle-deforestation-and-shape-the-future-of-sustainable-supply-chains-the-case-of-the-cocoa-

sector/#: ``: text = Landscape % 20 approaches % 20 refer % 20 to % 20 multi, sustainability % 20 performance % 20 multiple % 20 multiple

³⁴ Ofori Agyeman, E. (2023), *Protocols and guidelines for the establishment of child labour free zones*. Labour Department, Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations, Ghana.

Main Identified Areas of Positive Change Since 2019	Suggestions to Strengthen Positive Change According to Stakeholders
child labor that are not being addressed.	
Awareness	
8. Stakeholders interviewed reported finding that most farmers in areas covered with child labor reduction activities were aware that there should not be child labor on their farms.	Continue awareness raising and increase focus on community behavior change methods to change actual behavior. Integrate information on how to report cases of child labor and forced labor; use grievance mechanisms on any other issues that farmers and their families may face; access services to improve cocoa production and sales; access social services including formal/nonformal education; social protection, such as means to access benefits for not engaging children in child labor, health insurance, and pensions; and other social safety nets.
Data management and use	,
9. There has been augmentation of the emphasis on collecting effective data to implement and measure efforts undertaken, as well as on sharing this information.	Increase and strengthen collaboration among child labor and forced labor initiative implementing stakeholders to ensure that national data systems function for planning and other purposes. Ensure that all entities that work on reducing child labor and forced labor participate in and contribute to the local government and national data systems on child labor and forced labor.
Forced labor	
 There is more focus on also addressing forced labor in cocoa production, but this is still in the early stages. 	Plan and integrate efforts on forced labor with those on child labor. When appropriate, develop systems to address issues specific to child and adult forced labor, including application of labor laws for adults.
Education	
11. There is increased focus on education and other physical infrastructure.	Continue to fund building and/or renovating education, Water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH), and other physical infrastructure.
Occupational safety and health	
12. Efforts are increasing slowly to improve safety and efficiency of	Increase focus on improving safety and efficiency in cocoa production.

Main Identified Areas of Positive Change Since 2019	Suggestions to Strengthen Positive Change According to Stakeholders
work in cocoa production and processing, and transport.	

Several of the main points that stakeholders raised were reflected in the 5th Global Conference on the Elimination of Child Labour, the Durban Call to Action on the Elimination of Child Labour, ³⁵ indicating that these changes aligned with ongoing international discussions. The Durban Call to Action included six commitments to scale up action and 49 immediate and effective measures to take. Aside from accelerating multistakeholder efforts to eliminate child labor and forced labor and make decent work a reality for adults and youth above the minimum age for work, some relevant main points were to ensure:

- progress on access to quality education and training;
- access to universal social protection;
- data-driven programming; and
- increased financing and international cooperation for the elimination of child labor and forced labor.

3.1.1 Forced Labor

Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana have both adopted the ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29),³⁶ and its Protocol of 2014.³⁷ The purpose of the Forced Labour Convention is to suppress the use of forced labor in all its forms, irrespective of the nature of the work or the sector of activity in which it may be performed. The Convention defines "forced labor" as "all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself voluntarily."³⁸ Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana have both ratified this convention, which means that they are expected to apply the convention in law and practice. They are also expected to report on its application at regular intervals.

The Labour Convention, 1930, obligates countries that have ratified it to provide protection and appropriate remedies, including compensation, to victims of forced labor and to sanction the perpetrators of forced labor. The protocol also obligates state parties to develop "a national

³⁵ 5th Global Conference on the Elimination of Child Labour (2022), Durban Call to Action on the Elimination of Child Labour. Durban, May 15–20, 2022.

³⁶ ILO, ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No.29).

https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12100:0::NO::P12100ILOCODE:C029

³⁷ ILO. (2023). R203—Forced labour (supplementary measures) recommendation, 2014 (No. 203).

https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100INSTRUMENTID:3174688

³⁸ ILO. ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No.29).

https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12100:0::NO::P12100ILOCODE:C029

policy and plan of action for the effective and sustained suppression of forced or compulsory labour."³⁹ The convention and protocol are thus applicable to work in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana.

In practice, the prevalence of forced labor in cocoa is not yet very clear because no comprehensive study has yet been undertaken to measure it in either country. Conducting such a study would, however, require that stakeholders fully understand what is and is not forced labor. In addition, there must be common agreement on the way forced labor may apply to minors.

The majority of persons who qualify as being in forced labor in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana are working as tenant farmers for cocoa farm owners. They may be from poorer rural areas within their country or have crossed the Côte d'Ivoire or Ghana border, primarily from Mali, Burkina Faso, and Togo.

Most child labor is carried out in own small family farms and does not fall under the definition of forced labor. Forced child labor primarily consists of the minor children of adults who are in forced labor. The FLIP project has been conceived and is being implemented to lay the groundwork for effective strategies and initiatives to address these challenges. These initiatives will need to be designed to fit with child labor reduction initiatives because all take place in cocoagrowing communities. The remainder of the report includes references to forced labor whenever this is relevant.

3.1.2 Farm Mapping

To accurately count and track the number of cocoa farms, as well as to determine vulnerabilities, farm mapping can be used to predict and monitor areas at risk for child labor. As one interviewee explained, when it is clear where the farms are they can be identified in accordance with special vulnerabilities. That is, for example, particularly in deforested areas where households tend to have less access to social services and locations where poverty is especially high. Furthermore, with mapping, auditing of farms with regard to child labor and forced labor can be better planned and random sampling can be used.

³⁹ ILO. (2023). R203—Forced labour (supplementary measures) recommendation, 2014 (No. 203). https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100INSTRUMENTID:3174688

However, mapping cocoa farms accurately is very complicated. Farm mapping can be performed through direct (participative) field work, via satellite, and through aerial photography. 40,41 The focus on farm mapping of large areas has substantially increased over the last few years, mostly for tracking deforestation but also within the context of service provision to farmers and their households (Fountain, 2022).

Most of the more comprehensive mapping of farms in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire is being done by satellite. Satellites can be used in conjunction with various physical methods in the areas to be surveyed, for example, by using Global Position System (GPS) polygon mapping. This type of mapping is implemented within a defined area and combines physical travel with recording GPS coordinates and points of interest. This is probably the most accurate method; using only GPS imaging may lead to inaccuracies because the farms often have inherent tree canopy cover that can obstruct the view of underlying vegetation—and thus of workers. Limited resolution of images and cloud cover also pose challenges. The scattered stakeholder fields make it difficult to locate farms using GPS, and potential effects on cocoa-growing households, as well as costs, are factors to consider. Further, there is limited imagery from different time periods that can be used to compare changes over time in the most remote areas. Field-based mapping that is mostly based on self-reporting to data collectors is also performed. This type of mapping usually covers less area because of complications of collecting data from farmers across vast areas. It is also considered less accurate because it is difficult for data collectors to physically visit and cross-check all the sites that farmers—individually or in groups—have cited.

4. Updated Situation Overview of Main Causes of Child and Forced Labor

This research focused on the situation of child labor and forced labor in the cocoa sector in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire from 2019 to the present. Almost all the main causes of child labor have persisted beyond the focal timeframe to the present. Stakeholder interviewees and documentation are well aligned in this regard. Overall, the same causes of child labor also contribute to the existence of forced labor in the cocoa value chain. They include poverty as a

⁴⁰ An example of recent studies is Abu, I.-O., Szantoi, Z., Brink, A., Robuchon, M., & Thiel, M. (2021). *Detecting cocoa plantations in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana and their implications on protected areas*. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC8329934/?report=printable

⁴¹ Kalischek, N., Lang, N., Renier, C., Caye Daudt, R., Addoah, T., Thompson, W, Blaser-Hart, W.J., Garrett, R., Schindler, K., Wegner, D. Satellite-based high-resolution maps of cocoa planted area for Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. UNEP-WCMC, Available from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/361275455_Satellite-based_high-resolution maps of cocoa planted area for Cote d'Ivoire and Ghana. Website accessed May 20, 2023

⁴² Termeer, E., Vos, B., Bolchini, A., Van Ingen, E., & Abrokwa, K. (2023). *Digitalization and child labour in agriculture: Exploring blockchain and Geographic Information Systems to monitor and prevent child labour in Ghana's cocoa sector*. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO).

recognized primary cause, issues regarding application of legal and regulatory frameworks to identified cases, and challenges with access to quality education from early childhood through secondary school. While awareness of child labor has increased and lack of awareness has decreased as a cause, forced labor awareness is only starting to become more common.

Consistent data gathering and analysis across implementers to inform decision making on the reduction of child labor and forced labor is still not adequate. This particularly applies at the local government level because technical and logistical social service provision, including child labor and forced labor monitoring and remediation, is only partial. That is, local government service providers are not able to adequately cover local communities for CLMRS coverage. Likewise, lack of transport and other logistics makes it difficult to fully implement and monitor child protection systems. There is thus a dependence on externally funded child labor reduction initiatives to share their data on their activities in the local communities. Although some agencies do share their data with the local government, which is expected to consolidate the information and send it to the national level, this is still not always being done.

4.1 Poverty and Economic Empowerment

Poverty is still widely recognized among the stakeholders interviewed and in the documentation as the main but not the only cause of child labor and forced labor.

Families who are not living in poverty prefer that their children go to school and not work, at least if schools are accessible. However, an analysis in 2020 of 50 studies shows a complex relationship between changes in household income and whether there is child labor in the household.⁴³ Decreases in household income tend to increase child labor, especially if households fall below poverty level because of income shocks. Increases in income can cause child labor to rise, as well as to fall, depending on the context.⁴⁴ If the value of agricultural activities increases, there is a potential risk for higher demand for labor which can include increased dependence on child labor. 45 Even if child labor of one type decreases because of support like cash transfers, it is also possible that children may engage in other hazardous farm work or difficult household tasks instead. 46 Thus, although poverty reduction is a necessary step to take, it is not sufficient to reduce child labor and forced labor. Other causes also need to be addressed and development initiatives combined in a synergistic manner.

⁴³ ICI. (2020). The effects of income changes on child labour: A review of evidence from smallholder agriculture. ICI.

⁴⁴ ICI. (2020). The effects of income changes on child labour: A review of evidence from smallholder agriculture. ICI.

⁴⁶ Tasks like carrying heavy loads like firewood or water. De Hoop, J., & Groppo, V. (2020). How do cash transfers affect child work and schooling? Surprising evidence from Malawi, the United Republic of Tanzania and Zambia. Innocenti Research Brief 2020-14. UNICEF-Innocenti.

The AIR team draws attention to the fact that stakeholders, including advocates and cocoa consumers, focus a great deal on poverty reduction as the key to solving all child labor and forced labor problems. Several studies have, in fact, shown that combining poverty reduction mechanisms with other initiatives has a greater impact on reducing child labor than providing only the means to increase income.⁴⁷ The 5th Global Conference on the Elimination of Child Labour (2022), Durban Call to Action on the Elimination of Child Labour,⁴⁸ called for multisectoral approaches as most effective. As the ILO, UNICEF, and the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO)⁴⁹ have also emphasized, multisectoral approaches are essential to reducing child labor and forced labor, with poverty reduction being only one of the means of reducing child labor and/or forced labor. In fact, the need for multisectoral approaches has been clear for many years.⁵⁰

Thus, while poverty is a clear issue that must be addressed, determining what is needed is not as straightforward as may be assumed. The literature and the stakeholders interviewed raise many options for reducing poverty, with some being seen as more effective than others, although comparative research is limited. Options include increasing the price of cocoa at the farm gate, paying supplements in the form of annually adjusted "living income differentials," ⁵¹ and social safety net payments such as cash transfers. Other less direct means being used to help increase incomes include support for village savings and loan associations (VSLAs), supporting farmers to diversify so that they are not overly dependent only on cocoa, and providing support to improve cocoa productivity.

The recent Beyond Chocolate annual report for 2021⁵² indicated that most of the group's partner companies⁵³ were "still struggling to get a clear picture of the living income gaps in their supply chain. Available data shows that farmers in West-Africa are still far from earning a living income."⁵⁴ The relationship between poverty and *forced labor* is different from poverty and most

⁴⁷ E.g., Chiodi, V., & Escudero, V. (2020). More is more. Livelihood interventions and child labor in the agricultural sector. ILO.

⁴⁸ 5th Global Conference on the Elimination of Child Labour (2022), Durban Call to Action.

⁴⁹ UNICEF. (2021). *Ending child labor through a multisectoral approach*. UNICEF.

FAO. (2021). Call for action: Ending child labour in agriculture with the help of agricultural stakeholders. Global Forum on Food Security and Nutrition. https://www.fao.org/fsnforum/call-submissions/call-action-ending-child-labour-agriculture-help-agricultural-stakeholders.

⁵⁰ Agarwal, M., & Kelly, L. (2004). *Understanding Children's Work program addressing challenges of globalization: An independent evaluation of the World Bank's approach to global programs—Case study.* The World Bank Operations Evaluation Department.

⁵¹ Living income differentials are premiums paid per ton of cocoa and are determined on an annual basis to help farmers attain at least a living income.

⁵² IDH, Beyond Chocolate, Belgium Partner in Development (2022), Beyond Chocolate Annual Report 2021. Utrecht: IDH, Beyond Chocolate, Belgium Partner in Development.

⁵³ Beyond Chocolate brings together Belgian chocolate companies, retailers, civil society, and research institutions to promote sustainable chocolate, support farmer livelihoods, and tackle deforestation. Beyond Chocolate has more than 60 member organizations, including large cocoa value chain companies such as Barry Callebaut, Mars, Mondelēz, Nestlé, ofi, and Tony's Chocolonely.

⁵⁴ IDH, Beyond Chocolate, Belgium Partner in Development (2022), Beyond Chocolate Annual Report 2021. Utrecht: IDH, Beyond Chocolate, Belgium Partner in Development.

child labor. Child labor in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana overwhelmingly occurs on the children's own families' smallholder farms, that is, 78% of children in Côte d'Ivoire and 83% in Ghana work for their parents. When adding work for other relatives, 90% of children in Côte d'Ivoire and 97% in Ghana work either for their parents or other relatives.

It is the poverty of the household that is the most direct cause of child labor in the family because parents rely on their children instead of hiring outside workers though, again, it is not the only cause.

Some farmers are very angry about the focus on ending child labor. They say, "You don't pay a good price, but you don't let us have our children help us!"

— International development stakeholder interviewed

In the case of forced labor, poverty-stricken workers seek employment, even if it does not meet official labor law or other decent work requirements. Most work that is defined as forced labor occurs among adults, but the children of such parents are vulnerable to child labor because their parents have low incomes and are in forced labor. Children may thus meet the definition of being in child forced labor because they are children of adults who are in forced labor.⁵⁶

4.2 Legal and Policy Frameworks, Governance, and Data Management and Use

4.2.1 Legal and Regulatory Frameworks

Stakeholder interviews and a review of legal and regulatory framework analyses indicate that Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana have adequate frameworks in place on the issue of child labor. Of course, there is always room for strengthening and adapting such frameworks, including in line with changing realities.

In the case of forced labor, however, sources noted there are still gaps, and still more work has to be done to develop effective and appropriate legal and regulatory frameworks. It is necessary to ensure that frameworks are in place that cover the many forms that forced labor entails. This includes special attention to cross-border trafficking of workers but also domestically, within the countries.

⁵⁵ NORC. (2020, October). Assessing progress in reducing child labor in cocoa production in cocoa growing areas of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana final report. NORC.

⁵⁶ Some children may also be in forced labor if they work under the threat of penalty from someone other than the parent. Verité. (2023). The ILO Forced Labour Indicators. https://verite.org/forced-labor-indicators-project/flip-resources/ilo-forced-labour-indicators/; ILO (2020), ILO Toolkit on Developing National Action Plans on Forced Labour. Tool No. 2: Forced labour and related concepts. https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_762168.pdf

Most important, interviewees and the literature stressed the fact that the implementation of existing laws and regulations remained the primary challenge. Also remaining is a lack of trained judicial staff, police/gendarmes, and other security personnel to address cases in a legal setting—not to mention, definition of the complex issues regarding application of justice to perpetrators, whom to include, and the kind of consequences to be applied. Should a person be sent to prison? Be diverted into other punishment, such as community service? Be cautioned and asked to pay financial penalties? These are questions that need to be asked and conditions that must be clearly set out in regulations and directives. In addition, there are challenges regarding the logistics of following up on perpetrators' cases and the infrastructure to accommodate them as needed.

4.2.2 Policy Frameworks and Governance

In both Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, the existing national action plans on child labor are ending. In Ghana, a new national plan of action against child labor for 2023-2027 was launched in 2023.⁵⁷ The Government of Côte d'Ivoire also expects to formally adopt and launch a new national action plan soon. Interviewed representatives of the two governments stressed their expectations for the private sector and international and national agencies to increase the grounding of their actions in the new national plans. As some noted, donors and implementers often merely planned what they thought were the most appropriate initiatives and then afterward referred to the national action plans to see if there was a fit.⁵⁸ These interviewees noted that this was contrary to the manner in which donors and implementing stakeholders should work in their countries. At the local level, as well, agencies implementing initiatives should work in line with local government development plans.

According to several interviewees, governance in the two countries on child labor and forced labor is improving at the national level with increased capacities of planners and decision makers on these issues. At the local government level, there has also been more focus on capacity strengthening of service providers and people such as labor inspectors/officers. The FLIP project, for example, is training a wide range of stakeholders on the identification of people in forced labor and related issues.

Other training has been and continues to be conducted in child labor and forced labor issues with various people such as social welfare/community development personnel, police/gendarmes, ⁵⁹ and others with the support of various donors and the governments themselves. Many projects

⁵⁷ Ghana News Agency, Ghana launches third phase of national action plan against child labour. https://gna.org.gh/2023/06/ghana-launches-third-phase-of-national-action-plan-against-child-labour/

⁵⁸ This point was also raised in the May 2023 workshops held in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana.

⁵⁹ Gendarmes and police are types of law enforcement officials mostly in Côte d'Ivoire. E.g., ICI. (2022). L'ICI forme les agents des droits de l'homme et de la justice administrative du Ghana à la lutte contre le travail des enfants et le travail forcé. ICI. https://www.cocoainitiative.org/fr/news/lici-forme-les-agents-des-droits-de-lhomme-et-de-la-justice-administrative-du-ghana-la-lutte

include training with communities and cooperatives, and then also add local government service providers as participants. ⁶⁰ Subjects include a wide range of topics with focus on awareness raising, identifying cases of child labor and forced labor, remediation and other support methods to reduce incidence of cases, and monitoring and evaluation of progress.

Based on the evidence gathered, however, our analysis finds that there is a continued need for much more technical capacity strengthening to cover all cocoa-producing areas and government staff. This includes social workers, labor officers and inspectors, education inspectors, and agricultural extension staff on child labor and forced labor. The need for more capacity strengthening regarding the ways to address forced labor is likely to grow as attention to addressing forced labor issues in cocoa increases.

A more important and associated challenge is the continued lack of funds of government service providers, and justice and extension agents, to adequately support child labor and forced labor community-level identification, monitoring, follow-up, and other service provision. This point was stressed repeatedly in interviews and documentation. It is true that various programs being funded do support decentralized service provision efforts, such as the Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty Program (LEAP) in Ghana. Such programs *can* have an impact on child labor and forced labor but are not explicitly oriented toward this subject. Service providers under LEAP do implement outreach in communities.

Child protection programs in both countries also support community-level work, but active coverage⁶³ at the community level is not yet universal in cocoa-growing areas. The point being made in this report is that there is some service provision, but it is still too limited in scope with respect to community-level needs to reduce child labor and forced labor.

23 | AIR.ORG

⁶⁰ E.g., in partnership of the Rainforest Alliance, ICI, and Solidaridad. Rainforest Alliance. (2021). *Project profile: Tackling forced labor and child labor in the Ghanaian cocoa and gold mining sectors*. Rainforest Alliance, ILO, and UNICEF programming; FLIP project; and various private-sector initiatives. https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/in-the-field/tackling-forced-labor-and-child-labor-in-ghana-sectors-project/

⁶¹ E.g., "Increase budget allocations to metropolitan, municipal and district assemblies to improve birth registration and strengthen the prevention of and response to sexual violence, *child labour* and adolescent pregnancies." UNICEF. (2021). *Fulfilling the commitment to child protection in Ghana*, p. 74. UNICEF.

A similar statement is found for Côte d'Ivoire in Section 3 of the report. UNICEF. (2021). Le droit des enfants à la protection: Analyse de la situation des enfants et des femmes en Côte d'Ivoire. UNICEF.

⁶² The LEAP program "provides bi-monthly cash payments to extremely poor households in all districts of the country. In addition to the cash transfer, LEAP offers free registration in the National Health Insurance Scheme." UNCEF. (2020). *Impacts of the Ghana Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty 1000 programme*. UNICEF. https://www.unicef-irc.org/article/1964-final-evaluation-of-ghana-social-protection-programme-for-infants-now-available.html

Also see Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection (Ghana; n.d.). Livelihood empowerment against poverty program. https://leap.mogcsp.gov.gh/ Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection

⁶³ I.e., that includes active case identification, follow-up, and monitoring of cases at community level. E.g., UNICEF. (2021). *Le droit des enfants*. UNICEF.

Much focus is centered on the *implementation of initiatives through nonstate actors*, with the result that the government is insufficiently strengthened to play its role at the local level. Interviewees in this and other studies⁶⁴ indicated that challenges in this regard are the result of donors' inability to fund government efforts directly because of internal regulations. There are instances in which an agency can support government as part of a joint program.⁶⁵ The lack of decentralized government funding to carry out such activities means that there is a notable shortfall to implement the needed activities to address child labor and forced labor in communities.

A few interviewed stakeholders did mention that there was an increased recognition—including among bilateral and international agencies, and the private sector—that local government offices should be more supported financially with logistics to implement child labor and forced labor reduction efforts. This was particularly true with regard to logistics to reach communities. Consequently, some nonstate actors were investigating ways to provide material and financial support for this purpose without supplanting the role of governments to finance such actions.

In the meantime, discussions persist about whether various donors should finance government initiatives on child labor and forced labor at the local level. Although support for birth registration is being financed for Côte d'Ivoire, 66 there is still a need to enhance the capacity of the social welfare and justice systems to provide accessible and responsive services to children and families. Governance of child labor reduction efforts at the local government level also needs more focus on supporting logistics to enable social workers, education inspectors, labor inspectors, trainers, agricultural extension officers, and other staff to work with community members. All these same stakeholders would be involved with the identification, remediation, follow-up and monitoring of cases of child labor and forced labor.

4.2.3 Data Collection and Management

As stated in the repository report *List of Progress Indicators and Supporting Narrative*,⁶⁷ lack of coordination across quantitative and qualitative data collection and storage efforts continues to create a challenge. Currently, national databases⁶⁸ in the two countries to trace, collect, and analyze cases of child labor and forced labor are not fully functioning across all the geographic areas of the countries.

⁶⁴ Including Zegers, M. C. R., & Ayenor, G. K. (2021, June). *Ending child labour*. European Commission.

 $^{^{65}}$ One stakeholder from an organization interviewed pointed this out.

⁶⁶ Entering education is required in Côte d'Ivoire but not in Ghana.

⁶⁷ Zegers, M. et al. (2023). Repository of Progress Indicators and Supporting Narrative. Report in preparation

⁶⁸ These are the *Système d'Observation et de Suivi du Travail des Enfants en Côte d'Ivoire* (SOSTECI) and a database in the Ghana Child Labor Unit.

Some research interviewees did note that there had been some improvements in terms of data sharing among implementing agencies/offices, but overall, this was still considered far from sufficient for adequate monitoring and planning at a local government and national level.

Various actors were found⁶⁹ to collect data for different purposes but did still not appear to sufficiently coordinate these efforts. Implementers collect data to measure the effectiveness of their initiatives. International agencies—for example, UNICEF, ILO, and the FAO—study and analyze access to relevant services. International NGOs implement various studies on different aspects related to issues surrounding child labor and forced labor. However, the extent to which these efforts are unified in a common system at the international and national levels to track progress is still unclear.

The development of improved use of data that are collected to inform government strategies and action plans constitutes a special gap. These strategies and plans, then, need to be translated into initiatives of government and nonstate actors who implement actions related to child labor and forced labor reduction. The need to go beyond data gathering and ensure that lessons learned, implementation challenges identified, and good practices are actually used to inform future efforts was a point repeatedly identified throughout the research. While there are various platforms where stakeholders meet, the concrete use of data still needs greater attention using methodologically appropriate means.

Additional details regarding gaps to address data collection and knowledge management are covered in the *Repository of Progress Indicators and Supporting Narrative*⁷⁰ report.

4.3 Advocacy, Awareness Raising, and Behavior Change Communications

Advocacy to better overcome challenges that impede successful reduction of child labor and forced labor is increasing somewhat, particularly among workers' organizations and FBOs. There are also some more efforts⁷¹ to raise the awareness of consumers that higher prices for chocolate products are necessary to help cover the higher cost of fair-trade cocoa products.

Representatives of workers' organizations and FBOs stated during interviews that they were also increasingly involved in awareness raising among their membership. They stated firmly that they could do much more if provided with the financial support to do so. As one FBO representative noted,

⁶⁹ This was noted in documents consulted in the literature review, interviews, and study workshops.

⁷⁰ Zegers, M. et al. (2023). Repository of Progress Indicators and Supporting Narrative. Report in preparation

⁷¹ E.g., by OXFAM, Tony's Chocolonely, various fair-trade organizations.

"I have also suffered and almost lost my life. I can show the damage to my finger which was almost cut off. I can show them my scars. This means we are well placed to convince people of the dangers of child labor."

FBO representatives also added that they could be more direct and clearer with people than outsiders could be. According to interviewees, progress had been made to use different awareness-raising formats ranging from community-centered methods to general media, like radio or even some social media. However, some research has shown that the way the information is presented in the media could be improved to increase awareness and understanding of the issues.⁷² There is a limited amount of attention in awareness-raising materials to reporting cases of child labor and forced labor and the way to use grievance mechanisms.

Some interviewees pointed out that there would always be a need to continue to adapt advocacy and awareness on the issues over the medium term because the context keeps changing. There is no single means of raising awareness that will always be suitable.

4.4 Labor Monitoring, Remediation, Traceability, and Certification Systems and (CLMRS, FLMRS), Child Protection

Although there are increases in coverage of CLMRS or other community-based methods to reduce child labor across different cocoa value chains, there are still some aspects that need attention. These aspects are linked to challenges in measuring coverage of child labor reduction initiatives, the effectiveness of different approaches, financial, time, effort, and other resource cost of methods, and accuracy in determining actual reduction in child labor in practice.

A particular comment that several stakeholders raised in interviews was that achieving coverage of all households with child labor, at risk for child labor, or linked to forced labor was challenging. With regard to child labor, the cost of implementing the CLMRS with its individual case identification approach was cited several times as possibly inefficient, which could impede attaining full coverage of all children in or at risk for child labor.

Various stakeholder interviewees estimated that, on average, only about one third of cocoa communities were covered with active initiatives and/or systems so far. However, because of different methods to measure coverage, no overall scientifically valid assessment of community coverage has yet been made.

26 | AIR.ORG

⁷² At least in the case of Ghana, where articles between 2000 and 2020 tended to focus on quantification and used technical jargon to dazzle readers as opposed to helping readers understand the issues and the ways in which they could be addressed. Okali, K., Boamah, E. F., & Sumberg, J. (2022). The quantification of child labour by Ghana's mass media: A missed opportunity? *Africa Spectrum*, *57*(2), 155–177. https://doi.org/10.1177/00020397221096166

Several interviewees and a range of documents also pointed out that it was very difficult to accurately determine the number of households with children engaged in cocoa production. These interviewees mentioned that double counting can be an issue because there might be two or more agencies—and/or cooperatives⁷³—active in carrying out activities with cocoa-producing households in a community. For example, the German Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa (GISCO) reported,

The total number of farming households being covered by CLMRS or a comparative system was 1,028,969. However, there is a likelihood of double counting in the data. Further, it is important to point out that the reported number of children that received support is higher than the number of children identified that year. This is a result of the fact that children are in support systems for longer than one year while cases of child labor are identified annually.⁷⁴

Likewise, representatives from the Dutch Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa (DISCO)⁷⁵ reported identifying significant progress on the rollout for CLMRS. However, they added that it was unclear how this related to entire cocoa volumes and households covered to reach DISCO objectives.

Another continuing challenge that was cited was the implementation of CLMRS or similar methods through workers' organizations or FBOs. Although associating these groups with efforts to eliminate child labor was considered important and useful, limiting CLMRS in a community to members of such groups meant that not all children/forced laborers might be covered.

Finally, some interviewees commented on the fact that not all CLMRS data collectors understood and reported correctly on the number of children identified, withdrawn from, and/or prevented from child labor. Different agencies used somewhat different definitions, and some monitoring agents had not fully understood the definitions. According to the interviewees, some might find data collection cumbersome because of the lack of transport, available time for their other duties, or ability to find the child identified at the first CLMRS stage. Thus, service providers did not systematically follow up on all cases. This had an impact on the usefulness of indicators that relied on follow-up to determine whether a child had been successfully supported through CLMRS to avoid working in hazardous cocoa labor.

⁷³ As one interviewee reported, the presence of several cocoa cooperatives in a community made counting households difficult. It is unclear who was included where without in-depth community mapping, which is a costly exercise.

⁷⁴ Buama, M. et al. (2022. *Monitoring Report 2021*. Forum *Nachhaltiger Kakao e.V.* (German Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa), p. 15.

⁷⁵ Dutch Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa (DISCO; 2022). Annual report 2021. Sustainable Trade Initiative (IDH).

4.4.1 Landscape Approaches to Include Integrated Area-Based Approaches and Child-Labor-Free Zones

While donors, including those in the private sector, continue to support CLMRS type methods, they are increasingly oriented toward implementing more general community development approaches that are mixed with a child protection focus. The point raised was that using a more general approach that focused more on supporting all vulnerable children—who might be in or at risk for child labor—might be more effective and efficient. The documentation and several stakeholder interviewees stressed their belief that taking a broader landscape approach that includes IABA/CLFZ in specific locations and that integrates various approaches was the most important way forward.

Combining CLMRS with a child-protection-systems approach is already being implemented in many initiatives. Links to official government child protection systems are part of the effort where a child protection office is already functioning. The advantage of child protection approaches is that this provides a framework for community participation. Child-protection-systems approaches also recognize that children may be engaged in child labor, exploited, abused, and/or neglected so that their well-being is multidimensionally affected. Other aspects that fall under the child protection heading include ensuring that children have birth certificates and can access justice, and that children with disabilities have support. All these are reasons for private-sector companies to state that they are increasingly moving toward methods to address child labor that are centered in child protection systems.

At the same time, these stakeholders also note that there is still much uncertainty regarding which initiatives, or combination of initiatives, are most helpful for reducing child labor. Research has shown that CLMRS can help reduce child labor if intensively and well implemented.⁷⁷ However, the research conducted to date has focused on assessing different types of efforts and/or identifying good practices, as opposed to evaluating different combinations of approaches. Some stakeholders further stated that context is also important; what works in one situation may not work as well at a different time and/or place. A community may already have a functioning VSLA set up, a well-organized cocoa cooperative, and benefits from past economic diversification- and literacy-focused initiatives. Or a community may be very far from a quality primary school, with local cocoa crops highly impacted by crop pests or depleted soil. All factors were said to have different effects on a local community and its situation.

⁷⁶ Children with disabilities may also be engaged in child labor if they are physically able to carry out work (e.g., children with hearing challenges, mild cognitive disabilities, facial disfigurement).

⁷⁷ E.g., ICI. (2021). Effectiveness review of Child Labour Monitoring and Remediation Systems in the West African cocoa sector. ICI; Bureau of Integrated Rural Development, Kwame Nkrumah University of Science (KNUST). (2022). An assessment of Child Labor Monitoring and Remediation Systems (CLMRS) in three selected cocoa cooperatives in Ashanti Region: Final report. KNUST College of Agriculture and Natural Resources; Winrock International.

Landscape Approach. The landscape method is a format adapted from approaches to addressing other challenges, including deforestation. There is a lack of a universal definition for a landscape approach, though in the literature, landscape approaches have been refined from focusing solely on conservation and physical space to including social, economic, and environmental objectives and serve as cross-sectoral approaches to promote sustainability. Representation and physical space to including social, economic, and environmental objectives and serve as cross-sectoral approaches to promote sustainability. Representation approaches consist of multistakeholder collaborations that engage stakeholders within a delimited geographic area to attain defined development goals. The landscape approaches are broad, can include many aspects to reduce CL/FL, and may include general development initiatives, such as road construction, to facilitate transport of cocoa-related inputs and outputs, and also local government service provision to communities. The Koninklijk Instituut voor de Tropen, or the Royal Tropical Institute (KIT) and ICI are collaborating to map existing initiatives that have taken measures to address child labor in West Africa, using a landscape approach. The results were expected in the last quarter of 2023. Some case studies of landscape approaches appear in a review that KIT published.

Integrated Area-Based Approach (IABA)/Child Labor Free Zone (CLFZ). The IABA consists of a program of interventions in a specific geographical area that seeks to eliminate child labor by involving local communities in dialogue and cooperation with government, employers' and workers' organizations, and others. With the IABA, multiple stakeholders provide different interventions to address child labor with a focus on root causes.⁸³ The IABA is different from sector-based or piecemeal approaches and instead integrates interventions focused on labor,

⁷⁸ Sayer J, Sunderland T, Ghazoul J, Pfund J-L, Sheil D, Meijaard E, Venter M, Boedhihartono AK, Day M, Garcia C, Van Oosten C, Buck LE. (2013). Ten principles for a landscape approach to reconciling agriculture, conservation, and other competing land uses. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*. 110:8349-8356.

https://www.pnas.org/doi/epdf/10.1073/pnas.1210595110

⁷⁹ Reed J, Deakin L, Sunderland T. (2014). What are 'Integrated Landscape Approaches' and how effectively have they been implemented in the tropics: a systemic map protocol. *Environmental Evidence*. 4:2.

https://environmentalevidencejournal.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/2047-2382-4-2

⁸⁰ IDH. (2023). How landscape approaches can tackle deforestation and shape the future of sustainable supply chains: The case of the cocoa sector. https://www.idhsustainabletrade.com/news/how-landscape-approaches-can-tackle-deforestation-and-shape-the-future-of-sustainable-supply-chains-the-case-of-the-cocoa-

sector/#:~:text=Landscape%20approaches%20refer%20to%20multi,sustainability%20performance%20in%20that%20area ISEAL Alliance. (2022). Effective company actions in landscapes and jurisdictions. *Guiding Practices, 1.0.* ISEAL Alliance. ⁸¹ KIT. (2023). The potential of landscape approaches for addressing child labour in sustainability programmes in the cocoa sector. KIT. https://www.kit.nl/project/the-potential-of-landscape-approaches-for-addressing-child-labour-in-sustainability-programmes-in-the-cocoa-sector/

⁸² KIT. (2023). The potential of landscape approaches for addressing child labour in sustainability programmes in the cocoa sector. KIT. https://www.kit.nl/project/the-potential-of-landscape-approaches-for-addressing-child-labour-in-sustainability-programmes-in-the-cocoa-sector/

⁸³ ILO-IPEC. (2013). Integrated area-based approach as a strategy for laying foundations for child labour-free zones: A case of Busia, Kilifi, and Kitui Districts in Kenya. ILO Country Office for the United Republic of Tanzania, Kenya, Rwanda and Uganda, Dar es Salaam.

rights, community livelihoods, and decent work perspectives.⁸⁴ In focusing on root causes and integrated interventions instead of sector-based approaches, the IABA addresses the risk of displacement where children may end work in one sector but move to working in another sector. The CLFZ concept is included within the IABA and is aimed at establishing child-labor-free villages and districts that can serve as models for scaling up in other communities and districts. The IABA approach with child labor free zones is currently being implemented in Ghana.⁸⁵

The IABA-CLFZ and the landscape approach are similar, in the sense that they take a more comprehensive systems approach to addressing child labor and causal issues. The landscape approach is broader, involving a broad geographic area compared to the IABA-CLFZ targeting a specific geographic area such as a district. While both approaches aim to combat child labor, the landscape approach takes a more holistic view by considering the broader context, for example, it may include many aspects to reduce CL/FL such as improving roads to decrease cocoa transportation costs, and health services for farmers, while the IABA-CLFZ has a more local and targeted approach and focuses on specific geographic areas to tailor interventions. As an international interviewee pointed out, collaboration with the national authorities is essential for these methods to work since both approaches are centered in ensuring rural development. Without sufficient rural development, the context will never be conducive to attaining the ultimate goal of eliminating child labor and forced labor.

Financing a landscape approach and/or IABA-CLFZ is a challenge, however. According to interviewees, the role of the state, particularly at the local government level, needs to be strengthened to be able to adequately implement a landscape approach. There is a gap between the demand for private companies to demonstrate that their value chains are child labor and forced labor free and the adoption of a landscape approach and/or an IABA-CLFZ which requires that areas are free from all forms of child labor. As one stakeholder indicated, "You cannot request the cocoa companies to be responsible for more than their value chain," although at least one company reported reaching out beyond their value chain, opting to use an integrated area-based approach. The landscape approach inherently requires interventions of multistakeholder financial and other inputs. Thus, the country governments, donors such as the United States and EU governments, should also provide funds to support the implementation of this approach. Discussions about the way this may be realized are currently underway but not yet publicized.

⁸⁴ ILO-IPEC. (2013). Promoting Child Labour Free Zones (CLFZs) through an Integrated Area-Based Approach (IABA) – IPEC

⁸⁵ Ofori Agyeman, E. (2023), Protocols and guidelines for the establishment of child labour free zones. Labour Department, Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations, Ghana.

4.4.2 Certification and Traceability

Certification of cocoa beans as free of child labor and forced labor during the production process and free of environmental degradation remains an important objective. The process of certification is an important mechanism that contributes to ensuring that human rights and environmental sustainability are respected in cocoa value chains.

As Belgium's Beyond Chocolate Annual Report⁸⁶ indicated, traceability of cocoa beans can be difficult because batches of cocoa can be mixed during shipping and manufacturing processes, thereby complicating transparency in delivering on commitments related to living incomes and deforestation. In fact, some national stakeholders in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana also mentioned that bags of cocoa beans could also be mixed before and during transport within their countries. Mixing may occur for any number of reasons. It may be to hide the source of the cocoa because of price variations between the two countries and cocoa's being illegally transported across the border. Mixing may also occur to hide fair trade certification transgressions, with noncertified beans mixed with cocoa beans from certified farmers. While this challenge not only applies to fair trade beans, it is a particular challenge when beans are claimed and certified to be "fair trade."

Other challenges continue with regard to traceability, such as the difficulty of establishing with certainty that there has been no child labor and forced labor for cocoa which has been traced even to the farm level. In many cases, because of distances to cocoa farms, consistent auditing and monitoring/reporting of child labor and forced labor among farmer groups is difficult and expensive. In addition, if farmers are aware that auditing in the field is occurring, the quick disappearance of children into the surrounding forests is possible. As a result, a farm may be labeled as absent of child labor and forced labor although in fact it is using the prohibited workforce. Nevertheless, some companies, such as Tony's Chocolonely, make special efforts to audit, using random sampling and investing in ensuring carefully unannounced audits of farms.

4.5 General Education/Vocational Skills

Although there have been many efforts over the last few years to increase access to schools in cocoa-producing areas, there is still a large gap. Although the percentage of school enrollment is reported to be high in Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire, 87 there were perceptions among implementing

⁸⁶ IDH, Beyond Chocolate, Belgium Partner in Development (2022), Beyond Chocolate Annual Report 2021. Utrecht: IDH, Beyond Chocolate, Belgium Partner in Development.

⁸⁷ NORC (October 2020), Assessing Progress in Reducing Child Labor in Cocoa Production in Cocoa Growing Areas of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana Final Report, Chicago: NORC. According to the report, "92 percent of children in the 5-11 age group were attending school overall in 2018/19, including 88 percent in Côte d'Ivoire and 99 percent in Ghana. In the 12-14 age group in

agencies and communities in more distant and isolated areas that younger children have difficulties accessing education consistently and there were challenges for older children to access post-primary education. According to interviewees, workshop attendees, and project implementers⁸⁸ distances to schools, security concerns regarding travel to schools, poor infrastructure, and quality of education remain key challenges.⁸⁹

Efforts to address access to education for children have increased over the course of the last few years. These include the Millennium Challenge Compact for Cocoa Productivity and Livelihoods (MCC4CPPL).⁹⁰ This program aims to promote educational opportunities for children, improve livelihoods for cocoa farmers, and strengthen governance in the cocoa sector.

The Jacobs Foundation is spearheading an initiative called "Transforming Education in Côte d'Ivoire (TRECC)" to improve education in cocoa-producing communities in Côte d'Ivoire. ⁹¹ This program aims to enhance the quality of education, empower women, and reduce child labor in rural areas. Another major education related effort is the Child Learning and Education Facility (CLEF) that was launched in 2021 to improve education access for 5 million children in Côte d'Ivoire (discussed further in Section 5.14 under Multistakeholder Platforms). ⁹² Efforts to increase access to technical and vocational education and skills training (TVEST) have also continued. There are, however, still notable gaps in the availability of TVEST that is appropriate to the local labor market, including on farming techniques. The aging population of farmers in both countries forms a challenge for the sustainable production of cocoa in the future; the average age of farmers in Ghana is currently 55. ⁹³ Stakeholders found a notable disconnect between older children's (16-18 years of age) low interest in farming and their desire to learn other types of trades for which there is less demand in the labor market. One stakeholder even

https://www.clefpartnership.com/en/our-mission/

Jacobs Foundation. (n.d.). CLEF—Child Learning and Education Facility. Jacobs Foundation.

https://jacobsfoundation.org/activity/clef-elan/

^{2018/19, 93} percent of children were attending school in aggregate, including 89 percent in Côte d'Ivoire and 98 in Ghana. Finally, in the 15-17 age group 77 percent of children were attending school in aggregate, including 66 percent in Côte d'Ivoire and 89 percent in Ghana." However, counterintuitively, there was a higher prevalence of child labor among agricultural households in cocoa producing areas Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana in 2018/19 who were attending school than among those not attending school (65% and 50% respectively).

⁸⁸ ICI (2018), Lack of education is at the root of youth issues in cocoa-growing communities.

https://www.cocoainitiative.org/news/lack-education-root-youth-issues-cocoa-growing-communities

⁸⁹ Fountain, A., & Huetz-Adams, F. (2022). Cocoa barometer 2022. Voice Network. https://cocoabarometer.org/en/

⁹⁰ Millennium Challenge Corporation (2023), Available from https://www.mcc.gov/where-we-work/program/cote-divoire-compact/

⁹¹ Jacobs Foundation (Undated), Transforming Education in Côte d' Ivoire (TRECC), https://jacobsfoundation.org/activity/trecc-transforming-education-cocoa-communities/

⁹² Child Learning and Education Facility (CLEF; n.d.). Child Learning and Education Facility. CLEF.

⁹³ E.g., Ministry of Food and Agriculture, Ghana. (2021). *Youth in agriculture*. Ministry of Food and Agriculture, Ghana. https://mofa.gov.gh/site/programmes/youth-in-

cited the fact that all the efforts to keep children from child labor in cocoa has a side effect of their being even less interested in entering into this type of work later.

4.6 Improved Technologies, Occupational Safety, and Health

Work related accidents and illnesses for adults and children alike continue because hazardous work conditions, tools, and equipment still form major challenges. Adult absences from work due to health challenges can increase reliance on children. Less hazardous working conditions can contribute to increased opportunities for older children to work in acceptable conditions without being identified as engaging in hazardous child labor.

Government, national and international research institutions, and the private sector have continued working on improving production technologies since 2019. This includes the development of tools and equipment that improve occupational safety and health. Such improvements can contribute to higher production efficiency and safer working conditions for older children and adults alike. Older children can engage in cocoa production if it is hazard free and meets other child-labor-free requirements.

Some stakeholders reported the need for protective clothing and shoes. Simultaneously, they stated that there was a need for research on the most comfortable—climate adapted—clothing and shoes to ensure that they would actually be used. Field observations have already indicated, for example, that heavy, hot protective shoes are unlikely to be worn.

4.7 Health and Other Services

Access to health services and other social services remains a large problem for many cocoa communities, which are often underserved. Because of the interrelationship between poor health and poverty, which in turn affects dependence on children and/or forced labor, it is surprising that this issue is still receiving little support. There are some efforts under social protection schemes to improve access to health insurance, but if health services are difficult to reach, the problem is only partially solved.

The difficulties of social welfare staff being able to carry out their work in many communities because of lack of transport and other logistics should be considered. The implementation of an effective landscape approach that is mostly based on government services (as it is in consumer countries) remains a far-away goal if the lack of national financial resources continues.

4.8 Extent to Which the Interventions Address the Needs of Vulnerable and Marginalized Groups

Most of the interventions over the last few years do include a focus on identifying vulnerable households, which are at greater risk for relying on child labor. These groups include people living

in extreme poverty, youth, women, elderly people, people with disabilities, and people living with HIV or affected by HIV in the household.

Some producer government development agencies and private-sector companies have increased focus on women cocoa producers. This includes supporting women already working in cocoa production or wishing to do so and helping ensure their participation in decision making on issues that affect them and their communities. Several interviewees pointed out that they preferred including a strong focus on women cocoa farmers and in farmer household savings and credit schemes. In these interviewees' qualitative experience, there were benefits to including and supporting women, given the interest in reducing child labor and ensuring that children accessed education.

5. Synthesis of Efforts of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana **Governments, Industry, International Development** Partners (including U.S. Government), and Workers' Organizations to Address Child Labor and Forced Labor in the Cocoa Sectors in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire

There are clear overlapping complexities in the landscape of efforts being made to address child labor and forced labor in the cocoa value chain. This report cannot, unfortunately, cover all the many plans, initiatives, and knowledge management efforts that are being undertaken but will highlight important examples.

As was discussed in previous sections, many of the challenges that impede successful efforts to reduce child labor and forced labor are because of poor physical infrastructure, including access to education and health, poor roads, and the inadequate technical and logistical capacities of service providers. Together with poverty reduction in cocoa growing areas, comprehensive rural development will help improve the success rates of initiatives addressing child labor and forced labor.

5.1 Governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana

The governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana are central actors for addressing the challenges of reducing child labor and forced labor among their citizens and are doing so through multiple approaches and collaborations. The governments collaborate with international development agencies—including those funded by USDOL—the United Nations, international NGOs, the EU, and those implementing bilaterally funded programming. National NGOs and civil society organizations such as those representing workers and employers also partner with the responsible agencies within their governments. Information about government involvement in programming at national and local levels is covered throughout this report. Here we summarize the main national-level government offices. The offices that address child labor and forced labor and their activities are further detailed in the USDOL-ILAB's annual reports on each of the countries.

The Côte d'Ivoire government implements specific programs for reducing child labor and is increasing emphasis on forced labor, including as a result of human trafficking. Nevertheless, there is still scope to increase attention—in terms of planning, implementation, and monitoring of initiatives—to these issues, particularly with regard to forced labor.

The Comité National de Surveillance des Actions de Lutte Contre la Traite, l'Exploitation et le Travail des Enfants (National Committee for Monitoring Actions to Combat Trafficking, Exploitation, and Child Labor; CNS) was established in 2011.94 The CNS is responsible for proposing, initiating, and monitoring the application of conventions on child trafficking and the worst forms of child labor. 95 The CNS further monitors the implementation of government-run initiatives and those of other actors in the fight against child trafficking and the worst forms of child labor.

The Comité interministériel de lutte contre la traite, l'exploitation et le travail des enfants (CIM; Interministerial Committee in the Fight Against Child Trafficking, Child Exploitation, and Child Labor) is the body that defines, validates, coordinates, and evaluates the various programs of the development partners. 96 The Minister of Employment and Social Protection chairs the committee, and the Minister of Women, Family and Children is the vice-chair.

The government implements the Système d'Observation et de Suivi du Travail des Enfants en Côte d'Ivoire (SOSTECI; Child Labor Observation and Monitoring System in Côte d'Ivoire) from national to local level.⁹⁷ This system focuses on the downstream implementation, data collection, summarizing, and analyzing of statistical information on child labor. Any agencies implementing initiatives on child labor are expected to share the data on their activities with the SOSTECI, so that the data can be used to add to the national database and inform planning of future programming. Government interviewees stressed their belief that this system was not just to gather data but to actually use it and, for this reason, stated that all implementers should participate.

Other associated offices and various other ministries include the Ministry of National Education, Technical Education and Vocational Training; Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development; Ministry of the Interior and Security; Ministry of Justice and Human Rights; Ministry of Commerce and Crafts; and the Ministry of Water and Forests. The Sous-Direction de la Police Judiciaire en charge de la Lutte contre la Traite des Enfants et la Délinquance Juvénile (Subdirectorate of the Judicial Police in Charge of the Fight Against Child Trafficking and Juvenile Delinquency) is also engaged. In addition, specific border patrol units have been established through the central government to verify human trafficking, including in cocoa. Further, a new brigade is responsible for local control and surveillance in the 13 regional delegations of the Conseil du Café Cacao.

The Conseil du Café Cacao is a government agency that plays a central role in regulating and overseeing the production, marketing, and export of coffee and cocoa. Areas of focus include

⁹⁴ CNS. (n.d.). Accueil, plan d'action, notre mission. CNS. https://travaildesenfants.org/fr/pages/notre-mission

⁹⁶ CNS. (n.d.). Le nouveau cadre institutionnel. CNS. https://travaildesenfants.org/fr/content/le-nouveau-cadre-institutionnel

⁹⁷ CNS. (n.d.). SOSTECI. CNS. https://travaildesenfants.org/fr/dossier/sosteci

price regulation and quality control. Further, the Conseil engages in export control such as issuing export licenses, overseeing export volumes, and negotiating contracts with international buyers. The Conseil du Café Cacao oversees fair revenue distribution among the various stakeholders, including farmers and the government. Finally, the Conseil implements programs to support coffee and cocoa farmers, including initiatives aimed at improving farming practices, increasing productivity, and promoting environmental sustainability while also promoting the reduction of child labor and forced labor.

The Côte d'Ivoire Prime Minister's Office coordinates the *Stratégie Nationale Cacao Durable* (National Sustainable Cocoa Strategy) 2020–2030, which addresses deforestation, the elimination of child labor and forced labor in cocoa production, and improved incomes for cocoa producers. ⁹⁸

The Government of Ghana's Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations' Child Labour Unit is the coordinator of the National Steering Committee on Child Labour. The committee is responsible for the overall development, coordination, implementation, and supervision of the country's National Plans for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour. This includes the development of a new national plan, which is almost completed as of the writing of this report. Further, the Child Labour Unit coordinates the technical capacity strengthening of government staff on issues such as on the establishment of CLFZ in cocoa areas and local government service providers.

As in Côte d'Ivoire, there are a range of ministries associated with addressing the challenges regarding reduction of child labor and forced labor. In addition to the Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations, there is the Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection; Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development's District Assemblies; Ministry of Interior; Ministry of Education; Ministry of Food and Agriculture; Ministry of Land and Natural Resources; and others.

The Human Trafficking Management Board⁹⁹ is the interministerial committee that advises the Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection on antitrafficking policy, promotes and oversees prevention efforts, and facilitates the protection and reintegration of trafficking victims. This includes domestic and cross-border trafficking of children for labor.

The Ghana Cocoa Board (COCOBOD) plays a central role in Ghana's cocoa industry by facilitating the production, processing, and marketing of good-quality cocoa, coffee, and shea nuts in all

37 | AIR.ORG

⁹⁸ Portail Officiel du Gouvernement de Côte d'Ivoire. (2022). Durabilité du cacao: La team Europe mobilise 450 millions d'euros pour appuyer la stratégie de la Côte d'Ivoire. Bureau of International Labor Affairs Portail Officiel du Gouvernement de Côte d'Ivoire. https://www.gouv.ci/_actualite-article.php?recordID=14153

⁹⁹ E.g., USDOL, Bureau of International Labor Affairs. (2022–2023). *Child labor and forced labor reports: Ghana*. USDOL, Bureau of International Labor Affairs https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/resources/reports/child-labor/ghana

forms in the most efficient and cost-effective manner. ¹⁰⁰ COCOBOD is oriented toward ensuring fair prices for cocoa farmers and promoting the sustainable growth of the cocoa sector. COCOBOD is responsible for setting the farm gate price for cocoa in Ghana, which directly affects the income of cocoa farmers. The board has a social responsibility program that includes building schools and providing computers and scholarships annually to older children for agriculture education. Awareness raising on the elimination of child labor, and promotion of farmer pension schemes (social protection) are also included in COCOBOD's sustainability program.

5.2 USDOL-ILAB

The initiatives that USDOL supports are covered in various sections of this report and summarized here. The U.S. Department of Labor publishes annual reports on the status of child labor and human trafficking. ¹⁰¹ USDOL is the lead convener of the CLCCG.

USDOL has financed numerous projects to address child labor in cocoa. There are several current projects that focus on issues related to child labor and forced labor: the Verité¹⁰² FLIP project on forced labor identification, two projects on strengthening of cooperatives with a focus on addressing child labor -- one in Côte d'Ivoire implemented with Save the Children and one in Ghana implemented with Winrock.¹⁰³ They are discussed in greater detail in section 5.10 where the role of cooperatives is covered.

The FLIP¹⁰⁴ project aims to enhance efforts in preventing, detecting, and eliminating forced labor and labor trafficking in supply chains by involving law enforcement, private sector monitors, social service and civil society organizations, workers' unions, and workers themselves. The main focus is on several supply chains, notably: Ghana's cocoa, palm oil, and gold mining sectors and Côte d'Ivoire's cocoa and coffee sector. Utilizing an ILO-developed indicator-based framework, stakeholders have a common language and set of indicators to coordinate anti child labor and forced labor initiatives. The project extends existing efforts on combating child labor in cocoa to include forced labor. Through educational resources, training

¹⁰⁰ COCOBOD. (n.d.). *About COCOBOD: Poised to maintain Ghana's premium quality cocoa*. https://cocobod.gh/about-us. COCOBOD

 ¹⁰¹ USDOL, Bureau of International Labor Affairs (2022-2023), Child Labor and Forced Labor Reports: Ghana. Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/resources/reports/child-labor/ghana. USDOL, Bureau of International Labor Affairs
 102 Verité (2023), Forced Labor Indicators Project (FLIP) in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. Available from: https://verite.org/forced-labor-indicators-project/. Website accessed February 20, 2023.

¹⁰³ In Côte d'Ivoire, it is the CACAO, Cooperatives Addressing Child Labor Accountability Outcomes project from 2020-2025. USDOL, ILAB (Undated), Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/cacao-cooperatives-addressing-child-labor-accountability-outcomes.In Ghana it is the 2020-2024 MATE MASIE project – Making Advances to Eliminate Child Labor in More Areas with Sustainable Integrated Efforts. USDOL, ILAB (Undated), MATE MASIE project. Available from https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/mate-masie-making-advances-eliminate-child-labor-more-areas-sustainable-integrated ¹⁰⁴ USDOL, ILAB (Undated), Combating Forced Labor and Labor Trafficking of Adults and Children in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire (FLIP) (2016-2023), Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/combating-forced-labor-and-labor-trafficking-adults-and-children-ghana-and-cote

sessions, and consultations on integrating forced labor indicators, the project contributes to a standardized framework. Partners gather updated data on forced labor indicators to develop and implement a joint monitoring approach. By aligning national and regional data efforts between Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire, the project aims to establish a scalable and coordinated model for monitoring and enforcement.

Other past projects that USDOL has funded in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana are the:

- The Adwuma Pa project in Ghana was implemented with CARE. 105 The project focused on reducing the risk of child labor and forced labor and other exploitative labor practices through improving the economic participation and empowerment of women and adolescent girls in cocoa-producing communities. The project offered specific education and training to lower the risk of child labor, forced labor, and other labor rights issues. This was expected to enhance their earning potential, empower workers to speak up, and boost their participation in the labor force.
- Eliminating Child Labor in Cocoa (ECLIC) in Côte d'Ivoire implemented with ICI from 2015-2019. The ECLIC project focus was on the establishment and implementation of Community Action Plans (CAPs) aimed at addressing child labor locally in cocoa-growing communities; ensuring cocoa-growing communities are well-informed and comprehend child labor issues, and provision of children involved in or vulnerable to child labor with access to educational opportunities.
- Mobilizing Community Action and Promoting Opportunities for Youth in Ghana's Cocoa-Growing Communities (MOCA) (2015-2019) implemented with Winrock. 107 The project focus was on cocoa communities to action plans against child labor and implement, support at-risk youth to learn skills needed for jobs, support transition to decent work jobs, and deliver livelihood services and Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) training to households.
- Towards Child Labor Free Cocoa Growing Communities in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana through an Integrated Area Based Approach (Cocoa Communities Project, CCP) (2010-2015), implemented with the ILO. ¹⁰⁸

¹⁰⁵ USDOL-ILAB (Undated), Adwuma Pa, Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/adwuma-pa

¹⁰⁶ USDOL, ILAB (Undated), Eliminating Child Labor in Cocoa (ECLIC). Available from:

https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/eliminating-child-labor-cocoa-eclic-0

¹⁰⁷ USDOL, ILAB (Undated), Mobilizing Community Action and Promoting Opportunities for Youth in Ghana's Cocoa-Growing Communities (MOCA). Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/mobilizing-community-action-and-promotingopportunities-youth-ghanas-cocoa-growing-0

¹⁰⁸ USDOL, ILAB (Undated), CAPSA - Capacity Strengthening of Governments to Address Child Labor and/or Forced Labor, and Violations of Acceptable Conditions of Work in Sub-Saharan Africa. Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/capsacapacity-strengthening-governments-address-child-labor-and or-forced-labor-and

• Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labor in West Africa by Strengthening Sub-Regional Cooperation Through ECOWAS.¹⁰⁹ This project was implemented from 2009-2014 and included Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, and Nigeria. Though it did not have a specialized focus on cocoa, its activities were relevant to child labor reduction overall in the three countries. Developing monitoring systems to be used across ECOWAS countries was a main objective. Further it focused on developing or strengthening National Action Plans against child labor and reviewing and updating hazardous child labor laws in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire.

5.3 U.S. Department of Security, Customs and Border Protection

U.S. Customs and Border Protection enforces Section 307 of the Tariff Act of 1930 (19 U.S.C. 307), ¹¹⁰ which prohibits the importation of products made with forced labor and indentured child labor. The Congressional Research Service published a report of the range of challenges that impede the implementation of prohibitions of the importation of cocoa and other products imported into the United States. ¹¹¹ The analysis in the report examined how U.S. Customs and Border Protection's processes, trends, and key issues regarding enforcement of 19 U.S.C. 1307. The report further notes that "traceability can be particularly difficult for agricultural commodities, such as cocoa and cotton." ¹¹² One research interviewee noted that the new EU Due Diligence requirements bring the attention of all countries and the entire cocoa industry to developing more comprehensive, effective measures to reduce indentured child labor and forced labor and to better traceability for ensuring child labor and forced labor-free cocoa beans.

5.4 United States Agency for International Development and United States Department of State's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons

In the past, USAID has collaborated with the private sector on efforts to address child labor in cocoa. This includes the 2007–2014 Empowering Cocoa Households with Opportunities & Education Alliance between USAID and the World Cocoa Foundation (WCF) cocoa and chocolate companies. The goal of the alliance was to expand opportunities for youth and young adults

¹⁰⁹ USDOL-ILAB (Undated), Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labor in West Africa by Strengthening Sub-Regional Cooperation Through ECOWAS. Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/eliminating-worst-forms-child-labor-west-africa-strengthening-sub-regional

¹¹⁰ US Customs and Border Protection (n.d.). Forced Labor, Available from: https://www.cbp.gov/trade/forced-labor. US Customs and Border Protection.

¹¹¹ Congressional Research Service (2021), Section 307 and U.S. Imports of Products of Forced Labor: Overview and Issues for Congress Updated February 1, 2021. Washington, D.C.: Congressional Research Service.

¹¹² Congressional Research Service. (2021). Section 307 and U.S. imports of products of forced labor: Overview and issues for Congress (updated February 1, 2021). Congressional Research Service. P 26.

¹¹³ Government of Côte d'Ivoire, Government of Ghana, U.S. Department of Labor, International Chocolate and Cocoa Industry. (2021). *CLCCG report: 2010–2020 efforts to reduce child labor in cocoa*. United States Department of Labor.

through relevant educational programming in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. Since 2019, USAID has partnered with WCF members Barry Callebaut, Blommer, Cargill, Hershey, Mars, Mondelēz, Nestle, and ofi (formerly Olam) for the implementation of a US\$ 2 million project to support VSLAs.

A few stakeholder interviewees pointed out that USAID's initiatives in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana could be better integrated with USDOL and other donor-financed initiatives on reducing child labor and forced labor — that is, beyond the existing targeted project on VSLAs. This comment was made in the context of the intersection of various USAID rural development programs that could address the vulnerability causes of child labor and forced labor. The interviewees stated that more collaboration and integration of USAID and other possible U.S. government programming would be helpful. An example could be coordination with the 2022–2027 USAID-financed Resilient Ecosystems and Sustainable Transformation of Rural Economies (RESTORE)¹¹⁴ project. The Rainforest Alliance and ofi are implementing the project in cocoa-growing areas to address environmental degradation challenges and increase the incomes of cocoa farmers.

There are relevant U.S. government programs through other agencies, such as the Côte d'Ivoire Child Protection Compact (CPC) partnership between Côte d'Ivoire and the United States. ¹¹⁵ The United States Department of State's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons funds this program together with the Government of Côte d'Ivoire. Because children are also trafficked to work in cocoa, this partnership is of interest. The official launch of was held on September 21, 2023. ¹¹⁶ The collaboration focuses on better coordinating prevention efforts and targeting them across the country including:

- providing protection services that are readily accessible to child trafficking victims using a trauma-informed and victim-centered approach;
- ensuring justice-sector actors utilize existing trafficking-specific legal frameworks to identify child trafficking victims, investigate cases, and prosecute and convict perpetrators of child trafficking in a child-friendly, victim-centered, and traumainformed manner; and
- promoting coordination across relevant ministries, civil society, local communities, and foreign counterparts.¹¹⁷

¹¹⁴ USAID. (2022). Resilient Ecosystems and Sustainable Transformation of Rural Economies (RESTORE) fact sheet. USAID.

¹¹⁵ The United States Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. (2023). Press release. https://www.state.gov/united-states-and-cote-divoire-launch-child-protection-compact-partnership-activities/

¹¹⁶ CNS. (2023). *Toutes les actualités, protection des enfants: La Côte d'Ivoire et les Etats-Unis d'Amérique unissent leurs efforts.* CNS. https://travaildesenfants.org/fr/actualites/protection-des-enfants-la-c-te-d-ivoire-et-les-etats-unis-d-am-rique-unissent-leurs

¹¹⁷ Ibid

The U.S. Department of State's Bureau of International Narcotic and Law Enforcement Affairs West Africa Regional Training Center provides training programs that strengthen the ability of law enforcement personnel from Ghana, Cote D'Ivoire and other countries in West Africa to identify, investigate and prosecute perpetrators of human trafficking and child exploitation using child-friendly, victim-centered, and trauma-informed methods.

5.5 Private-Sector Efforts

The private-sector companies along the value chain start with independent, fair-trade agencies and private cocoa companies. All major cocoa companies partner with other agencies, including as members of ICI, and fund the implementation of CLMRS and other activities to reduce child labor and forced labor. There are many companies that carry out programs to address child labor in particular. This is done through funding the efforts of development agencies and/or their own direct actions in cocoa producer communities. Aside from CLMRS or similar approaches, most of the companies include attention to paying the agreed to premiums to farmers to increase the amount that they earn per volume produced. Further they support income generation support for cocoa producing families, and support for access to education. Some of the main cocoa company programs are briefly summarized below. Many of the companies engage in similar initiatives to reduce child labor and forced labor and our summaries do not exhaustively repeat or cover all of their actions.

Barry Callebaut: Implements initiatives to support farmers, improve livelihoods, and address social and environmental challenges through their **Cocoa Horizons program**. Among other initiatives, training, tools, and resources are provided to increase the productivity and income of farmers. The Cocoa Horizons approach is child-centered and begins at the local level, involving children, parents, families, and community members to empower communities for self-development and lasting change. This approach relies on collaborative action from all stakeholders, involving the creation of community action plans. Cocoa Horizons includes focus on enhancing the capacity of local authorities and farmer groups to support families and community child protection committees to address child labor.

Cargill: Has been working on sustainability efforts through its Cocoa Promise program, including initiatives to address child labor and promote responsible practices among Cargill suppliers. Cargill works in partnership with the International Cocoa initiative (ICI) to raise awareness about the impact of child labor, identify incidents within the supply chain, and implement remediation and prevention activities such as providing access to birth certificates, school kits

¹¹⁸ https://www.barry-callebaut.com/en/group/forever-chocolate/sustainable-range/cocoa/cocoa-horizons

¹¹⁹ https://www.cargill.com/sustainability/cocoa/the-cargill-cocoa-promise

and community schools, as well as strengthening school management and establishing child protection committees.

Ferrero: Implements its **Ferrero Farming Values Cocoa program** to address environmental and child labor and forced labor challenges. ¹²⁰ Ferrero also partners with ICI to implement its initiatives on child labor in cocoa. This includes implementing the Child Labour Monitoring and Remediation System (CLMRS) or similar systems to identify, withdraw and/or prevent child labor in cocoa. 99% of Ferro's dedicated cocoa farmer groups are covered with the CLMRS. Ferrero also supports the building of schools in cocoa production areas.

Hershey's: Implements the **"Cocoa for Good"** program. This program aimed at ensuring sustainable farming methods, elimination of child labor, reforestation and agroforestry, nutrition and health in cocoa-farming, and women's empowerment. The program likewise supports the implementation of CLMRS in cocoa communities. There is also a focus on supporting womencentric Village Savings & Loan Associations and provides job training and support for alternative means of generating income.

Mars: Addresses child labor and promotes sustainable cocoa production. The sustainability program, **Cocoa for Generations**, includes initiatives to improve farmer livelihoods, eradicate child labor, and ensure responsible sourcing. Mars includes a high focus on supporting women farmers.

Meiji: This Japanese company produces a wide range of products, including chocolate that is sourced in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, among other countries. Meiji became a member of ICI in 2021 and supports ICI's activities to implement CLMRS.

Mondelēz: The parent company of brands like Cadbury and Toblerone, Mondelēz aims to source cocoa sustainably and eliminate child labor and forced labor from its supply chain through the **Cocoa Life program**. ¹²⁴ To eliminate child labor, the Cocoa Life program includes attention to enhancing child protection systems and enabling access to quality education in Cocoa Life communities.

Nestlé: implements its **Nestlé Cocoa Plan** and **Income Accelerator Program** is focused on the lives of cocoa farmers and eliminating child labor. Farmers participate in the Income Accelerator program and gain additional financial rewards not only for the quantity and quality of cocoa beans they produce, but also for the benefits they provide to the environment and local

¹²⁰ https://www.ferrero.com/news/ferrero-continues-to-scale-cocoa-sustainability-programme

¹²¹ https://www.thehersheycompany.com/en_us/home/sustainability/sustainability-focus-areas/cocoa.html

¹²² https://www.mars.com/sustainability-plan/cocoa-for-generations

¹²³ https://www.meiji.com/global/sustainability/sustainability-management/

¹²⁴ https://www.cocoalife.org/

communities. Nestlé states their commitment to source cocoa sustainably and promote responsible practices throughout their supply chain. 125

Olam food Ingredients (now ofi) Cocoa: This company works on various initiatives aimed at improving farmer livelihoods and eliminating child labor through the Cocoa Compass program.

The Cocoa Compass program includes the implementation of CLMRS methods to address child labor. Special attention is also given to addressing poverty through approaches such as paying premiums to farmers (as do other companies) and supporting the development and functioning of savings and credit schemes.

Tony's Chocolonely: This company has a sustainability program committing to 100% fair trade and ending child labor and forced labor in the cocoa industry. The program, **Tony's Open Chain**, focuses on creating a transparent and traceable cocoa supply chain. Much of Tony's Open Chain work includes a member-based program where farmers join and are supported to address child labor, forced labor, and reduce the environmental damage of cocoa production. There is a high focus on working with and strengthening cooperatives.

5.6 International Organizations

5.6.1 The International Monetary Fund and World Bank

Together with the governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank are major investors in supporting rural development. One interviewee noted the benefits of but also some crucial challenges for the governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana regarding IMF¹²⁸ funding and associated restructuring requirements.¹²⁹

The IMF has approved a US\$3.5 billion Extended Fund and Extended Credit Facility for **Côte d'Ivoire** to support its eventual transformation to an upper-middle-income nation. It is important to note that the fund and credit facility is expected to provide fiscal room to improve critical spending on health and education services. As discussed previously on remaining development

¹²⁵ https://www.nestle.com/media/pressreleases/allpressreleases/tackle-child-labor-risks-farmer-income-cocoa-traceability)

¹²⁶ https://www.ofi.com/sustainability/responsible-and-sustainable-sourcing/sustainability-in-cocoa.html

¹²⁷ https://www.tonysopenchain.com/; https://tonyschocolonely.com/int/en/other-stuff/newsroom/tonys-chocolonely-introduces-tonys-mission-lock-a-new-legal-mechanism-to-secure-its-mission-indefinitely-regardless-of-shareholder-structure 128 IMF. (2023). Côte d'Ivoire: Requests for and extended arrangement under the Extended Fund Facility and a 40-month arrangement under the Extended Credit Facility. Press release: staff report: and statement by the executive director for Côte.

arrangement under the Extended Credit Facility. Press release; staff report; and statement by the executive director for Côte d'Ivoire. IMF.

¹²⁹ Although some aspects are beneficial, the restructuring requirements are seen as remaining challenging. More specifically, e.g., for Côte d'Ivoire, "Key structural reforms include strengthening social protection for vulnerable households, improving public financial management and investment efficiency, and promoting private sector–led and more inclusive growth by creating new employment opportunities, including for Côte d'Ivoire's large young population." IMF. (2023, March 15). Press Release No. PR23/74. IMF staff concludes mission to Côte d'Ivoire. IMF.

https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2023/03/15/pr2374-cote-divoire-imf-staff-concludes-mission

gaps at the local government level, this will be important in cocoa growing (and other) areas because the lack of education and health/social services forms a major impediment to reducing child labor and forced labor. However, under the requirements for the funding, structural reforms are being required to deliver improvements in business climate, private-sector investments, and financial inclusion.

In February 2023, the World Bank Group presented¹³⁰ a new Country Partnership Framework 2023–2027 with Côte d'Ivoire. The World Bank's total existing portfolio amounts to USD\$5.48 billion. With the new framework, the World Bank's support aims to increase support to address many of the development challenges that affect rural areas, including in cocoa-growing locations. The report is notable in stating, "Where cash crop production (cocoa, rubber, and palm oil) is prevalent, living conditions have worsened over the 2015–19 period." ¹³¹ Under the new framework, infrastructure will be built, access to education and other social services improved, disparities between groups reduced, and private-sector jobs increased. Practical progress indicators are set at high targets, such as aiming to increase the proportion of third-year students who pass the reading proficiency test from 18.9% in 2020 to 43% in 2025. ¹³² Indicative commitments include, for example, US\$800,000 to enhance government effectiveness for improved public services. All these investments should help address many of the challenges that impede the effectiveness of child labor and forced labor reduction efforts.

In the case of **Ghana**, the IMF¹³³ has recently reached staff-level agreement on the first review of a 36-month program on economic policies and reforms. Because performance on reaching the program's targets and reform objectives has been very strong, pending approval of IMF management and formal completion by the IMF Executive Board, about US\$600 million in financing will be made available to Ghana for further development investment. Noteworthy is the IMF's¹³⁴ appreciation of the government's significant expansion of social protection programs to mitigate the economic impact of COVID on the most vulnerable populations. This has occurred while bolstering domestic revenues, among other reforms.

In Ghana, the World Bank is financing various rural development initiatives, including a recent US\$200 million for the Ghana Tree Crop Diversification Project. This financing will directly benefit

¹³⁰ World Bank. (2023). *A new strategy to support economic and social transformation in Côte d'Ivoire*. World Bank. https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2023/02/02/a-new-strategy-to-support-economic-and-social-transformation-in-cote-divoire

¹³¹ World Bank Group. (2022). International Development Association International Finance Corporation multilateral investment guarantee Agency Country Partnership Framework for the Republic Of Côte d'Ivoire for the period Fy23–Fy27, p. 11. World Bank Group.

¹³² Ibid., p. 48.

¹³³ IMF. (2023, October). IMF reaches staff-level agreement on the first review of the Extended Credit Facility and conducts discussions of the 2023 Article IV consultation with Ghana. https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2023/10/05/pr23339-ghana-imf-reaches-sla-1st-rev-ecf-conducts-discussions-2023-art-iv-consult. IMF.

¹³⁴ Ibid.

12,800 cocoa farmers, among others. The project will accelerate progress through financing to improve the productivity, profitability, postharvest management, value addition, and market access of the tree crops. ¹³⁵

Among other relevant investments is the World Bank's 2023 announcement of US\$150 million additional financing for the Ghana Productive Safety Net Project 2. This project includes a specific focus on child labor reduction initiatives, with links to 11 cocoa districts that the Ghana Tree Crop Diversification Project is also targeting. ¹³⁶ The child labor initiatives include support for various economic empowerment initiatives for cocoa households and access to social safety nets, as well as management of identified child labor cases. The establishment of a child labor unit at the COCOBOD offices is further covered under the financing. A national child labor implementation review committee for harmonizing ministerial interventions is also expected to be established amid other activities. ¹³⁷

5.6.2 European Due Diligence Requirements

In February 2022, the European Commission¹³⁸ adopted a proposal for a directive on corporate sustainability due diligence.¹³⁹ This was followed, on May 31, 2023, by the adoption of a regulation setting out the details of the prevention of deforestation and also mentioning respect for labor rights.¹⁴⁰ In the case of the deforestation regulation, due diligence requirements will apply in a phased manner to all companies with 250 or more employees and at least a net turnover of EUR 40 million worldwide.

As an indication of possible consequences of noncompliance with Regulation (EU) 2023/1115 of the European Parliament and of the council on deforestation, potential fines of up to 4% of the

¹³⁵ World Bank. (2023). World Bank supports Ghana to modernize and diversify its tree crops sector to accelerate productivity, resilience, and industrialization. World Bank.

https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2023/06/23/world-bank-supports-ghana-to-modernize-and-diversify-its-tree-crops-sector-to-accelerate-productivity-resilience

¹³⁶ Ministry of Food and Agriculture, COCOBOD, Tree Crops Development Authority. (2023). Ghana Tree Crops Diversification Project: Labour management procedure, final report. Ministry of Food and Agriculture, COCOBOD, Tree Crops Development Authority.

¹³⁷ Ibid.

¹³⁸ The European Commission is the executive body of the EU. It proposes new laws, manages EU policies, allocates EU funding, enforces EU law, and represents the EU internationally.

¹³⁹ European Commission. (2022). Press release. Just and sustainable economy: Commission lays down rules for companies to respect human rights and environment in global value chains. European Commission. https://single-market-economy.ec.europa.eu/news/just-and-sustainable-economy-commission-lays-down-rules-companies-respect-human-rights-and-2022-02-23 en

¹⁴⁰ Official Journal of the European Union. (2023). Regulation (EU) 2023/1115 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 31 May 2023 on the making available on the Union market and the export from the Union of certain commodities and products associated with deforestation and forest degradation and repealing Regulation (EU) No 995/2010. European Parliament and the Council of the European Union.

company's EU turnover, confiscation, or exclusion from public funding or contracts may be applied if requirements under the regulation are not met.¹⁴¹

On June 1, 2023, the European Parliament adopted amendments increasing focus on human rights requirements for any products entering the European market. ¹⁴² These amendments include several amendments citing child labor and forced labor explicitly. Directives to implement these human rights due diligence requirements are still under discussion, including aspects such as the size of the companies that will be required to comply and are still on going as of September 2023.

Companies importing products to the EU market will be required to comply with human rights and environmental sustainability requirements in their operations and supply chains. This means that they will be held responsible for conditions along their entire value chain, regardless of where they buy their inputs. To be specific, businesses should implement steps to identify, prevent, mitigate, and account for the way they address actual and potential forced labor risks in their own operations, supply chains, and business relationships. The most immediate consequence of the due diligence requirements of the EU are that companies must indicate the way they aim to protect their supply chains from child labor and forced labor. Eventually, any products that cannot be certified to be free from labor exploitation will be rejected and not allowed entry into the EU. The EU member states and their customs authorities will be responsible for verifying compliance of products entering their countries.

The EU also actively promotes the effective implementation of other international standards on responsible business conduct. These include the United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights, OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises, OECD Due Diligence Guidance for Responsible Business Conduct, ILO Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy and the Fundamental ILO Conventions. Most of these standards have been used to inform the amendments and the EU directive on human rights that is being finalized.

From October 2022, the European Union, the member states of the European Investment Bank, in association with the Government of Switzerland are mobilizing EUR 450 million to support Côte

¹⁴¹ Ibid. Forwood, G., Connellon, C., Killick, J., Nordin, S (2023). 10 Key Things to know about the new EU Deforestation Regulation. White & Case. https://www.whitecase.com/insight-alert/10-key-things-know-about-new-eu-deforestation-regulation#:~:text=The%20EUDR%20sets%20out%20how,non%2Dcompliance%20with%20the%20EUDR

¹⁴² European Parliament. (2023). Texts adopted Thursday, 1 June 2023—Brussels corporate sustainability due diligence. European Parliament. https://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-9-2023-0209_EN.html.

¹⁴³ European Union External Action. (2021). *Guidance on due diligence for EU businesses to address the risk of forced labour in their operations and supply chains*. European Union External Action.

d'Ivoire's 2020–2030 strategy of strengthening the sustainability of the cocoa value chain. ¹⁴⁴ This investment is, in part, intended to support the country in addressing the EU due diligence requirements. The purpose is to enable the government to carry out its cocoa sustainability strategy. The fund has three primary pillars: (1) forest protection and preservation, (2) addressing child labor in cocoa production, and (3) the improvement of cocoa producers' incomes.

In addition, EUR 25 million are being allocated to Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, and Cameroon to fund parallel multistakeholder dialogue events at national and regional levels in Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, and Cameroon, involving government, private-sector companies and civil society. ¹⁴⁵

The Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) and ICI collaborated to develop *Business Handbook on Due Diligence in the Cocoa Sector: Addressing Child Labour and Forced Labour*. ¹⁴⁶ The handbook presents several steps that countries can use to develop more robust means to require the importation of only child labor and forced labor-free cocoa into their countries:

- Step 1. Embed responsible business conduct and due diligence into policies and management systems.
- Step 2. Identify, assess and prioritize child labor and forced labor risks in the supply chain.
- Step 3. Cease, prevent and mitigate child labor and forced labor impacts.
- Step 4. Track implementation and results.
- Step 5. Communicate and report on due diligence.

5.6.3 United Nations Agencies and Other International Development Agencies

United Nations agencies, particularly the ILO, UNICEF, the FAO, and the intergovernmental agency International Organization for Migration (IOM), work at the enabling environment local and national government levels as part of their mandate. This applies to the strengthening of national strategies, plans, and legal and regulatory frameworks related to child labor and forced labor. Awareness raising and the capacity strengthening of government staff and members of parliament are also part of the agencies' work.

¹⁴⁴ Portail Officiel du Gouvernement de Côte d'Ivoire. (2022). Durabilité du Cacao: La Team Europe mobilise 450 millions d'euros pour appuyer la stratégie de la Côte d'Ivoire. Portail Officiel du Gouvernement de Côte d'Ivoire. https://www.gouv.ci/_actualite-article.php?recordID=14153 Portail Officiel du Gouvernement De Côte D'ivoire.

¹⁴⁵ European Commission (2021), EU boosts sustainable cocoa production in Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana and Cameroun. Available from: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip_21_193. European Commission

¹⁴⁶ OECD (2023), Business handbook on due diligence in the cocoa sector: Addressing child labour and forced labour. OECD. https://doi.org/10.1787/79812d6f-en

The **ILO** is currently implementing a range of efforts that address child labor and forced labor and collaborating with other agencies (e.g., see below on collaboration with IOM and UNICEF). The ILO is currently in Phase 2 of the Accelerating Action for the Elimination of Child Labor in Supply Chains in Africa (ACCEL AFRICA). ¹⁴⁷ Some of the good practices identified in the first phase of ACCEL Africa are discussed below. The project includes Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, as well as four other African countries. ¹⁴⁸ The expected main outcomes are (a) strengthening policy, legal, and institutional frameworks; (b) institutionalizing innovative and evidence-based solutions; and (c) scaling strategies through knowledge sharing, partnerships, and financing. The Netherlands is the main funding agency. The ILO has launched the Forced Labor Observatory, ¹⁴⁹ which includes Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana and will track available data on forced labor in the two countries.

UNICEF has a strong focus on strengthening the Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana child protection system, which includes attention to child labor. Under the child protection heading, there are also interrelated subjects that, if addressed, will have an impact on the existence of child labor in cocoa-producing areas and elsewhere in the two countries. It should be added that, having a well-functioning child protection system in place in non-cocoa-producing areas is also important for the prevention of child labor in cocoa areas. When children are highly vulnerable because of poverty and other conditions, and are not protected where they live, their migration to cocoa-producing areas is a possibility. The situation also applies to neighboring countries. UNICEF has implemented actions directly targeting child labor and integrating them into the child protection system. This includes new partnerships with the Swiss Platform for Sustainable Cocoa (SWISSCO) and Tony's Chocolonely. The UNICEF Office of Research-Innocenti carries out research—including on child labor—and uses results to conduct advocacy.

The **FAO** has been studying issues regarding child labor and forced labor in agriculture and providing analysis of these subjects with recommendations on inclusion of indicators across development strategies and plans in different thematic areas. Most recently, an analysis of the use of blockchain and Geographic Information Systems to monitor and prevent child labor in Ghana's cocoa sector was conducted. Salador of the section of the sec

¹⁴⁷ ILO. (2023). Accelerating action for the elimination of child labour in supply chains in Africa (ACCEL AFRICA), 2nd phase. In brief. ILO.

¹⁴⁸ Kenya, Mali, Nigeria, and Uganda.

¹⁴⁹ ILO. (2023). Forced Labour Observatory. ILO. https://www.ilo.org/flodashboard/

¹⁵⁰ E.g., UNICEF. (2019). Final report—UNICEF Côte d'Ivoire: Promoting the rights of children in the cocoa producing areas in Côte d'Ivoire. UNICEF.

¹⁵¹ UNICEF-Innocenti (Undated), Child Labour. Available from: https://www.unicef-irc.org/research/child-labour/

¹⁵² FAO. (2020). Framework on ending child labour in agriculture. FAO.

¹⁵³Termeer, E., Vos, B., Bolchini, A., Van Ingen, E., & Abrokwa, K. (2023). *Digitalization and child labour in agriculture: Exploring blockchain and Geographic Information Systems to monitor and prevent child labour in Ghana's cocoa sector*. Design paper. FAO.

5.7 Nongovernmental Organizations

Many international NGOs, such as Winrock, Save the Children, and CARE, are implementing projects to address child labor and forced labor in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. Most international NGOs work with one of more of the many national NGOs. The work of some international NGOs is covered in other sections, notably in the sections on multistakeholder platforms and on workers' organizations and FBOs. Winrock and Save the Children are implementing the USDOL-financed projects with FBOs. Save the Children have also partnered with various other agencies and companies in Côte d'Ivoire, such as Cargill, 154 Ferrero, 155 Mars, Nestlé, and Tony's Chocolonely.

The European Union is providing financing for the Save the Children project from 2021 to 2024 to prevent child labor in cocoa. ¹⁵⁶ Partnering with different Côte d'Ivoire government agencies and UNICEF, Save the Children is implementing the Work: No Child's Business program in the cocoa-producing area of Soubré. ¹⁵⁷

The Ghanaian NGO Youth Opportunity for Transformation in Africa partnered with the USDOL-funded CARE-implemented Adwuma Pa project. ¹⁵⁸ See Section 5.2 for some further details on Adwuma Pa.

Selected programs conducted by the many international and national agencies and groups working to address child labor and forced labor in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana are included below:

- ACE is a Japanese NGO nonprofit, founded in 1997, which aims to eliminate child labor worldwide. Since 2009, the organization has been implementing projects to solve child labor and child trafficking in the cacao-producing areas in Ghana.
- Action Aid¹⁵⁹ is implementing a project jointly with GAWU that is funded with support from COCOBOD on combating modern slavery. Focus includes strengthening enforcement of laws and regulations on human trafficking for work in cocoa.

¹⁵⁴ Save the Children. (n.d.). *Cocoa promise*. Save the Children. https://cotedivoire.savethechildren.net/projets/cocoa-promise [French]

¹⁵⁵ Save the Children. (n.d.). *Protection des enfants dans les plantations de cacao*. Save the Children. https://cotedivoire.savethechildren.net/projets/cpcp-ii [French]

¹⁵⁶ Save the Children. (n.d.). PACTE. Save the Children. https://cotedivoire.savethechildren.net/projets/pacte

¹⁵⁷ Financed by the Netherlands. Save the Children (n.d.). Work: No Child's Business. Save the Children.

https://cotedivoire.savethechildren.net/what-we-do/sant%C3%A9-et-nutrition/work-no-child-business

¹⁵⁸ USDOL-ILAB. (n.d.). Adwuma Pa empowering women and girls in supply chains. USDOL-ILAB.

https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/adwuma-pa

¹⁵⁹Action Aid (2022), COCOBOD to support Action Aid and GAWU to combat modern slavery. Available from:

https://accessagric.com/cocobod-to-support-action-aid-and-gawu-to-combat-modern-slavery/

- Anti-Slavery International conducts research—including human trafficking and modern slavery in cocoa production—and conducts advocacy.¹⁶⁰
- FairTrade International¹⁶¹ is a certification and traceability-oriented organization. To obtain the Fairtrade label farmers have to meet specific requirements that include child labor and forced labor free cocoa production. Certified farmers receive an additional premium per volume of cocoa beans. The organization also networks and advocates for a better living income for farmers and supports them to better organize themselves so they can engage in effective advocacy themselves.
- Global March Against Child Labor¹⁶² is a network of trade unions, teachers' and civil society organizations that works together to eliminate and prevent all forms of child labor, slavery and trafficking and ensuring access by all children to free, meaningful, and good quality public education. Global March is an advocacy organization that includes specific attention to the elimination of child labor in cocoa.
- Plan International has conducted research, including on child labor in cocoa¹⁶³ and implements actions on education access and income generation to help reduce child labor.
- The Rainforest Alliance¹⁶⁴ is a certification organization that also engages in advocacy for environmental sustainability and decent work, including on child and forced labor in cocoa. Rainforest Alliance also supports some direct-action projects to address child labor in cocoa.
- Solidaridad¹⁶⁵ is a decentralized network of people and organizations that comprising advocacy and awareness raising against child labor and forced labor including in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana and supporting farmer-owned sustainable production methods.
- Terre des Hommes¹⁶⁶ is implementing a project jointly with Save the Children and the International Office for Migration (IOM) on addressing the challenges of migrant children

https://www.tdh.org/en/projects/west-africa-migration

¹⁶⁰ For examples, see Anti-Slavery (2023), Search "cocoa". Available at: https://www.antislavery.org/?s=Cocoa

¹⁶¹ Fairtrade International (Undated), Cocoa. Available from: https://www.fairtrade.net/product/cocoa

¹⁶² Global March Against Child Labor (Undated), About us. Available from: https://globalmarch.org/about-us/who-we-are/

¹⁶³ Plan International (2020), Applying Gender responsive Human Rights Due Diligence in practice. Cases from the CocoCases from the Cocoa sector, the Ready-Made Garment & the Tourism & Hospitality sector. The Hague: Plan Nederland.

¹⁶⁴ Rainforest Alliance (Undated), Cocoa. Available from: https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/commodity/cocoa/, Rainforest Alliance (2021), Project Profile: Tackling Forced Labor and Child Labor in the Ghanaian Cocoa and Gold Mining Sectors, Available from: https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/in-the-field/tackling-forced-labor-and-child-labor-in-ghana-sectors-project/. Rainforest Alliance.

¹⁶⁵ Solidaridad (Undated), Cocoa. Available from https://www.solidaridadnetwork.org/commodity/cocoa/

 $^{^{\}rm 166}$ Terre des Hommes (Undated), Protecting Children on the Move in West Africa. Available from:

- in West Africa, including in Côte d'Ivoire. The Improving the protection of migrant children and young people on the main migration routes in West Africa project.
- World Education strengthens access to education but, in Côte d'Ivoire, has worked with cocoa growing communities to reduce child labor since 2012.¹⁶⁷ Various strategies are sued to help increase school enrolment in cocoa areas, such as helping parents secure birth certificates for their children, increasing awareness of the importance of education, improving the quality of instruction, and ensuring children are fed at school. Among other activities, World Education also strengthens school management committees, builds latrines with handwashing stations, and supports income generating actions to help care givers pay school fees.
- World Vision worked to address child labor including as an implementing partner with the Mondelēz Cocoa Life program in Ghana in the past.¹⁶⁸ Currently, World Vision has integrated messaging against child labor in cocoa and other subjects across their activities in the country.¹⁶⁹
- CARE Women for Change ¹⁷⁰ program is implemented in partnership with support from Mars Wrigley. The Women for Change model first creates Village Savings and Loan Associations (VSLAs). The VSLAs become an entry point for implementing financial inclusion initiatives and linkages; entrepreneurship development to support income growth and diversification; gender-equality interventions; and a training curriculum that promotes early-childhood development and child protection that includes attention to child labor.

5.8 Civil Society Organizations:

The Plateforme Ivoirienne pour le Cacao Durable (Côte d'Ivoire Platform for Sustainable Cocoa) (PICD) is a working group of civil society and producer organizations that promotes the rights of cocoa producers in Côte d'Ivoire. It was created in 2020 as part of the implementation of INKOTA's 171 project to strengthen the capacities of civil society organizations and cocoa producer organizations to participate in political dialogue in Côte d'Ivoire. PICD was established

¹⁶⁷ World Education (2022), World Education in Côte d'Ivoire. Abidjan: World Education

¹⁶⁸ Mondelēz Cocoa Life, World Vision Ghana (2014), Mondelēz Cocoa Life Project. Accra: World Vision. Available from: https://www.wvi.org/ghana/publication/cocoa-life-project-readable-e-version-fact-sheet

¹⁶⁹ E.g., World Vision (2023), Helping to Earn the Money for School. Available from: https://www.wvi.org/stories/helping-earn-money-school

¹⁷⁰ CARE Women for Change (2023), Women for Change Microsaving. Available from: https://www.care.org/our-work/education-and-work/microsavings/women-for-change/

¹⁷¹ INKOTA is a German NGO that functions as an advocacy association and to implement development initiatives in several countries including in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. INKOTA (2023), Faire Preise Und Mitsprache Von Kakaoproduzent Innen Erstreiten (Fight for Fair Prices and a Say for Cocoa Producers) https://www.inkota.de/projekte/cote-divoire/faire-preise-und-mitsprache-von-kakaoproduzentinnen-erstreiten

with INKOTA's local partner Inades-Formation Côte d'Ivoire. 172 Further, PICD works to improve the coordination of joint strategies and to bring about sustainable change in the cocoa industry to benefit farmers and their families. PICD currently comprises 11 civil society organizations and 55 cocoa producer organizations, the latter includes cocoa cooperatives. In addition to advocacy, the PICD addresses specific issues such as cocoa pricing and strengthening the capacities of members on traceability of cocoa. 173 The PICD also contributes to dialogue regarding the reduction of child labor and attends meetings of the Child Labor Cocoa Coordinating Group (CLCCG), see Section 5.11. The significant presence of cocoa producer organizations, specifically farm-based groups, within the PICD membership makes their input important. Including other local civil society organizations further emphasizes the significance of involving them in discussions and initiatives to tackle issues related to child labor and forced labor.

The Ghana Civil-society Cocoa Platform (GCCP) is an independent coalition ¹⁷⁴ of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Non-governmental Organizations (NGOs), Community-based Organizations (CBOs), Farmer-based Organizations (FBOs), Media, and individuals committed to influencing Ghana's cocoa sector through advocacy and multi-actor partnerships. The GCCP is active in the CLCCG and in 2023 was estimated to have between 60 and 70 active members. 175 In 2023, the GCCP successfully supported advocacy for a 15-20% increase in the farm-gate price of cocoa to ensure a living income for farmers. The GCCP emphasizes transparency and accountability in the cocoa sector, urging fair prices for cocoa beans and discouraging practices contributing to child labor and deforestation. Ongoing initiatives for 2024 include ensuring farmers' access to quality inputs and services, combating child labor, and advocating for sustainable cocoa farming practices. While the GCCP is an important platform, some interviewees indicated that their capacities on advocating against child labor should be strengthened. Likewise, there were comments that the voice of farmers needs to be strengthened within the GCCP as NGOs dominate the membership.

The PICD and GCCP made a joint declaration against child labor, notably regarding trafficking of children for labor in 2022. 176

¹⁷² Plateforme Ivoirienne pour le Cacao Durable (2023), Available from: . Inades-Formation (2023), Available from: https://www.inadesformation.net/en/inades-formation-cote-divoire/

 $^{^{174}}$ Gearhart, J. Building Worker Power in Global Supply Chains: Lessons from Apparel, Cocoa, and Seafood. Accountability Working Paper. September 2023, Number 15.

¹⁷⁵ According to interviewees.

¹⁷⁶ Plateforme Ivoirienne pour le Cacao Durable (2023), Déclaration des Organisations de la Société Civile et des Organisations des Producteurs Ivoiriennes et Ghanéennes. Available from: https://plateformecacao.org/fr/declaration-des-organisations-dela-societe-civile-et-des-organisations-des-producteurs-ivoiriennes

5.9 Workers' Organizations

Workers' organizations and FBOs in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana form a clear channel for reaching communities to address child labor and forced labor. This research is expected to cover the role of workers' organizations in addressing child labor and forced labor. To be clear, the ILO considers trade unions and their federated form to be workers' organizations. Workers organizations represent the legitimate interests of workers and their role in advancing decent work. They may include other groups that address the challenges and interests of workers.

The main challenges for workers' organizations and FBOs are their lack of technical and financial capacities to address child labor and forced labor. Other challenges include lack of coordination with other entities addressing child labor and forced labor and lack of recognition in multistakeholder platforms. That is, workers' organizations and FBOs might be included in meetings, but according to some stakeholder interviewees in this research, the input of workers' organizations and FBOs was not always seriously considered in decision making. Some interviewees indicated that this might result from a mistrust of the ability of such organizations to effectively contribute to decisions, although there were reports that this attitude had improved somewhat over the last 2 years.¹⁷⁷

In both countries, there are workers' organizations that are linked to or are interested in being associated with farmers' groups, including cooperatives and FBOs. Workers' representatives in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana indicated that they would like to be more closely involved with planning, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating initiatives on child labor and forced labor than was the case.

Some workers' organizations are actually already engaged in activities on child labor and forced labor issues, but they are still interested in scaling up actions on these subjects. An example is the **Côte d'Ivoire** *Comité Intersyndical de Lutte Contre le Travail des Enfants* (Inter-union Committee on the Fight Against Child Labor). This committee is composed of representatives of different trade unions who focus specifically on the reduction of child labor in Côte d'Ivoire. Among other actions, the committee participates in planning and has carried out training in child labor issues with local government staff and other key stakeholders in cocoa-producing areas. Because forced labor is still a relatively new subject, the training has been more oriented toward child labor issues. The committee does expect to increase focus on forced labor in the future.

The main trade union members of this committee are the:

L'Union Générale des Travailleurs de Côte d'Ivoire (UGTCI)

¹⁷⁷ This is attributed in part to ILO initiatives to support and recognize the validity of inputs from workers and FBOs. The private sector has also increasingly recognized the importance of cooperatives, in particular, in reducing CL/FL and thus in decision making on addressing these issues.

- La Confédération Syndicale Internationale Dignité (CISL-Dignité)
- La Fédération des Syndicats Autonomes de la Côte d'Ivoire (FESATI-CG)
- L'Union Nationale des Travailleurs de Côte d'Ivoire (UNATRCI)
- Centrale Syndicale Humanisme

In Ghana, General Agricultural Workers Union (GAWU) has been active in supporting the reduction of child labor for many years. 178 GAWU is an active member of the CLCCG. GAWU representatives have partnered with the ILO and other agencies to implement awareness raising, conduct advocacy against child labor, and provide training to farmers.

One of the main comments regarding the involvement of workers' organizations was that they might have much further reach than most observers believed. When thinking of cocoa, the focus tends to be on people working in cocoa production, even though there are unions representing other types of workers who may also be usefully involved. As some interviewees indicated, for example, workers' organizations that represent educators, health workers (especially midwives), and transport workers can have a deep reach into communities. Working through such workers' organizations that include these types of members can thus be beneficial, particularly with regard to awareness raising and supporting the identification of children in child labor or at risk for engaging in child labor.

5.10 **Farmer-Based Organizations**

The question of whether self-employed people should be part of employers' or workers' organizations is complex. Because most of the cocoa in both countries is produced on familyowned farms with few non-family workers, workers' organizations have not been focusing much on organizing cocoa farm employees so far. One workers' organization representative interviewed did state that they viewed cooperatives as their partners because the members were workers facing the same challenges and advocacy needs as were many other workers. That is, the interviewee said, inadequate income, lack of access to social protection such as pensions, and lack of accident insurance.

One challenge interviewees identified was that many cocoa farmers were still part of the informal economy because they were not members of registered cooperatives or other member-based organizations. Once farmers are members of registered organizations, they can be considered part of the formal economy. 179 Reaching farmers who are not organized to include them in child labor and forced labor initiatives is less efficient because they must be approached individually

¹⁷⁸ E.g., as far back as 2007, the ILO reported GAWU was conducting training with farmers to reduce hazardous work. ILO (2007), Trade unions and the elimination of child labour in agriculture. World Day Against Child Labour 12 June, 2007. Geneva:

¹⁷⁹ ILO. (2015). R204—Transition from the informal to the formal economy recommendation, 2015 (No. 204). ILO.

or through informal channels. If through informal channels, they are impeded from benefiting from various economic and other formal services. Further, farmers who are formally organized can more effectively advocate for better prices, premiums, and other benefits.

Stakeholders who were very familiar with cocoa cooperatives in the two countries reported that it was very difficult to correctly state how many cooperatives there were and how many farmers were members. Some reports state that there are approximately 3,000 cocoa cooperatives in Côte d'Ivoire¹⁸⁰ and about 30% to 50% of cocoa farmers are members.¹⁸¹ These figures are difficult to assess, however, since the number of actually functional cooperatives is not clear. Some are cooperatives in name only, consisting of just one or a few persons, and/or may not even be operational. Further complexities arise because not all cooperative members sell exclusively to their cooperatives. They may not be active members of their cooperative or may only be partially active.

In Ghana, more than 800,000 small-holder farmers engage in cocoa production. 182 In 2019, Ghana's COCOBOD Cocoa Health and Extension Division identified just over 1,300 cooperatives but indicated that only 512 of these were fully registered with the government's Department of Co-operatives. However, these figures are uncertain because some groups were hurriedly established and not functional according to some stakeholders. Further, in the case of Ghana, some registered cooperatives might default in the payment of their annual fees and be removed from the Department of Co-operatives registration list.

Because of their size and reach, it is evident that involving workers' organizations and FBOs can be helpful in increasing the messaging and implementation to achieve child labor and forced labor reduction. As one stakeholder interviewee remarked, "Cooperatives should be empowered and strengthened to better understand the stakes of not fighting child and forced labor; their economic activity is at stake if they do not do so. It's a question of the sustainability of their economic activity."

However, another stakeholder interviewee noted an important caveat. The reach of such organizations tends to focus most on their members in the community. This means that households in a community that are not (yet) members are less likely to be reached and

¹⁸⁰ ILO. (2021). Financing responsibly the cocoa supply chain in Côte d'Ivoire: The "leverage" role of the financial sector in eliminating child labour. ILO, Accelerating Action for the Elimination of Child Labour in Supply Chains in Africa (ACCEL Africa)

¹⁸¹ Bymolt, R., Laven, A., & Tyszler, M. (2018). Demystifying the cocoa sector in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire. Chapter 9, Cocoa producer groups, certification, training and credit. The Royal Tropical Institute (KIT).

¹⁸² Ghana Commercial Bank. (2022). Sector industry analysis-Cocoa sector report 2022. Ghana Commercial Bank. Fairtrade Foundation (n.d.). Kuapa Kokoo. https://www.fairtrade.org.uk/farmers-and-workers/cocoa/kuapa-kokoo-ghana/

supported, even though they may be more vulnerable to child labor and forced labor than members of workers' organizations and/or FBOs.

The management functioning of cooperatives forms a challenge, according to many documentary resources 183 and people interviewed. Poor management interferes with successful cocoa production and sales but also with the ability to address issues such as child and forced labor. Various projects are currently working to address these challenges and strengthening FBOs to address child labor and forced labor. The projects include the USDOL-funded Making Advances to Eliminate Child Labor in More Areas With Sustainable Integrated Efforts (MATE MASIE) 184 project that Winrock implements in Ghana and the USDOL-funded Cooperatives Addressing Child Labor Accountability Outcomes (CACAO) 185 project in Côte d'Ivoire, which focuses on strengthening cooperatives so that they can better address child labor. ICI includes attention to strengthening community-based organizations, including cooperatives in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, to implement CLMRS across the cocoa communities where they work. 186

Some agencies collaborate to strengthen cooperatives. The Rainforest Alliance collaborates with ICI and Solidaridad on the Tackling Forced Labor and Child Labor in the Ghanaian Cocoa and Gold Mining Sectors, which includes strengthening cooperatives. In Côte d'Ivoire, the Cocoaperation project, ¹⁸⁷ includes covering about 200 cooperatives and/or other rural community organizations to become more effective and efficient in providing marketing services, credit management, and technical support to their members. Various NGOs, such as Rikolto International, ¹⁸⁸ are implementing smaller projects to strengthen cooperatives with inclusion of attention to child labor. ¹⁸⁹ The ILO's ACCEL Africa ¹⁹⁰ and other international development agencies further support the strengthening of FBOs, including workers' organizations and cooperatives.

Some of the most important actors among workers' organizations and cooperatives with attention to child labor and forced labor reduction include, in Côte d'Ivoire, the *Association des*

¹⁸³ E.g., Fountain, A. C., & Huetz-Adams, F. (2022). *Cocoa barometer 2022*, p. 98. Voice Network.

Bymolt, R., Laven, A., & Tyszler, M. (2018). Demystifying the cocoa sector. The Royal Tropical Institute (KIT).

¹⁸⁴ Winrock International. (2022, September). *Making advances to eliminate child labor in more areas with sustainable integrated efforts (MATE MASIE): Comprehensive monitoring and evaluation plan.* Winrock International.

¹⁸⁵ USDOL-ILAB. (n.d.). CACAO: Cooperatives addressing child labor accountability outcomes.

https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/cacao-cooperatives-addressing-child-labor-accountability-outcomes

¹⁸⁶ ICI. (2022). Annual report 2021. ICI.

¹⁸⁷ Implemented through The Sustainable Trade Initiative (IDH). Cocoaperation.

https://www.idhsustainabletrade.com/initiative/cocoaperation/

¹⁸⁸ Rikolto International. (2023). *Rikoloto-2022: Sowing the seeds for sustainable food systems annual report*. Rikolto International.

¹⁸⁹ Rikolto International. (2023). *Taking Ivorian cocoa to the higher level*. https://www.rikolto.org/projects/taking-ivorian-cocoa-to-the-higher-level. Rikolto International

¹⁹⁰ Aguilar, E. (2021). ACCEL Africa Project—Accelerating action for the elimination of child labour in supply chains in Africa: Supporting cooperative organizations to address root causes of child labour within an integrated area-based approach. ILO.

*Présidents de Conseil d'Administration de coopératives de café-cacao*¹⁹¹ and the *Comite intersyndicale de la lutte contre le travail des enfants.* ¹⁹² The researchers were informed by a representatives of Coop Café Cacao that it had recently registered additional cooperatives so that they have a membership of about 351,000 farmers overall.

In Ghana, the cooperative union Kuapa Kokoo¹⁹³ has a special department on child and ethical labor.¹⁹⁴ Kuapa Kokoo has included ensuring ethical contracts with tenants on farms in an effort to reduce forced labor. There are also alliances between cooperative unions to address child labor and forced labor issues. Examples include an alliance of the Kuapa Kokoo Farmers' Cooperative and Marketing Union, Kokoo Pa Farmers Association, and the Offinso Fine Flavor Cocoa Co-operative. Awareness raising is conducted and linkages are made to CLMRS implementation.

There are cooperatives that have started to focus more on the inclusion of women cocoa producers and that cover child trafficking/labor-related issues. The woman-managed *Coopérative Agricole de Yakasse-Attobrou* (CAYAT), in Côte d'Ivoire, is one example. ¹⁹⁵ CAYAT includes focus on women cocoa farmers, and child trafficking is one of the four service subjects for members. ¹⁹⁶

There is scope for exchanges between Ivorian and Ghanaian women farmer cooperatives in Ghana on this subject—for example, between CAYAT and the newly formed Sunyani District Women Cocoa Farmers Union (SUWCOF) of 23 cooperatives with about 1,500 women farmers. ¹⁹⁷ SUWCOF has not yet publicly listed activities on child labor and forced labor. In fact, some stakeholders interviewed stressed increasing exchanges among cooperative unions on human rights issues as the way to help increase awareness and effectiveness of initiatives to reduce child labor and forced labor.

The researchers requested interviewees for recommendations on how workers' organizations (including trade unions) and farmer-based organizations could be strengthened to address child labor. The recommendations they made are mostly intended for the government of the two countries, development agencies that implement initiatives on child labor, and workers'

¹⁹¹ Association of Chairmen of Boards of Directors of coffee-cocoa cooperatives.

¹⁹² Interunion committee for the fight against child labor.

¹⁹³ Kuapa Kokoo. (n.d.). About company—*Kuapa Kokoo Cooperative Cocoa Farmers and Marketing Union Limited*. Kuapa Kokoo, Child and Ethical Labour Department. https://kuapakokoo.com/

¹⁹⁴ Kuapa Kokoo. (n.d.). Child and Ethical Labour Department. Kuapa Kokoo. https://new.kuapakokoo.com/about

¹⁹⁵ Landscape News. (2022). *Cocoa co-op concocts richer futures for farmers: Q&A with Awa Bamba*. Landscape News. https://news.globallandscapesforum.org/58194/cocoa-co-op-concocts-richer-futures-for-farmers-qa-with-awa-bamba/

¹⁹⁶ Coopérative Agricole de Yakasse-Attobrou. (CAYAT). (n.d.). *Nous oeuvrons pour le développment de la production agricole*. CAYAT. https://cayat-ci.com/index.php

¹⁹⁷Sunyani District Women Cocoa Farmers Union. (SUWCOF). COCOBOD. (2023). Women in Cocoa Cooperative Union launched. COCOBOD. https://cocobod.gh/news/women-in-cocoa-cooperative-union-launched

organizations themselves. The interviewees did not indicate in their recommendations who specifically should address which recommendation. The researchers did extract elements from these recommendations and included them in their overall recommendations, in those cases, responsible entities are suggested.

Exhibit 6. Support That Should Receive Attention to Support and Strengthen Workers' Organizations and Farmer-Based Organizations to Address Child Labor and Forced Labor Among Their Members

STAKEHOLDER SUGGESTIONS TO STRENGTHEN WORKERS' AND FARMER-BASED ORGANIZATIONS

Capacity strengthening on child labor and forced labor; establishment of mechanisms for workers' organizations/FBOs to use to address child labor and forced labor

- 1. Establish government specialized structures to assist cooperatives to combat child labor and forced labor.
- Effectively increase support to and focus more on cooperatives to reduce child labor and forced labor.
- 3. Strengthen the capacity of workers' organizations to advocate for policies that address the root causes of child labor.
- 4. Strengthen the capacity of workers' organizations and FBOs on identification, monitoring, knowledge on child labor and forced labor through continuous capacity strengthening and follow-up. Ensure the awareness raising of leadership and membership to equip cocoa farmers with the needed knowledge and skills.
- Reduce mistrust of workers' organizations as incapable of implementing actions on child labor and forced labor and provide these organizations with increased opportunities to take action on child labor and forced labor.
- 6. Include non-agriculture-based workers' organizations such as teachers' unions, health workers/midwives, and others to address child labor and forced labor in cocoa.
- 7. Involve more government experts and NGO partners on the child labor and forced labor topics, to teach the organizations about
 - laws, decrees, regulations related to child and forced labor;
 - child protection (beyond child labor) and human rights;
 - how to assess risk;
 - how to prevent and mitigate risk within the communities they source from; and
 - how to set up a grievance system in way that also respects child safeguarding principles.
- 8. Adjust capacity-strengthening support for workers' organizations and FBOs in line with their individual needs and context.
- 9. Promotion of peer-to-peer education and exchanges within and among cooperatives.
- 10. Design a common, easy way to implement a mixed-method approach and tools to address child labor and forced labor to be used within workers' organizations and FBOs. The method should be approved by government and child protection/labor experts for human rights risk assessment and monitoring and evaluation (M&E). This should include identification of cases

- of child and forced labor at a local level and link then linked with local child protection and labor rights reporting systems.
- 11. Strengthen fair trade certification systems so that all have "zero child labor and forced labor" as a requirement/criterion. Link this with premium payments that are commensurate with the efforts toward child labor prevention.
- 12. Designate a focal point (fight against child labor) within each workers' and farmers' organization, to promote coordination of these organizations' actions with CIM and CNS.
- 13. Develop an M&E mechanism to measure progress of workers' organizations/FBOs in the fight against child labor within each workers' and farmers' organization that is adapted to and aligned with their needs.
- 14. Strengthen the capacity of cooperatives and service centers to provide collective services for farmers to reduce the need for manual labor on the farm and, consequently, reduce reliance on child labor and forced labor. Collective services and projects can include irrigation projects and mechanization projects that introduce technology, for example, in spraying, pruning, weeding, harvesting, gathering of pods, pod breaking, and carting within the farm and from the farm to the house.
- 15. Strengthen the monitoring and identification of child labor activities by workers' organizations and FBOs.

Capacity strengthening on FBOs' management, financial transparency, establishment of codes of conduct

- 1. Strengthen the leadership of FBOs in leadership skills and organizational/administrative management as a strong and coherent administrative structure that can help address child labor and forced labor. Include focus on issues such as management subjects, acquisition of rolling stock, computers, and awareness-raising tools.
- 2. Resource and furnish FBOs with the necessary materials and tools for effective leadership and management of their farmers' organization.
- 3. Review workers' organizations'/FBOs' policies, systems, and structures and determine their gaps in effective and efficient management and implementation of initiatives.
- 4. Ensure that financial policies within FBOs have adequate provision for segregation of duties of among those responsible for financial management to increase transparency and reduce loss of income due to corruption.
- 5. Ensure that these cooperatives focus not only on economic results but on equity and support for children and decent work conditions of adults.
- 6. Identify the number and effectiveness of existing cooperatives, distinguishing in particular between organizations that focus only on grouping their products to sell to intermediate buyers and functioning FBOs with a shared governance framework and clearly identified farmer members. This will help increase the focus of efforts on child labor and forced labor in FBOs that are actually functioning cooperatives.
- 7. Increase support to cooperatives to go beyond strengthening themselves as business entities to serve as structures that represent the interests of members and negotiate for them.
- 8. Adopt integrated national policies with active measures for the creation, growth, and operation of rural workers' organizations. Adopt a plan of action to eliminate obstacles to the establishment and development of rural workers' organizations and to the exercise of their lawful activities, in order to give agricultural workers a role in economic and social

development, in accordance with the Rural Workers' Organizations Convention, 1975 (No. 141), in law and in practice.

Inclusion of workers' organization and FBO voices in decision making on child and forced labor

- 1. Ensure that representatives of FBOs are involved in decision-making processes that affect them. Have them involved at the highest policy levels, as well as at local government level, taking part in platform meetings.
- 2. Define and ensure fair representation of cocoa farmers and workers in the governance framework of the national strategies on sustainable cocoa and in the elaboration and monitoring of periodic national action plans on child labor and forced labor. Ensure farmers' involvement in the implementation and monitoring review and coordination meetings to follow up the implementation of the national action plans, national cocoa sustainability strategies, agricultural and rural development policies, governance of the cocoa sector, and public-private partnerships.
- 3. Ensure the fair representation of workers' organizations/FBOs in child-labor-project steering committees.
- Strengthen FBOs to come together as one voice and advocate in unity to obtain the right prices and services. Ensure that different groups are well represented when presenting and contributing their voices to policies, plans, and implementation of initiatives.
- 5. Develop holistic solutions and address power imbalances of workers' organizations, FBOs, and the rest of the value chain (e.g., private sector).

Provision of funding to engage in child labor and forced labor reduction activities for organizations with low internal financial resources

- 1. Ensure that funding support is provided to workers' organizations and FBOs for implementing actions to address child labor and forced labor because of the low internal funding availability for initiatives. Funding sources may be from producer and consumer governments, the private sector, international development organizations, and the organizations' own membership, as available. Large and certified cooperatives may have additional income helping them provide matching inputs to address child labor and forced labor issues.
- Provide support for material inputs such as vehicles, equipment, and tools for travel into a cocoa-producing area to
 - -unionize/organize agricultural workers in cocoa production and
 - -engage in child labor and forced labor reduction related actions.
- 3. Strengthen the fund-raising and financial management capacities of producers and their professional organizations to enable them to finance actions to prevent and remedy child labor and forced labor and increase their ability for mitigating risks and reducing the number of cases of child labor and forced labor.
- 4. Support FBOs in implementing infrastructure projects that can support preventive and remedial actions on child labor, such as building schools and school canteens.
- 5. Support workers' organizations and FBOs to raise awareness among their membership.

Organizing farmers, workers, service providers, formalizing informal farmers

- 1. Support capacity of trade unions to expand operations to more cocoa-growing communities by, for example, facilitating registration and management of the processes. This may include creation of physical offices in cocoa-growing areas and establishing training centers to provide service to organized farmer groups.
- 2. Take appropriate measures to facilitate the ratification by Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana of the ILO C141-Convention (No. 141) concerning Rural Workers' Organizations, 1975, and the application of the guidelines offered by the R149-Recommendation (No. 149) concerning Rural Workers' Organizations, 1975.
- 3. Develop and implement knowledge enhancement programs for union leaders and farmers' organizations on freedom of association and collective bargaining.
- 4. Develop tools adapted to rural workers to raise awareness of freedom of association and workers' rights to union membership.
- 5. Implement actions to organize agricultural workers and develop strategic collaborations between cooperatives and unions.
- 6. Engage service providers, such as labor inspectors and agricultural extension officers, to partner with workers' organizations and FBOs to address child labor and forced labor.
- 7. Support programs to strengthen and formalize groups of agricultural workers or service providers. Supply them with working materials to manage their groups and ensure their understanding of the importance of formalizing these informal community agriculture groups.

Economic empowerment, social protection

- 1. Support partnerships of workers' organizations and FBOs to scale up the support for vulnerable families with economic empowerment initiatives such as diversification of incomes, social safety nets, and savings and credit schemes.
- 2. Engage in partnerships to develop and implement social protection initiatives such as cocoa producer crop insurance, health insurance, and pensions.

Accountability and engagement of workers' organizations and FBOs to connect with their members on child labor and forced labor

- 1. Ensure and hold workers' organizations and FBOs accountable for going beyond integrating child labor and forced labor into their action plans to engage with their members on the child labor and forced labor.
- 2. Motivate workers' organizations and FBOs to address child labor and forced labor with their membership.

Cooperation with other stakeholders, platforms

- 1. Strengthen collaboration and alignment among different worker organizations, FBOs, and other cocoa-related associations. Ensure that this is implemented at national and decentralized local levels
- 2. Ensure that contributions in platforms are well focused on the development of joint initiatives going beyond mere exchanges of information.
- 3. Strengthen the capacity of workers' organizations and FBOs to form partnerships with research institutions for conducting research to support farmer activities.

- 4. Support collaboration between organizations and government structures working in their areas of intervention, to monitor and coordinate actions and enforce laws and regulations for perpetrators guilty of engaging people in child labor and forced labor.
- 5. Establish a policy framework conducive to strengthening workers' and farmers' organizations in order to eliminate child labor and forced labor in Côte d'Ivoire.
- 6. Create support among farmers in areas other than farming, such as creating networks between producers (groups) and important stakeholders in the community (including village heads, other leaders, and schoolteachers) to share critical information and support one another.
- 7. Ensure that workers' organizations and FBOs are aware of and can implement grievance mechanisms so that case management can be effectively and sensitively implemented.

5.11 **Child Labor Cocoa Coordinating Group**

The CLCCG is public-private partnership aimed at addressing abusive labor practices in the cocoa supply chain. Established in 2010, its members are the governments of Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, and the United States as well as the representatives of the international chocolate and cocoa industry. 198 GAWU, a workers' organization in Ghana participates in the CLCCG as a member of the Ghanaian delegation. Other types of stakeholders have participated in CLCCG meetings, notably, representatives of civil society and international organizations. The ICI, ILO, and UNICEF act as technical experts for the CLCCG. A report of the activities of CLCCG members covering the period from 2010 to 2020¹⁹⁹ was published in 2021. The report is mostly focused on the activities of the different categories of members over the 10-year period. The activities of the CLCCG, as a group, are not discussed to any notable extent in this report. An interviewee did state that they felt that the CLCCG had been somewhat dormant for several years, adding that it was good that it was currently becoming more active.

The name of the CLCCG, like that of CLMRS, does not yet reflect the inclusion of forced labor as an issue to be addressed. The report covering CLCCG member activities between 2010 and 2020 does, however, cover some forced labor initiatives. Some agencies are studying ways to include reduction of forced labor in some of their CLMRS initiatives. Consideration of renaming the CLMRS and CLCCG to indicate that forced labor is a labor rights subject to be included in the activities would be a worthwhile endeavor for the members to discuss.

¹⁹⁸ USDOL- ILAB. (n.d.). Child labor in the production of cocoa. USDOL-ILAB. https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/our-work/childforced-labor-trafficking/child-labor-cocoa.

¹⁹⁹ Government of Côte d'Ivoire, Government of Ghana, United States Department of Labor, International Chocolate and Cocoa Industry. (2021). CLCCG report: 2010–2020 Efforts to reduce child labor in cocoa. USDOL.

One important aspect covered in the CLCCG report 2010–2020, is the commitment that cocoa companies have made.²⁰⁰ For example, "To protect children, companies are working with the governments to increase the coverage of Child Labor Monitoring & Remediation Systems to 100% by 2025 from about 20% in 2019 in cocoa-growing communities in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana."²⁰¹

Several research interviewees noted that the CLCCG should be more representative of stakeholders associated with the cocoa value chain. Making it so has already being discussed for some time. However, when the research team conducted interviews, interviewees noted that expansion of the CLCCG to include more members had not yet happened. Types of additional members cited for inclusion comprised representatives of international and national NGOs, human rights advocacy groups, cooperative unions, and other FBOs. One stakeholder added that one or more representatives of EU delegation staff in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana who are working on EU importation of due diligence requirements should also be members. The interviewee added that membership of an EU representative could help ensure a more common approach of consumer countries to address issues on child labor and forced labor.

Further, there were comments from interviewees that the CLCCG membership was still working in too many different directions. Some interviewees added that, although alignment had improved, much more integration of efforts and a more synergistic approach was necessary. Consequently, to improve its functioning, the CLCCG is currently revising its structure. This includes strengthening its planning and collaboration mechanisms to improve the functioning of the CLCCG as a group—that is, to go beyond information exchange on members' activities and intentions and work more effectively together. Toward this end, the CLCCG is currently focusing on discussing several main topics to help ensure the creation of better synergistic collaboration. These include discussions on CLCCG functioning on the basis of an analysis of past experiences and determining recommendations to strengthen the CLCCG. These also include discussions on refining the structure of the CLCCG, including revising the CLCCG by-laws and other operational guidelines (e.g., a framework of action).

It should be added that at least two research interviewees remarked on the overly ambitious nature of the current CLCCG planning. While setting targets is useful, they noted that the CLCCG should also be realistic and base its goals on evidence that they are achievable within the timelines to be set. It was also pointed out that the CLCCG targets should be more based on the new national action plans on child labor, and eventually forced labor, in both countries. That is, as opposed to simply being aligned with the national action plans, the CLCCG as a whole and its members should use these as a starting point for planning.

²⁰⁰ Ibid.

²⁰¹ Ibid., p. 78.

5.12 Multistakeholder Platforms

In addition to the CLCCG, there are many multistakeholder platforms related to cocoa value chains of different types. These platforms range from community child protection committees that include child labor issues to multicountry child labor and forced labor groups that include representatives of producer and consumer governments, the private sector, international and national development agencies, and civil society representatives. This report cannot cover all the platforms in detail but discusses examples of several key types. Some interviewees commented that, because of the proliferation of multistakeholder platforms, there are also too many frameworks to address child labor and forced labor, adding that there should be greater coherence among frameworks. In addition, the interviewees noted that there should be clearly identified roles and responsibilities across platforms and their members.

In various interviews, workshops, and documents, a recurring theme highlights the limited extent of genuine, collaborative efforts to combat child labor. While there have been commendable initiatives, the execution phase lacks the desired level of interactive synergy.

Although there is collective strategizing, planning, and review, the actual implementation of initiatives is often assigned to separate entities. This approach falls short of fostering true collaborative actions that capitalize on the strengths of all participating partners. Rather than engaging in cohesive efforts, the prevalent practice involves sharing information about individual actions, rather than actively working together.

Producer country platforms exist that are organizing around specific joint collaborations. Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana have their own joint platform, the Côte d'Ivoire-Ghana Cocoa Initiative (CIGCI). ²⁰³ The Public–Private Partnership (PPP) of the Government of Côte d'Ivoire, the cocoa and chocolate industry, and philanthropic organizations to implement programs like the Child Learning and Education Facility (CLEF) launched in 2021. ²⁰⁴

The Conseil Café-Cacao is the convener of the PPP in Côte d'Ivoire. The current value of the program is equivalent to approximately US\$121,000,000. 205 CLEF is aimed at improving quality education for 5 million children and influencing the behavior of 10 million parents by 2027. CLEF aims to provide quality education for 5 million children and influencing the behavior of 10 million parents on child learning and child rights. CLEF is expected to build infrastructure sch as

²⁰² Côte d'Ivoire-Ghana Cocoa Initiative (CIGCI; n.d.). *About us.* CIGCI. https://www.cighci.org/about-us/

²⁰³ Côte d'Ivoire-Ghana Cocoa Initiative (CIGCI; n.d.) About us. CIGCI. https://www.cighci.org/about-us/.

²⁰⁴ Child Learning and Education Facility (CLEF; n.d.). Child Learning and Education Facility. CLEF.

https://www.clefpartnership.com/en/our-mission/

Jacobs Foundation. (n.d.). CLEF—Child Learning and Education Facility. Jacobs Foundation.

https://jacobsfoundation.org/activity/clef-elan/

²⁰⁵ At current rates of exchange with the Swiss Franc: 110 million Swiss Francs = US\$ 121,308,440 on October 10, 2023.

2,500 classrooms and other education infrastructure as needed. CLEF has additional goals to scale up these actions to 2030. Another PPP program that the same donors are funding is the Early Learning and Nutrition Facility (ELAN), also in Côte d'Ivoire, that is currently scheduled until 2025.²⁰⁶ The ELAN project is aimed at reaching 1.3 million children aged 0 to 5 in rural Côte d'Ivoire with a target capitalization equivalent to over 44,000,000.

In April 2023, the Government of Côte d'Ivoire, UNICEF, IOM, and ILO jointly launched a new US\$9 million project.²⁰⁷ The program is Ensemble pour agir sur les causes profondes du travail des enfants dans la Nawa (ENACTE; Working together to tackle the root causes of child labor in Nawa). The government agencies partnering with the project are CNS and CIM. The project aims to promote the rights of all children and adolescents in Nawa through access to education and basic social services, protecting them from violence and exploitation, and offering decent work opportunities and social protection to young people of working age and their parents in cocoagrowing areas. In addition, the program endeavors to strengthen the legal and institutional framework to promote the elimination of child labor and provides for the coordination and documentation of actions, as well as improving the accessibility and quality of basic social services. Further, it establishes community mechanisms to prevent child labor, identify children at risk or victims, and refer them to government services. The ENACTE program is cofinanced by the EU and Switzerland.

A key **worldwide platform** is the WCF, with an international membership from across the global cocoa and chocolate sector. ²⁰⁸ The WCF convenes the cocoa and chocolate industry in collective action, facilitating multistakeholder partnerships and industry engagement in policy dialogue with governments. In addition, the WCF promotes industry learning, knowledge sharing, and M&E while communicating industry impact and investment. The WCF also helps mobilize resources from development partners and financial markets.

The International Cocoa Organization (ICCO) is an intergovernmental organization established in 1973, operating within the framework of successive International Cocoa Agreements. The ICCO comprises 52 member countries, of which 23 are cocoa-exporting countries and 29 are cocoa-importing countries. The organization's focus includes gathering and sharing statistics relevant to the cocoa sector and encompasses attention to social, economic, and environmental dimensions in production and consumption.

²⁰⁶ Jacobs Foundation. (2020). ELAN—*Early Learning and Nutrition Facility*. Jacobs Foundation.

²⁰⁷ ILO. (2023). *Nouveau programme contre le travail des enfants dans la filière cacao en Côte d'Ivoire.* ILO.

https://www.ilo.org/africa/media-centre/news/WCMS 877773/lang—fr/index.htm

UNICEF. (2023). Elimination du travail des enfants dans la NAWA. UNICEF.

https://www.unicef.org/cotedivoire/communiqu%C3%A9s-de-presse/elimination-du-travail-des-enfants-dans-lanawa%E2%80%AF-0

²⁰⁸ World Cocoa Foundation (WCF; 2023). *About us.* WCF. https://worldcocoafoundation.org/about

²⁰⁹ International Cocoa Organization (ICCO; 2023). Who we are. ICCO.

The ICI is a multistakeholder partnership advancing the elimination of child labor and forced labor, by "uniting the forces of the cocoa and chocolate industry, civil society, farming communities, governments, international organizations and donors." ²¹⁰ In addition to serving as a networking platform, ICI implements field-level initiatives aimed at reducing child labor and is now also focusing on forced labor. ICI further conducts extensive research on the development and assessment of effective approaches to addressing child labor and forced labor in cocoa, with concentration on Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. ICI is a member of other platforms (or sends its representatives to them), to participate in and contribute to other platforms on the main issues regarding child labor and forced labor. ICI has recently been working with other key stakeholders on identifying improved progress indicators to measure results and on streamlining the implementation of initiatives.

Several platforms include child labor in cocoa among discussions of all forms of child labor, like Alliance 8.7. ²¹¹ This alliance includes 375 global partners from a wide range of institutions that work together to take immediate and effective measures to eradicate forced labor, modern slavery, human trafficking, and child labor, in accordance with Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) Target 8.7. ²¹² Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana are both Alliance 8.7 Pathfinder countries, ²¹³ which means that they commit to

- "Develop, adopt and put into practice improved legislation, national action plans or policies on child labour, forced labour, modern slavery and/or human trafficking
- Translate public commitments into **concrete actions** especially relevant in this regard are the key steps identified in the **Durban Call to Action**
- Ratify, or actively work towards the ratification or implementation of, applicable international **human rights standards**, including international labour standards."²¹⁴

The ILO-chaired Child Labour Platform includes several private-sector cocoa companies among its members. The Child Labour Platform's goal is to strengthen the role of business in eliminating child labor. The 14th Annual Meeting of the ILO-chaired Child Labour Platform was held in December 2023, with the theme From the Ground Up: Collective Action to End Child Labour in

²¹⁰ International Cocoa Initiative (ICI; n.d.). *About ICI*. ICI. https://www.cocoainitiative.org/about-us#:~:text=It%20is%20a%20multi%2Dstakeholder,governments%2C%20international%20organizations%20and%20donors.

²¹¹ Alliance 8.7. (2023). *Ending forced labour, modern slavery, human trafficking and child labour.* Alliance 8.7. https://www.alliance87.org/

²¹² SDG 8.7 is "Take immediate and effective measures to eradicate forced labour, end modern slavery and human trafficking and secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, including recruitment and use of child soldiers, and by 2025 end child labour in all its forms."

United Nations Statistics Division (UNSTATS; 2020). SDG Indicators. UNSTATS.

https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/metadata/?Text=&Goal=8&Target=8.7

²¹³ https://endchildlabour2021.org/these-6-pathfinder-countries-are-taking-immediate-actions-against-child-labour/

²¹⁴ Alliance 8.7. (2023). Pathways to Progress. Alliance 8.7. https://www.alliance87.org/pathfinders

Supply Chains.²¹⁵ The meeting deliberated on strengthening the means of "addressing the root causes of child labor at national level and in vulnerable communities." A working group from Côte d'Ivoire was contributing as one of three main countries of focus in the dialogue and on collaborations with the ILO.

Some platforms cover various environmental degradation issues, as well as child labor and forced labor. These platforms include the EU-sponsored Cocoa Talks Roundtable Dialogues, which discuss many of these issues, as well as the EU due diligence requirements. Most recently, the platform published a report on an information and questions-and-answers session regarding the EU Regulation on Deforestation-Free Products, which also refers to labor rights. 217

There are platforms that have decided to focus primarily on a specific issue that influences the prevalence of child labor and forced labor, such as ensuring a living income for cocoa-farming households.²¹⁸

The Living Income Community of Practice is very active. Their main objectives are to:

- Increase understanding of living income measurement and the income gap
- Identify and discuss strategies for closing the income gap

They hold regular meetings and conduct research. In addition, there are targeted PPPs sponsoring specific programs that help address some of the causes of child labor in particular, such as lack of access to quality education.

Until recently, many platforms had two main focuses: (1) planning strategies and policies and (2) exchanging information on the initiatives that the platforms' members are implementing. This is beginning to change, and the change is accelerating. There are notably more endeavors to create synergies of joint efforts among donors—that is, from cocoa producer governments and international multilateral, bilateral, and private-sector donors. However, interviewees reported that, because of the different—though often overlapping—memberships, objectives, and working methods, it was very difficult for the platforms to be well aligned.

In addition, there is a notable challenge with regard to reporting. Because of EU and other due diligence requirements, ²¹⁹ each company needs to show that it is protecting its value chain. If

²¹⁵ ILO, Child Labour Platform. (2023). ILO Child Labour Platform 14th Annual Meeting, From the Ground Up: Collective Action to End Child Labour in Supply Chains. ILO. https://childlabourplatform.org/action/child-labour-platform-14th-annual-meeting-from-the-ground-up/

²¹⁶ Cocoa Talks, Sustainable Cocoa Initiative. (2021). *EU virtual multi-stakeholder roundtables on sustainable cocoa—First round of dialogues: Report on meetings held in 2021*. European Commission.

²¹⁷ On page 2 of Cocoa Talks, Sustainable Cocoa Initiative. (2023, February 14). Information session on the EU Regulation on Deforestation-Free Products. European Commission.

²¹⁸ Living Income Community of Practice (Undated), https://www.living-income.com/

²¹⁹ Although not through formalized demands, like the EU due diligence requirements, consumers and advocacy groups require proof that companies are not selling cocoa products grown or made with CL/FL or that have involved environmental degradation in the countries of origin.

funding and efforts are pooled, it is harder to attribute change and full protection of the value chain. As some interviewees pointed out, this impedes the conduct of joint programming to address child labor and forced labor.

There are further increasing collaborations among platforms, notably among the European country Initiatives on Sustainable Cocoa (ISCO), with one another and with the ICI. There are five European ISCO platforms, each of which comprises private-sector representatives, government, civil society, and other stakeholders, depending on the ISCO.

Exhibit 7. List of European Initiatives on Sustainable Cocoa²²⁰

Name	Year established
Beyond Chocolate (Partnership for a more sustainable Belgian cocoa sector)	2018
French Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa (FRISCO)	2021
German Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa (GISCO)	2012
Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa (DISCO)	2020
Swiss Platform for Sustainable Cocoa (SWISSCO)	2018

The five ISCOs signed a memorandum of understanding (MoU) to affirm their collaboration to achieve a more sustainable cocoa sector.²²¹ Although they have some overlapping goals on environmental protection (notably, halting deforestation), ending child labor, and improving farmer incomes/living income, there are some differences between their goals and their emphases on the goals that they have in common.

The ISCOs also have some differences in type of governance, which means that collaboration is not necessarily as straightforward as may be expected, although the intention to work together is clear. The secretariat of Beyond Chocolate and DISCO is based in the IDH, which is an NGO that convenes, "co-creates, and co-finances inclusive and sustainable solutions that enable people in business, investment, and government to create value for people and the planet." The secretariat for GISCO is under the German international development agency *Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit* (GiZ). SWISSCO is coordinated by a nonprofit association, and the secretariat of the French Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa (FRISCO) is based in the professional services firm Deloitte.

²²⁰ While Switzerland is not a member of the EU it is a European country.

²²¹ Beyond Chocolate, DISCO, SWISSCO, GISCO. (2021). The National Platforms for Sustainable Cocoa in Europe: Alignment & collaboration. PDF. Beyond Chocolate, DISCO, SWISSCO, GISCO.

²²² IDH. (2023). IDH: *Together, transforming markets*. IDH. https://www.idhsustainabletrade.com

The collaborations of the ISCOs are now aiming to go beyond information exchanges to develop and streamline the implementation and monitoring of initiatives to reduce child labor and forced labor. Recently, the collaboration of the ISCOs and ICI has been focused on developing common progress indicators to measure the results of the initiatives being undertaken. In September 2023, the ISCOs jointly hosted a working group meeting to explore insights and queries on ways to jointly mitigate child labor within the framework of broader landscape approaches. Around 60 participants from the industry, civil society, research, and government sectors, as well as from international development organizations, joined the event in Geneva.

There are still many aspects to be resolved, however, including the differing backgrounds and areas of focus of the different ISCOs. However, the importance of developing more integrated and synergistic programs to address child labor and forced labor is undeniable. The following are subjects to be considered to strengthen a more unified approach:

- Area-based programs addressing child labor. These programs can be implemented by a single entity or a consortium. Their goal is to achieve progress at the local area level, (e.g., district, group of communities) with a potential focus on a specific sector.
- Coordinated action within a "child labor landscape approach." This approach strives for better coordination and collaboration among actors operating in a defined zone, identifying potential synergies and joint actions, often under the leadership of one convening partner.
- Landscape approaches with a primary focus on ecological challenges. These landscape
 approaches emphasize ecological objectives while integrating social concerns and
 recognizing their interconnectivity. The aim is to involve all local stakeholders in the
 landscape.

In 2020 the Platform for Sustainable Cocoa in Developing Countries was established with the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) as the secretariat.²²³ As of September 2022, the platform had 48 members, including cocoa value chain companies and NGOs. The platform goals include addressing social issues, such as child labor and poverty, as well as deforestation. The platform released its Action Plan to Eliminate Child Labour in the Cocoa Industry in October 2022.²²⁴ One of the members is Japan's leading chocolate manufacturer, Meiji, which is the first Japanese company to join ICI.

²²³ Meiji. (2022). *Meiji Joins the platform for sustainable cocoa in developing countries and declares support for Action Plan to Eliminate Child Labour in the Cocoa Industry*. Meiji

²²⁴ The report is only available in Japanese. JICA. (2022). Press release. Action Plan to Eliminate Child Labour in the Cocoa Industry by the Platform for Sustainable Cocoa in Developing Countries. JICA.

 $https://www.jica.go.jp/Resource/english/news/press/2022/20221012_42.html\#: ``:text=The\%20Platform\%20for\%20Sustainable \%20Cocoa\%20in\%20Developing\%20Countries\%20(the\%20Cocoa,\%2C\%20economically\%2C\%20and\%20environmentally\%20sus tainable$

5.13 **Good Practices Overview**

A good practice should inherently be replicable to qualify as an example for future initiatives. Nevertheless, it is important to consider that successful replication depends on the context. A wide range of meta-analyses indicates that there is no single good practice that solves all child labor and forced labor issues.²²⁵ Rather, a systems approach is necessary to address the challenges causing child labor and forced labor in an integrated and synergistic manner.

It is for this reason that some programs/projects, as a whole—rather than attempts to replicate some individual components that appear to be useful—have a good impact. Project evaluations may identify factors that contribute to good results, but determining the key factors and the way to use them in different contexts is not necessarily straightforward.

Reporting good practices normally requires one of at least two prerequisites: (1) must come from a database or report on already assessed or evaluated practices that have been identified as examples that meet as many as possible of the criteria of a good practice. That is, they should be effective and successful; innovative and creative; environmentally, economically, and socially sustainable; genderand vulnerable-group-sensitive; technically feasible; participatory; and replicable and adaptable. Or (2) must be self-reported by implementers with satisfactory information proving application of objective measures to determine whether the practices are indeed good. Unfortunately, there are few objectively assessed good practices in self-reported information that implementers have provided.

Some broadly applied practices for reducing child labor have proved useful over time by positive evidence from thorough field testing. These good practices include the CLMRS child protection systems approach, including a focus on child labor, and similar approaches to reducing child labor. Several interviewees noted that CLMRS was costly to implement. This was attributed to the cost of implementing all the needed steps, from community awareness raising of the negative impact of child labor to identification and support of households with cases of—or risk of—child labor, to withdrawal of the child from child labor and then monitoring their work status.

In almost no case can good practices be said to be absolutely "best" because there are always possible challenges related to their implementation. Review of many reports on good practices indicates that challenges include not only the possible cost of a good practice but the complexity of implementing a practice in possibly low resource settings. The technical capacities of implementers may be good, and they may have the logistical support needed to go to remote places, for example, but replication may be difficult if resources are limited. A straightforward

²²⁵ICI. (2020). The effects of income changes on child labour: A review of evidence from smallholder agriculture. ICI. UNICEF. (2020). Mapping child labour risks in global value chains. Better Business for Children – Advancing Child Rights and Business.

challenge, like poor roads, may impede a good practice like building schools in cocoa communities if the cost of transport is very high because of these conditions.

In the case of forced labor, there are few if any established good practices already specifically applied in the cocoa value chain. The Verité²²⁶ FLIP project includes verifiable good practices in terms of capacity strengthening for identification of forced labor.

One of the most important good practices for reducing child labor, including in cocoa, is using a multisectoral thematic approach. Research in different settings has proven that addressing child labor using unilateral methods, such as focusing only on education, is not sufficient to attain results.²²⁷ The main reason is that the causes of child labor often begin with poverty, but unless other challenges are also addressed, results are likely to be limited. Some of the types of initiatives, in addition to poverty reduction and access to education, that need to be undertaken have been discussed in this report.²²⁸

This report will highlight some of the good practice results that may be of special interest. If a good practice is not included, that does not mean that it has no value; it is not possible to cite all good practices here.

A study implemented for USDOL²²⁹ on good practices that USDOL has funded on cocoa (and fishing/seafood) indicates that the main successes centered on the processes used to implement the initiatives. This report will not reiterate all the findings because they can be accessed by reading the entire report. However, a few main points are useful:

- Projects with few components or few links between components showed lower average effectiveness than projects that did not have this design characteristic.
- Projects with gender-aware design and gender-specific programming were more effective;
- Projects with engaged family members, community leaders, and unions were more effective;
- Projects using a subcontracting model to deliver programming, such as improvements to local education access or quality, through local NGOs or community—based organizations, were more effective on average;

²²⁶ Verité. (2023). *FLIP in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana*. https://verite.org/forced-labor-indicators-project/

²²⁷ UNICEF. (2019). Ending child labour through a multisectoral approach. UNICEF.

Zegers, M. C. R., & Ayenor, G. K. (2021, June). Ending child labour. European Commission.

²²⁸ E.g., access to health and other social services; good infrastructure, including roads; water, sanitation and hygiene (WASH); social protection; and decent work conditions for youth and adults.

²²⁹ Meuth Alldredge, J., & Liuzzi, S. (2022). *Final report: Synthesis review of OCFT work in cocoa and fishing/seafood.* Mathematica.

- Projects that supported target governments with long-term, outcome-based multiintervention planning were more effective; and
- Projects with tripartism (government, workers', and employers' organization involvement) were associated with project effectiveness; in cocoa, in particular, having an explicit tripartite structure was strongly associated with project effectiveness.

ICI has assessed its work in a number of areas and found different practices to be useful. This includes practices such as the use of a mobile application for the CLMRS implementation. ²³⁰ Key to using the mobile application is the involvement of a monitoring and remediation agent, who works with and supervises and validates the data that community facilitators have collected. ICI has found that using female field officers is more effective, as is using an agent who has an already existing relationship with the farming family they are monitoring (for example, because they are members of the same community or because they have friendship or family relations). ²³¹ Another good practice that ICI has identified is the linking of VSLAs with the formal banking sector because this helps members obtain larger loans to undertake diverse and more profitable activities. ²³²

The ILO has identified some relevant good practices through its ACCEL Africa project;²³³ the Extending Universal Health Care Coverage to Cocoa Farmers initiative, which helps strengthen access to health insurance by identifying already existing government institutions and programs that provide these services; and allocating appropriate partners from private-sector institutions to support these services.²³⁴ Another good practice is the implementation of the Work Improvement in Neighbourhood Development (WIND) approach. This good practice focuses on supporting safer work and improved living and environmental conditions. The initiative assists agricultural actors to take voluntary and low-cost measures to improve their working and living conditions.²³⁵ This approach aims at improving the occupational safety and health of individual workers, as well as of their families and communities. The initiative is a collaboration between labor inspection and rural development services working with community members.

²³⁰ ICI, (2022). Annual report 2021. ICI.

²³¹ ICI. (2023). Spotlight on Child Labour Monitoring and Remediation System (CLMRS) agents. ICI.

²³² ICI. (2023). Savings and loans: The importance of linking VSLAs to the formal banking system in cocoa-growing areas. ICI.

²³³ ILO. (2023). Good practices: Knowledge sharing for partnerships on the elimination of child labour in supply chains. ILO. https://www.ilo.org/africa/technical-cooperation/accel-africa/WCMS 867045/lang--en/index.htm

²³⁴ Details available in ILO ACCEL Africa. (2023) *Côte d'Ivoire—Extending universal health insurance coverage to cocoa farming communities*. ILO.

²³⁵ The lead researcher for the current study has viewed this method used in an ILO project in Cambodia and evaluated the WIND method positively, as contributing effectively to improved occupational safety and health conditions of community members.

Nestlé's Income Accelerator Programme²³⁶ provides four annual conditional cash transfers to farmers in Côte d'Ivoire to stimulate behavioral change, including elimination of child labor on their farm. The cash transfer is sent to farmers' phones, with half going to the husband and half to the wife, allowing women to spend or invest the money as they see fit. Farmers can expect to receive approximately US\$500 per year if they meet the necessary conditions. Several stakeholders who were interviewed referred to the Income Accelerator Programme as being of interest. A midterm evaluation of the 4-year program assessed it as a good practice.

The microfinance group Advans partners with the Consultative Group to Assist the Poor to strengthen the financial inclusion of cocoa farmers in Côte d'Ivoire through digital financial services that help these farmers access school loans using mobile technology.²³⁷

The cofinancing projects and co-implementation of projects by traders, brands, retailers, NGOs, and knowledge institutions were found to be good practices. This was because of the level of commitment of the partners resulting from their joint efforts. The projects utilized: "A living income for cocoa farmers in Côte d'Ivoire: a chainwide collaboration to move from concept to reality" which focused on production method improvements, economic diversification, and VSLA setup and strengthening. Another project was the sustainable organic and high-quality cocoa production for the cooperative Yeyasso in Côte d'Ivoire, and yet another was the Cocoa Household Income Diversification Project. These projects did not have specific child labor and forced labor components but aimed to reduce poverty and, in turn, reduce reliance on child labor.

Various agencies and companies are integrating GPS polygon mapping to identify changes in land use and forest cover. This good practice appears to be generalized among many companies in the value chain, as well as partnerships with organizations such as the Rainforest Alliance. Although GPS polygon mapping is mostly focused on deforestation, there is a direct link between deforestation and challenges surrounding child labor and forced labor. Services, for example, access to education and health, are particularly difficult in deforested areas, so reliance on child

²³⁶ Nestlé. ((2022). The Income Accelerator Program: How it works. Nestlé.

²³⁷ For details, see Advans Group. (2018). Blog. Digital financial services to boost the financial inclusion of cocoa farmers in Côte d'Ivoire. Advans Group. https://www.advansgroup.com/media/news/blog-digital-financial-services-to-boost-the-financial-inclusion-of-cocoa-farmers-in-cote-

 $[\]label{lem:divoire} divoire/? ADMCMD_prev=IGNORE\& module Token=467a21a82bf37cf200e39ecaef1ed9315754ad1d\& cHash=617f7ca4fb62a57be13731e419e85187$

²³⁸ Beyond Chocolate. (2022). *Annual report 2021*. Beyond Chocolate-IDH.

²³⁹ Puratos (2023), Bridging the Gap Towards a Living Income for the Cacao-Trace Farmer Community in Ivory Coast. Project 2. Available from: https://www.puratos.com/news/Bridging_the_gap_towards_a_living_income_for_Cacao-Trace_farmers

labor and forced labor is particularly high. Various companies are financing the application of GPS polygon mapping, ²⁴⁰ including Ferrero, Cargill, Hershey, Mars, Blommer, and Tony's Chocolonely.

Further, the Ofi Farmer Information System is a proprietary platform that uses GPS and detailed surveys. ²⁴¹ This system takes the mapping another step forward by mapping GPS points of farms and social infrastructure; managing training activities; and tracking all "first mile" transactions, including financing, input distribution, and crop purchases. This information is used to advise farmers and other participants in the supply chain.

FBOs are also implementing good practices, such as the Kuapa Kokoo Labour Rights project, with farmers.²⁴² After a successful pilot period, Kuapa Kokoo is scaling up the project to help more tenant farmers have written agreements with landowners and farmers that require the two parties to meet good standards of practice and behavior and also protect their rights.

Several implementers and donors are promoting the use and sponsoring the implementation of human rights due diligence activities, such as grievance mechanisms, complaint and remediation procedures, and employee contracts as good practices. The implementers of such activities/mechanisms include companies such as Tony's Chocolonely and agencies such as the Rainforest Alliance.²⁴³

Several stakeholder interviewees mentioned as a good practice the development of risk assessment tools that helped identify and support vulnerable households more efficiently. The USDOL-financed MATE MASIE project, in Ghana, and Tony's Chocolonely are some entities that are using such tools. ICI has conducted an analysis of the accuracy of these tools, ²⁴⁴ finding that such models can be highly effective, with the most successful correctly predicting child labor in more than 95% of cases. This means that there is, indeed, a potentially good practice in using the risk assessment tools. However, ICI's study did find that the accuracy of the tools and the quality of data depended on the context and, further, that other factors such as the ethics of data collection and interpretation of data were important considerations.

The most interesting results regarding the identification of (potential) good practices in this research have come from interviews. The level of enthusiasm of interviewees when discussing the question on best or good practices, though perhaps subjective, did help understanding the areas with the most current and future potential. In addition to the suggestions that stakeholder

²⁴⁰ Ferrero. (2023). Sustainability report 2022. Ferrero.

²⁴¹ Olam. (n.d.). *Olam Farmer Information System: Ending the isolation of rural farming and boosting traceability*. Olam. https://www.olamgroup.com/sustainability/innovation-technology/farmgate/olam-farmer-information-system.html

²⁴² Kuapa Kokoo. (n.d.). Labour Rights Project. Kuapa Kokoo. https://kuapakokoo.com/projects/labour_right

²⁴³Rainforest Alliance. (2021). *Project PROFILE: Tackling Forced Labor and Child Labor in the Ghanaian Cocoa and Gold Mining Sectors*. Rainforest Alliance. https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/in-the-field/tackling-forced-labor-and-child-labor-in-ghana-sectors-project/

²⁴⁴ ICI. (2022). Annual report 2021. ICI.

interviewees proposed for strengthening workers' organizations and FBOs, these stakeholders proposed good practices based on their own experience and observations from field-level implementation of initiatives. These are summarized in Exhibit 8 below.

Exhibit 8. Good Practices, According to Research Stakeholders

Good practices

International good practices

Interacting and collaborating with agencies working on child labor and forced labor in other subject areas, such as cotton, tobacco, hazelnuts, and shrimp, to understand lessons learned and good practices used

Local government-level good practices

Implementing an integrated area-based district- and community-wide approach to ending child labor in a designated areas and ensuring that children do not move from work in cocoa to other types of child labor

Linking initiatives on child labor and forced labor directly to rural development programs

Supporting and strengthening public institutions to improve and implement services to support vulnerable producers

Including information on decent work for all and available social security coverage in training of service providers on child labor and forced labor

Applying existing labor laws and prosecution of perpetrators to heighten awareness of communities, including individuals who may violate laws and regulations.

Farmer-based organizations' good practices

Widely sharing and training cooperatives and community members to use tools developed to help identify cases of child labor and forced labor and the way to refer identified cases

Promoting mutual learning among cooperatives on issues regarding environmental sustainability and child labor and forced labor free standards, preferably through in-person meetings among cooperative members

Working with cooperatives to help them become certified to sell their cocoa beans as meeting environmental sustainability and child labor and forced labor -free standards

Strengthening the financial capacities of producers and their professional organizations to enable them to finance actions to prevent and remedy child and forced labor

Community-level good practices

Supporting implementation of VLSA mechanisms

Developing and/or supporting (existing) community-based mutual aid systems, which may consist of organized mutual physical labor support to assist during periods of high need in the cocoa farming period; pooling of money at community level to create a fund for microloans available for households in need (can be separate from VSLA systems to allow for a more flexible credit system for community members)

Ensuring that awareness raising has a strong focus on what constitutes child labor, child work, hazardous work by age, in accordance with country definitions

Working through agricultural extension agents (whether government or private-sector extension agents) and associating them with raising awareness and addressing child labor and forced labor

Involvement of children and young adults as actors in the implementation of child labor and forced labor reduction initiatives

6. Building More Effective Collaboration and Creating Synergies: Human-Centered Development and the Portfolio Approach

Because of the challenges identified in planning and collaboration in multistakeholder platforms, it is useful to consider organized approaches to strengthening the collaboration and planning processes. Human-centered development and the portfolio approach can combine to improve the functioning of child labor and forced labor multistakeholder platforms. Human-centered design places people at the core of a development challenge to create concrete solutions with their full participation. The method is highly inclusive, working directly with users—the people who use the service or deliver the solution—to develop new ideas that are viable and appropriate in their context, through continual testing of solutions.

The UNDP's portfolio approach²⁴⁶ is a systems approach to the strategic planning, management, and coordination of a collection of development projects and programs within a specific geographical or thematic area. This approach involves grouping together related initiatives and interventions under a unified framework to achieve greater effectiveness, efficiency, and impact.

IDH has developed the collaborative transformation approach, which is also of interest.²⁴⁷ In an overview of IDH's experiences with this approach, the initiative describes a five-dimensional approach to developing suitable frameworks among multistakeholder platforms.

Another approach, design thinking,²⁴⁸ is a problem-solving and innovation methodology that emphasizes a human-centered way of finding solutions. The design thinking process typically consists of several steps, starting with building empathy to better understand the user's situation. This is followed by defining well the problem that is to be solved and idea generation. Next, prototyping is performed to allow for the testing and refining of concepts through an iterative process. The USDOL-funded CACAO project that Save the Children is implementing in Côte d'Ivoire is using the Design Thinking methodology. Although design thinking methodology is of interest, it is more suitable to specific small programs rather than large complex frameworks for which the portfolio approach may be more suitable. Nevertheless, some aspects of design

²⁴⁵ UNICEF. (2019). Human-centred design: Accelerating results for every child by design. UNICEF.

²⁴⁶ UNDP. (2022). System change: A guidebook for adopting portfolio approaches. UNDP.

²⁴⁷ Oorthuizen, J., Vermaak, J., Romeu Dalmau, C., Papaemmanuel, E. (2018). Collaborative transformation: The art of making international trade more sustainable. IDH, Wageningen Academic Publishers.

²⁴⁸ E.g., UNICEF. (2018). Human-centered (child-centered) design thinking in support of the design process of the new UNICEF Malawi country programme 2119–2023. UNICEF.

thinking may be used to develop and implement initiatives identified through a wider portfolio approach framework.

7. Conclusions and Recommendations

The conclusions and recommendations presented in this research require a comprehensive and flexible approach to implementation. Continuous verification of the effects of the steps undertaken to reduce child labor and forced labor will be needed on a regular basis and in an integrated manner.

Since 2019, there have been positive changes in terms of strengthened collaboration, coverage, and (new) directions in the efforts to reduce child and forced labor in cocoa in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. However, there are still many aspects that need attention in order to reach better levels of impact on the reduction of child labor and forced labor.

Currently, the focus on eliminating child labor at a household level has rightly expanded to consider many contextual issues and child well-being overall. This means focus on encompassing the availability of social services—including education—social protection coverage, functioning of workers' organizations and FBOs and their voices, deforestation, and other environmental aspects. In addition, the need to ensure that child labor is reduced consistently in communities, and not just among children currently working in cocoa, has gained recognition. For this reason, broader landscape approaches, which include many areas of focus in common with rural development initiatives, are increasingly discussed during planning for more effective and impactful results for reducing child labor and forced labor. Outcomes associated with IABA, with the creation of CLFZ, have been tested and are being scaled up to address consistently child labor challenges in cocoa production areas.

There are many multistakeholder platforms, each with its own history and main orientation/vision to address all these issues. While there is overlap of many of the multistakeholder platforms on certain topics, such as ensuring at least a living income for farmers, there are varying priorities or areas of emphasis. While multistakeholder platforms are essential to achieving real results in the reduction of child labor and forced labor, the research findings indicate that streamlining and avoiding redundancies will be more effective and efficient.

Poverty remains the main cause of child labor and forced labor, and a fair income for all involved in cocoa production is necessary. However, this is not the only cause. In fact, this research reaffirms that addressing only one aspect, such as poverty, will not solve the challenges of child labor and forced labor in the cocoa value chain. A multipronged approach is necessary, using a synergistic collaboration among stakeholders—that is, from the governments of Côte d'Ivoire

and Ghana, with inputs and support from the private sector to multi- and bilateral donors to national and international technical experts. It is important to note that the voices of workers' organizations and FBOs are essential to ensuring the appropriateness of measures undertaken, as well as to reaching farmers throughout the cocoa-producing areas.

Poverty reduction means fair pricing of cocoa and real remuneration directly to farmers to improve the socioeconomic situation of their households and reduce dependency on child labor and forced labor. Support for the diversification of incomes to reduce dependency on cocoa is important, especially so to spread risk in case of natural or other disasters. Improved availability and management of savings and credit schemes, as well as better access to social protection mechanisms, are other aspects to consider. Improved roads to reduce the cost of transport of production inputs for cocoa and the cocoa beans themselves can also indirectly contribute to greater efficiencies, which should be used to benefit farmers. Further, improving efficiency and safety in cocoa production contributes to increased incomes. Application of methods to reduce accidents and illnesses caused by occupationally unsafe production technologies helps to simultaneously reduce the loss of income from such events.

Although awareness of issues regarding the dangers of child labor has increased in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, forced labor remains a subject that is not yet sufficiently covered. Awareness raising on subjects such as how and where to report child labor and forced labor and available grievance mechanisms for community members is as yet too limited.

There is still scope for better collection and consolidation of data at the local and national levels on child labor and forced labor reduction initiatives and their impact to inform decision making. Data gathering and sharing of data to ensure that lessons learned, implementation challenges identified, and good practices achieved are actually used to inform future efforts were challenges repeatedly identified throughout the research. While the various multistakeholder platforms discuss some of the data, the concrete use of data for planning still needs greater attention, using methodologically appropriate means.

The need to strengthen technical and logistics capacities at a local level to provide services to cocoa communities remains clear. The reduction of dependence on nonstate actors (international development agencies, including foundations and NGOs) instead of on local government to provide services is necessary for long-term sustainability. For this purpose, increased funding of local government services so that they can work directly and sustainably with communities on child labor and forced labor reduction is key. Together with technical strengthening and support for logistics, including transport, impact of child labor and forced labor reduction initiatives will be exponentially increased, particularly if accompanied by improved infrastructure, such as schools, health provision structures, and upgraded roads.

There are increased efforts to involve and strengthen workers' organizations and FBOs, but the potential of these efforts to contribute to addressing child labor and forced labor is not being fully realized. While not all cocoa farmers are members of cooperatives and other farmer associations, many are. Efforts to reach more farmers to organize and formalize them are underway, thus increasing the reach of workers' organizations and FBOs. The necessity of increasing focus on including their voices and their local representatives to contribute to reduction of child labor and forced labor in cocoa is evident.

This research found that there is still scope to improve the functioning of the CLCCG. Some aspects are similar to the need to join in streamlining the multistakeholder platforms. However, the need to expand membership of the CLCCG to create greater diversity of inputs from key stakeholders is crucial. Further, as is relevant throughout all initiatives, the more concrete integration of specific forced-labor-reduction methods and initiatives can be scaled up. Recommendations are provided below in Exhibit 9.

Exhibit 9. Recommendations

No.	Recommendation, by thematic area	Priority: high (H) medium (M)	Key responsible entities
	mmendations for Thematic Area 1: Alignment among stakehol rnment strategies/plans	lders and with p	roducer
1	 Increase efforts of international stakeholders to recognize and work with Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana governments at national strategy and planning level on child labor and forced labor but also with local government offices in cocoa-producing areas. Increase emphasis and funding among stakeholders to better align, network, and create synergies to reduce child labor and forced labor. Address and reduce the proliferation of multistakeholder platforms with their frameworks to address child labor and forced labor. Review potential for integration of multistakeholder platforms where possible to reduce redundancies. Establish greater coherence among frameworks to reduce child labor and forced labor. Scale up alignment with and among national stakeholders to include their representatives more comprehensively in all discussions. Ensure clearly identified roles and responsibilities across platforms and their members. Apply organization development methods to increase focus on 	H	Governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana; relevant national and international participants in multisectoral platforms

No.	Recommendation, by thematic area	Priority: high (H) medium (M)	Key responsible entities
	strengthening leadership, coordination, and accountability mechanisms at all levels and for all initiatives and value chain steps. Review possibility of using methods such as the UNDP portfolio systems approach to achieve more integrated, systematic, and streamlined processes to reduce child labor and forced labor.		
	 Ensure that child labor elimination is directly cited and fully integrated into all economic development policies and plans, especially in agriculture-related economic activities or investments. Include reference to child labor and forced labor in the design and monitoring of the plans. 		
2	Strengthen integration of USAID's initiatives in Côte d'Ivoire with USDOL and other donor-financed initiatives for reducing child labor and forced labor.	М	U.S. government agencies
3	Continue to improve and/or strengthen existing partnerships and cross border agreements among the ECOWAS countries — Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Burkina Faso, and Mali. Including attention to support for reintegration of returnees.	M	Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana governments
4	Plan and integrate efforts on forced labor with those on child labor. Where appropriate, develop systems to address issues specific to adult forced labor, including application of labor laws for adults. Provide support for labor contracts of workers in cocoa farms, including for temporary workers.	Н	Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana governments, UN agencies, funding agencies including private sector and NGOs
Reco	mmendations for Thematic Area 2: Poverty reduction		
5	 Strengthen efforts to increase cocoa farmers' incomes: Focus more on closing the economic gaps to ensure decent living income. Raise household income in cocoa growing communities through application of the living income differential and other income support to farming households, such as rewards for participating in and being certified by fair trade and any other financial transfers to augment income. Increase provision of financial education and support for diversification of incomes, including income generating 	Н	All stakeholders

No.	Recommendation, by thematic area	Priority: high (H) medium (M)	Key responsible entities
	activities with marketable products and services, economic empowerment of women and youth. Support improved links of VSLAs and other community credit and savings schemes to formal banking systems, including mobile banks.		
6	Increase focus on strengthening national social protection systems to address the needs of cocoa farmers and workers, including access to safety nets (e.g., cash transfers to vulnerable families in cocoa production areas), pensions, health care and accident insurance, and agricultural production insurance. Identify methods to overcome potential challenges to the effective and efficient implementation of social protection and associated social safety nets.	H	Governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, with technical inputs from national and international experts
7	Increase focus on developing improved working conditions for older children, youth, and adults (decent work), differentiating and adapting work to reduce hazards and cost of accidents and illnesses resulting from exposure to hazardous work conditions. Ensure that this differentiation allows nonhazardous work for older children within decent work conditions, in line with international ratified conventions, and national legal and regulatory frameworks. Ensure that adapted occupational safety and hazards reduction measures consider practical aspects, such as climate-appropriate protective clothing and shoes, to ensure actual use in practice.	M	Governments of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, with technical inputs from national and international experts
Reco	mmendations for Thematic Area 3: Data to strengthen knowle	edge manageme	nt quality at all
8	Increase and strengthen collaboration to ensure that national data systems function for planning and other purposes. Ensure that all entities that work on reducing child labor and forced labor participate in and contribute to the local government and national data systems on child labor and forced labor. Go beyond data gathering and ensure that lessons learned, implementation challenges are identified, and good practices are used to inform future efforts.	Н	Government Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana with technical inputs from national, international experts
9	Undertake research to determine the exact geographic and cocoa farming household coverage of child labor and forced labor initiatives. Link and register to digital Polygon mapping/global information systems for on-going monitoring and evaluation of coverage levels, improvements	M	All expert stakeholders

No.	Recommendation, by thematic area	Priority: high (H) medium (M)	Key responsible entities
	in reduction of child labor and forced labor. Determine overlap with deforestation challenges using these mapping mechanisms. Develop methods to overcome challenges to using digital technologies to identify and monitor farms and households vulnerable to or engaged in child labor and forced labor.		
Reco	ommendations for Thematic Area 4: Awareness raising		
10	Continue awareness raising and increase focus on community behavior change methods to change actual behavior. Continue to improve the presentation of child labor and forced labor subjects in the media (in producer and consumer countries). Increase focus on forced labor issues. In consumer countries, increase focus on how consumers can support households in cocoa-producing countries through supporting initiatives that ensure fair payment to farmers and workers, decent work conditions.	M	Implementing agencies in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, in consumer countries include media experts
11	Integrate information in awareness raising on how to:	Н	Implementing
	 Report cases of child labor and forced labor Use grievance mechanisms on any (other) issues that farmers and their families may face. How to access services to improve cocoa production and sales. 		agencies in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana
Reco	ommendations for Thematic Area 5: Local government service	provision at the	community level
12	Conduct capacity analysis to identify the strengths, weaknesses and opportunities of all government services and actors on local development planning and implementation to reduce child labor and forced labor. Include assessment of access to and quality of formal/nonformal education, social welfare services social protection coverage, integration of child labor and forced labor in technical capacities of labor inspectors, police/gendarmes/others in justice system, agriculture extension workers, government micro and small enterprise service providers. Based on results per district/sous-préfecture, develop adapted technical capacity strengthening programs and logistics support (including for transport) to and from communities. Identify funding mechanisms to implement initiatives of government service providers at community level.	Very high as it is foundational to the implementati on of many other recommenda tions and other effective interventions	Government of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana with technical inputs from national, international experts

No.	Recommendation, by thematic area	Priority: high (H) medium (M)	Key responsible entities
13	Strengthen local government child protection systems and the integration of child labor into the system ensuring comprehensive identification of inter-related child protection related subjects. This includes ensuring that assessment of child labor cases is conducted with attention to a child's other vulnerabilities/experience with other forms of exploitation, abuse, neglect, disability, lack of birth certificates, and others. Strengthen links between child labor initiatives at community level with local support for child protection systems.	Н	Government of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana with technical inputs from national, international experts
14	Include local women's groups and youth groups in all activities to address child labor and forced labor. Promote inclusion of community members such as persons with disabilities, affected by HIV, migrants, and trafficked persons in discussions.	M	Implementing agencies in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana
15	In addition to Village Savings and Loan Associations (VSLAs), support development of other mutual aid systems at community level that cover labor sharing, social assistance including to migrant workers/vulnerable households, rental of farming related tools and equipment.	M	Implementing agencies in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana
16	Improve quality and access to general education and technical and vocational education and skills training (TVEST). Including well-planned school feeding programs and education on children's rights and decent work in agriculture. Ensure that TVEST extends to cover innovative and agriculture related subjects with use of modern/appropriate technologies.	Н	Government of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana with donors and technical experts
17	Increase construction of physical infrastructure with an emphasis on roads, accessible schools, health, child protection infrastructure, water/sanitation/hygiene (WASH). Particularly ensure access to WASH in or near schools with special attention to safe access for girls.	Н	Government of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana with donors and technical experts

No.	Recommendation, by thematic area	Priority: high (H) medium (M)	Key responsible entities
	mmendations for Thematic Area 6: Landscape approach, integreation of child-labor-free zones	grated area-base	ed approach with
18	Develop mechanisms to integrate efforts to reduce child labor and forced labor in cocoa into broader schemes, notably IABA/CLFZ and landscape approaches in specific geographic areas. Work with local government, schools, and other stakeholders in the zone to create a child-positive and decent work environment. Conduct a review of the ways in which IABA/CLFZ can best	Н	Government of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, with technical inputs from national and international
	be integrated into landscape approaches. Determine how landscape approaches can best be integrated into Government planned rural development frameworks and activities.		experts
	ommendations for Thematic Area 7: Strengthening the role of volumes	workers' and far	mer-based
19	Define and ensure fair representation of cocoa farmers and workers in the governance framework of the national strategies on sustainable cocoa and for the elaboration and monitoring of periodic national action plans on child labor and forced labor. Ensure their involvement in the implementation and monitoring review and coordination meetings to follow up the implementation of the National Action Plans; national Cocoa Sustainability Strategies; agricultural and rural development policies; and governance of the cocoa sector and public private partnerships.	Н	Workers' and FBOs' representatives, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana governments, implementing agencies, and technical advisors
20	Strengthen capacities of workers' organizations/FBOs on child labor and forced labor issues and establish mechanisms for workers' organizations/FBOs to use to address child labor and forced labor. Include focus to ensure workers' organizations and FBOs are aware of, and can implement, grievance mechanisms so that case management can be effectively and sensitively implemented. Establish government specialized structures to assist cooperatives to combat child labor and forced labor. Adjust capacity strengthening support for workers' organizations and FBOs in line with their individual needs and context.	Н	Workers' and FBOs' representatives, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana Governments, implementing agencies and technical advisers.
21	Develop a monitoring and evaluation mechanism to measure workers' organizations/FBOs progress on the fight against child labor within each workers' and farmers' organization that is adapted and aligned with their needs. Ensure and hold workers' organizations and FBOs	M	Workers' and FBOs' representatives, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana

No.	Recommendation, by thematic area	Priority: high (H) medium (M)	Key responsible entities
	accountable that they go beyond integrating child labor and forced labor into their action plans and actually engage with their members on the child labor and forced labor.		Governments, implementing agencies and technical advisers.
22	Design and/or disseminate existing tools developed to address child labor and forced labor to be used within workers' organizations and FBOs. Tools should include identification of cases of child and forced labor at local level and link them to local child protection and labor rights reporting systems.	H	Workers' and FBOs' representatives, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana Governments, implementing agencies and technical advisers.
23	Scale up capacity strengthening of the leadership of FBOs on leadership skills and organizational/administrative management as a strong and coherent administrative structure can help address child labor and forced labor. Resource and furnish FBOs with the necessary materials and tools for effective leadership and management of their farmer organization and to implement initiatives on child labor and forced labor. Support capacity of Trade Unions to expand operations to more cocoa growing communities including facilitating registration and management of the processes.	M	Workers' and FBOs' representatives, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana Governments, implementing agencies and technical advisers.
24	Develop partnerships with workers' organizations/FBOs to scale up the support for vulnerable families with economic empowerment initiatives such as diversification of incomes, social safety nets, savings and credit schemes.	M	Workers' and FBOs' representatives, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana Governments, implementing agencies
25	Strengthen collaboration and alignment between different worker organizations, FBOs and other cocoa-related associations and Government offices. Relevant organizations ensure that this is implemented at national and decentralized local level.	M	Workers' and FBOs' representatives, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana Governments,

No.	Recommendation, by thematic area	Priority: high (H) medium (M)	Key responsible entities
			implementing agencies.
26	Include non-agriculture-based workers' organizations such as teachers' unions, health workers/midwives in efforts to address child labor and forced labor in cocoa.	Н	Workers' and FBOs' representatives, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana Governments, implementing agencies
Reco	ommendations for Thematic Area 8: Child Labor Cocoa Coordin	ating Group stre	engthening
27	Review implications and level of expansion of CLCCG membership to be more representative of stakeholders associated with the cocoa value chain. Analyze the extent to which this can be associated with methods to streamline and better integrate the multiple multi-stakeholder platforms (see Recommendation 1). After review, determine with members if and how expansion is desirable and implement the decision.	Н	CLCCG members
28	Ensure CCLCG objectives are realistic, based on evidence that they are achievable within the timelines to be set, and aligned with the national action plans on child labor and including forced labor in both countries.	Н	CLCCG members
29	Consider renaming the CLMRS and CLCCG to indicate that forced labor is a labor rights subject to be included in the activities. Scale up attention to forced labor.	Н	CLCCG members

Appendix A. References

- Abu, I.A. Szantoi, Z.Brink, A. et al. Detecting cocoa plantations in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana and their implications on protected areas. Elsevier Sponsored Documents. Available from https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC8329934/?report=printable. Website accessed May 20, 2023. Nikolai.
- Action Aid (2022), COCOBOD to support Action Aid and GAWU to combat modern slavery.

 Available from: https://accessagric.com/cocobod-to-support-action-aid-and-gawu-to-combat-modern-slavery/
- Advans Group (2018), Blog: Digital financial services to boost the financial inclusion of cocoa farmers in Côte d'Ivoire, Available from:

 https://www.advansgroup.com/media/news/blog-digital-financial-services-to-boost-the-financial-inclusion-of-cocoa-farmers-in-cote-divoire/?ADMCMD prev=IGNORE&moduleToken=467a21a82bf37cf200e39ecaef1ed931

 5754ad1d&cHash=617f7ca4fb62a57be13731e419e85187. Advans Group.
- African Union, Specialized Technical Committee (STC) on Finance, Monetary Affairs, Economic Planning and Integration: "Developing integrated and complementary value chains for sustainable recovery and reinforcing operationalization of the AfCFTA" Available from https://au.int/en/stc-finance-2021.
- Anti-Slavery (2023), Search "cocoa". Available at: https://www.antislavery.org/?s=Cocoa
- Agarwal, M, & Kelly, L. (2004), Understanding Children's Work Program Addressing Challenges of Globalization: An Independent Evaluation of the World Bank's Approach to Global Programs Case Study. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank Operations Evaluation Department.
- Aguilar, E. (2021), ACCEL Africa Project Accelerating action for the elimination of child labour in supply chains in Africa: Supporting cooperative organizations to address root causes of child labour within an integrated area-based approach. Abidjan: ILO.
- Atlas.ti, Feature Overview. Available from https://atlasti.com/features.html
- African Organization for Standardization (ARSO) & Organisation Africaine de Normalisation (ORAN) (2021), Catalogue of African Regional Standards (ARS), Addis Ababa:

 ARSA/ORAN. Available from https://www.arso-oran.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/Catalogue-of-African-Regional-Standards-ARS-June-2021 TC.pdf

- Better Evaluation (2023) Developmental Evaluation: Developmental evaluation: Applying complexity concepts to enhance innovation & use, available from https://www.betterevaluation.org/methods-approaches/approaches/developmental-evaluation (Accessed April 20, 2023).
- Better Evaluation. (2021). *Developmental evaluation*.

 https://www.betterevaluation.org/methods-approaches/approaches/developmental-evaluation (based on Patton, M. Q., (2010). *Developmental evaluation: Applying complexity concepts to enhance innovation and use.* Guilford
- Beyond Chocolate, DISCO, SWISSCO, GISCO (2021), The National Platforms for Sustainable Cocoa in Europe: Alignment & Collaboration. PDF, publication place not available, Beyond Chocolate, DISCO, SWISSCO, GISCO.
- Buama, M.; Joras, U.; Weiskopf, B. (2022), Monitoring Report 2021. Berlin: Forum Nachhaltiger Kakao e.V. (German Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa) Forum Nachhaltiger Kakao e.V./German Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa. Page 15.
- Bureau Indépendant d'Evaluation, PNUD (2022), Évaluation Indépendante Du Programme: République Centrafricaine. New York: PNUD/UNDP.
- Bureau of Integrated Rural Development, Kwame Nkrumah University of Science
- Bymolt, R., Laven, A., Tyszler, M. (2018). Demystifying the cocoa sector in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire. Chapter 9, Cocoa producer groups, certification, training and credit. The Royal Tropical Institute (KIT)
- Child Learning and Education Facility (CLEF) (Undated), Child Learning and Education Facility, Available from: https://www.clefpartnership.com/en/our-mission/. Child Learning and Education Facility.
- Cocoa Talks, Sustainable Cocoa Initiative (2021) EU Virtual Multi-Stakeholder Roundtables on Sustainable Cocoa First Round of Dialogues, Report on meetings held in 2021.

 Brussels: European Commission.
- Government of Côte d'Ivoire, Government of Ghana, U.S. Department of Labor, International Chocolate and Cocoa Industry (2021), CLCCG Report: 2010-2020 Efforts to Reduce Child Labor in Cocoa, Washington, D.C.: United States Department of Labor.
- Chiodi, V. & Escudero, V. (2020), More is more. Livelihood interventions and child labor in the agricultural sector. Geneva: ILO.

- CNS (Undated), Accueil, Plan d'Action, Notre Mission, Available from: https://travaildesenfants.org/fr/pages/notre-mission. CNS.
- CNS (Undated). Le Nouveau Cadre Institutionnel, Available from: . CNS.
- CNS (Undated), Système d'Observation et de Suivi du Travail des Enfants en Côte d'Ivoire (SOSTECI), Available from: https://travaildesenfants.org/fr/dossier/sosteci. CNS.
- CNS (2023), Toutes les Actualités, Protection Des Enfants : La Côte d'Ivoire et les Etats-Unis d'Amérique Unissent Leurs Efforts, Available from:

 https://travaildesenfants.org/fr/actualites/protection-des-enfants-la-c-te-d-ivoire-et-les-etats-unis-d-am-rique-unissent-leurs. CNS.
- COCOBOD (2023), Women in Cocoa Cooperative Union Launched, Available from: https://cocobod.gh/news/women-in-cocoa-cooperative-union-launched. COCOBOD.
- Confectionery Production (2020), Environmental and human rights groups unite for declaration urging cocoa sustainability action. Available from:

 https://www.confectioneryproduction.com/news/30546/environmental-and-human-rights-groups-combine-for-landmark-declaration-urging-cocoa-sustainability-action/.
 Confectionery Production.
- Confectionery Production (2023), Cocoa price rises to record highs should benefit farmers, yet conditions remain challenging Available from https://www.confectioneryproduction.com/blog/45267/cocoa-price-rises-to-record-highs-should-benefit-farmers-yet-conditions-remain-challenging/.
- Coop News (2019), Cocoa co-operative launches in Ghana. The government also announced measures to support cocoa growers and is encouraging them to form into co-operatives. Available from <a href="https://www.thenews.coop/141184/sector/cocoa-co-operative-launches-ghana/#:~:text=Currently%2C%201%2C342%20co%2Dops%20have,government's%20Department%20of%20Co%2Doperatives. Coop News.
- Coopérative Agricole de Yakasse-Attobrou (CAYAT) Nous oeuvrons pour le Développment de la Production Agricole, Available from: https://cayat-ci.com/index.php. CAYAT.
- Côte d'Ivoire-Ghana Cocoa Initiative (CIGCI), About us (CIGCI), Available from: https://www.cighci.org/about-us/
- Dhillon, L. (Editor), Keene, M. (Editor), Parsons, B. (Editor), (2020), Visionary Evaluation for a Sustainable Equitable Future (2020), Edited by Parsons, B. and Dhillon, J., Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.

- DISCO (2022), Monitoring Framework, The Hague, DISCO.
- Dutch Initiative on Sustainable Cocoa (DISCO) (2022), Annual Report 2021, Utrecht: Sustainable Trade Initiative (IDH).
- European Commission (2022), Press Release: Just and sustainable economy: Commission lays down rules for companies to respect human rights and environment in global value chains, Available from: https://single-market-economy.ec.europa.eu/news/just-and-sustainable-economy-commission-lays-down-rules-companies-respect-human-rights-and-2022-02-23 en. European Commission.
- European Parliament (2020), Briefing Towards a Mandatory EU System of Due Diligence for Supply Chains. Brussels: EU Parliament.
- EVAL Academy (2023), Social Network Analysis and Evaluation: Learnings From the Evaluator and the Client. Available from: https://www.evalacademy.com/articles/social-network-analysis-what-we-learned. Website accessed June 19, 2023. EVAL Academy.
- Evalcommunity for a Better World (2023) Systems Theory in Evaluation: Understanding Complex Social Systems. Available from https://www.evalcommunity.com/career-center/systems-theory/#:~:text=Systems%20Theory%20is%20an%20approach%20to%20evaluation%20that%20emphasizes%20the,rather%20than%20just%20individual%20components.
 Website accessed April 15, 2023.
- Fairtrade Foundation (Undated), Kuapa Kokoo. Available from https://www.fairtrade.org.uk/farmers-and-workers/cocoa/kuapa-kokoo-ghana/
- Fairtrade International (Undated), Cocoa. Available from: https://www.fairtrade.net/product/cocoa
- FAO (2020), Framework on Ending Child Labour in Agriculture, Rome: FAO.
- Fifth Global Conference on the Elimination of Child Labour. Durban, 15-20 May 2022 (2022), Durban. Conference Report. Durban: 5th Global Conference on the Elimination of Child Labour.
- Fountain, A. & Huetz-Adams, F. Cocoa Barometer 2022. Voice Network: 2022. Available from https://cocoabarometer.org/en/. Website accessed March 03, 2023, September 29, 2023.

- Forwood, G., Connellon, C., Killick, J., Nordin, S. (2023), 10 Key Things to know about the new EU Deforestation Regulation. Available from: <a href="https://www.whitecase.com/insight-alert/10-key-things-know-about-new-eu-deforestation-regulation#:~:text=The%20EUDR%20sets%20out%20how,non%2Dcompliance%20with%20the%20EUDR. White & Case.
- Gearhart, J. Building Worker Power in Global Supply Chains: Lessons from Apparel, Cocoa, and Seafood. Accountability Working Paper. September 2023, Number 15.
- Ghana Commercial Bank (2022), Sector Industry Analysis-Cocoa Sector Report 2022, Accra: Ghana Commercial Bank.
- Ghana Cocoa Board (COCOBOD) (Undated), About COCOBOD: Poised to maintain Ghana's Premium Quality Cocoa. Available from https://cocobod.gh/about-us. COCOBOD.
- Global March Against Child Labor (Undated), About us. Available from: https://globalmarch.org/about-us/who-we-are.
- Gouvernement République de Côte d'Ivoire (2019), Plan d'Action National de Lutte Contre la Traite, l'exploitation et le Travail des Enfants République de Côte d'Ivoire 2019-2021 Abidjan: Gouvernement République de Côte d'Ivoire.
- Government of Ghana, UNICEF, ILO and International Cocoa Initiative (December 2017),
 National Plan of Action: Towards Achieving Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 8.7
 (PHASE II (NPA2)): For the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Ghana
 (2017–2021), Accra: Government of Ghana, UNICEF, ILO and International Cocoa
 Initiative.
- ICI (2018), Lack of education is at the root of youth issues in cocoa-growing communities. https://www.cocoainitiative.org/news/lack-education-root-youth-issues-cocoa-growing-communities.
- ICI (2020), The effects of income changes on child labour: A review of evidence from smallholder agriculture. Geneva: ICI.
- ICI (2021), Effectiveness Review of Child Labour Monitoring and Remediation Systems in the West African Cocoa Sector. Geneva: ICI.
- ICI (2022), Annual Report 2021, Geneva: ICI.
- ICI (2022), L'ICI forme les agents des droits de l'homme et de la justice administrative du Ghana à la lutte contre le travail des enfants et le travail forcé. Available from:

 https://www.cocoainitiative.org/fr/news/lici-forme-les-agents-des-droits-de-lhomme-et-de-la-justice-administrative-du-ghana-la-lutte. ICI.

- ICI (2023), Spotlight on Child Labour Monitoring and Remediation System (CLMRS) agents. Available from: https://www.cocoainitiative.org/news/spotlight-child-labour-monitoring-and-remediation-system-clmrs-agents. ICI.
- ICI (2023), Savings and loans: The importance of linking VSLAs to the formal banking system in cocoa-growing areas. Available from: https://www.cocoainitiative.org/news/savings-and-loans-importance-linking-vslas-formal-banking-system-cocoa-growing-areas. ICI.
- ICI (2021), Risk Models for Predicting Child Labour: Findings and recommendations from six projects to predict the risk of child labour in cocoa-growing households. Geneva: ICI.
- ICI (2017), Effectiveness Review of Child Labour Monitoring Systems in the Smallholder Agricultural Sector of Sub-Saharan Africa: Review of Emerging Good Practices, Geneva: ICI.
- ICI (2021), Benchmarking study: Overview and definition of child labor monitoring and remediation systems, (2021), Geneva: ICI.
- ICI (2022), Child Labour indicators Rationale, progress and next steps -ISCO Commitments Related to Child Labour Geneva: ICI.
- IDH, Beyond Chocolate, Belgium Partner in Development (2022), Beyond Chocolate Annual Report 2021. Utrecht: IDH, Beyond Chocolate, Belgium Partner in Development.
- IDH (2022), Cocoaperation, Available from: https://www.idhsustainabletrade.com/initiative/cocoaperation/. IDH.
- IDH (2023), How Landscape Approaches Can Tackle Deforestation and Shape the Future of Sustainable Supply Chains: The Case of the Cocoa Sector. Available from: https://www.idhsustainabletrade.com/news/how-landscape-approaches-can-tackle-deforestation-and-shape-the-future-of-sustainable-supply-chains-the-case-of-the-cocoa-sector/#:~:text=Landscape%20approaches%20refer%20to%20multi,sustainability%20pe rformance%20in%20that%20area.
- IDH (2023), IDH: Together, transforming markets. Available from: https://www.idhsustainabletrade.com/. IDH.
- ILO ACCEL Africa, (2023), Côte d'Ivoire Extending universal health insurance coverage to cocoa farming communities. Geneva: ILO.
- ILO ACCEL Africa, (2023), Côte d'Ivoire The WIND approach and strategic interventions on labour inspection: Improving working and living conditions through local solutions. Geneva: ILO.

- ILO (2007), Trade unions and the elimination of child labour in agriculture. World Day Against Child Labour 12 June 2007. Geneva: ILO.
- ILO (2012), ILO Indicators of Forced Labour. Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour. Geneva: ILO.
- ILO (2015), R204 Transition from the Informal to the Formal Economy Recommendation, 2015 (No. 204), Available from:

 https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CO_DE:R204. Geneva: ILO.
- ILO (2020), ILO Toolkit on Developing National Action Plans on Forced Labour. Tool No. 2: Forced labour and related concepts. https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_762168.pdf
- ILO (2021), Financing responsibly the cocoa supply chain in Côte d'Ivoire: the "leverage" role of the financial sector in eliminating child labour. Abidjan: ILO, Accelerating Action for the Elimination of Child Labour in Supply Chains in Africa (ACCEL Africa) Project.
- ILO (2023), Accelerating action for the elimination of child labour in supply chains in Africa (ACCEL AFRICA), 2nd Phase. In Brief. Geneva: ILO.
- ILO, (2023), Good Practices: Knowledge Sharing for Partnerships on the Elimination of Child Labour in Supply Chains, Available from: https://www.ilo.org/africa/technical-cooperation/accel-africa/WCMS 867045/lang--en/index.htm. ILO.
- ILO (2023), Africa: Child Labor in Cocoa Fields/ Harkin-Engel Protocol, Available from https://www.ilo.org/resource/africa-child-labor-cocoa-fields-harkin-engel-protocol. Website accessed 10 January 2023.
- ILO (2023), Forced Labour Observatory (FLO), Available from: https://www.ilo.org/flodashboard/. ILO.
- ILO, Child Labour Platform (2023), Child Labour Platform: Leading the way for businesses to contribute to achieving target 8.7. Available from:

 https://childlabourplatform.org/overview/. ILO.
- ILO, Child Labour Platform (2023), ILO Child Labour Platform 14th Annual Meeting, "From the Ground Up: Collective Action to End Child Labour in Supply Chains", Available from: https://childlabourplatform.org/action/child-labour-platform-14th-annual-meeting-from-the-ground-up/. ILO.

- ILO, (2023), Good Practices: Knowledge Sharing for Partnerships on the Elimination of Child Labour in Supply Chains, Available from: https://www.ilo.org/africa/technical-cooperation/accel-africa/WCMS 867045/lang--en/index.htm. ILO.
- ILO (2023), Nouveau programme contre le travail des enfants dans la filière cacao en Côte d'Ivoire. Available from: https://www.ilo.org/africa/media-centre/news/WCMS 877773/lang--fr/index.htm. ILO.
- ILO (2023), R203 Forced Labour (Supplementary Measures) Recommendation, 2014 (No. 203), Available from https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_INSTRUMENT_ID:3174688
- ILO, ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No.29), Available from https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12100:0::NO::P12100 ILO CODE:C029
- ILO, UNICEF (2017), Child Labour: Global estimates 2020, trends and the road forward, New York: ILO and UNICEF.
- Inades-Formation (2023), Available from: https://www.inadesformation.net/en/inades-formation-cote-divoire/
- INKOTA (2023), Faire Preise Und Mitsprache Von Kakaoproduzent Innen Erstreiten (Fight for Fair Prices and a Say for Cocoa Producers) https://www.inkota.de/projekte/cote-divoire/faire-preise-und-mitsprache-von-kakaoproduzentinnen-erstreiten
- International Monetary Fund (2023), Côte d'Ivoire: Requests for and Extended Arrangement Under the Extended Fund Facility and a 40-Month Arrangement Under the Extended Credit Facility Press Release; Staff Report; and Statement by the Executive Director for Côte d'Ivoire. Washington, D.C.: IMF.
- International Monetary Fund (2023), IMF Reaches Staff-Level Agreement on the First Review of the Extended Credit Facility and Conducts Discussions of the 2023 Article IV Consultation with Ghana, Available from:

 https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2023/10/05/pr23339-ghana-imf-reaches-sla-1st-rev-ecf-conducts-discussions-2023-art-iv-consult. IMF.
- International Monetary Fund (2023), Press Release No. PR23/74, IMF Staff Concludes Mission to Côte d'Ivoire, March 15, 2023. Available from:

 https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2023/03/15/pr2374-cote-divoire-imf-staff-concludes-mission. IMF.
- INTRAC for civil society, Realist Evaluation. UK (online only, no longer any physical office): INTRAC for civil society.

- INTRAC for civil society, Social Network Analysis. UK (online only, no longer any physical office): INTRAC for civil society.
- ISEAL Alliance (2022), Effective company actions in landscapes and jurisdictions. Guiding Practices. Volume 1.0. London: ISEAL Alliance.
- Jacobs Foundation (Undated), CLEF Child Learning and Education Facility, Available from: https://jacobsfoundation.org/activity/clef-elan/. Jacobs Foundation.
- Jacobs Foundation (2020), ELAN—Early Learning and Nutrition Facility, Zürich: Jacobs Foundation.
- Jacobs Foundation (Undated), Transforming Education in Côte d'Ivoire (TRECC), https://jacobsfoundation.org/activity/trecc-transforming-education-cocoa-communities/
- Kalischek, N., Lang, N., Renier, C., Caye Daudt, R., Addoah, T., Thompson, W, Blaser-Hart, W.J., Garrett, R., Schindler, K., Wegner, D. Satellite-based high-resolution maps of cocoa planted area for Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. UNEP-WCMC, Available from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/361275455_Satellite-based_high-resolution_maps_of_cocoa_planted_area_for_Cote_d'Ivoire_and_Ghana Website accessed May 20, 2023.
- KIT (2023), The potential of landscape approaches for addressing child labour in sustainability programmes in the cocoa sector. Available from: https://www.kit.nl/project/the-potential-of-landscape-approaches-for-addressing-child-labour-in-sustainability-programmes-in-the-cocoa-sector/ in sustainability programmes in the cocoa sector.
- (KNUST) (2022), An Assessment of Child Labor Monitoring and Remediation Systems (Clmrs) in Three Selected Cocoa Cooperatives in Ashanti Region: Final Report. Accra & Kumasi: KNUST College of Agriculture and Natural Resources; Winrock.
- Kuapa Kokoo (Undated), About Company Kuapa Kokoo Cooperative Cocoa Farmers and Marketing Union Limited (KKFU), Available from: https://kuapakokoo.com/. Kuapa Kokoo

- Kuapa Kokoo (Undated), Child and Ethical Labour Department. https://new.kuapakokoo.com/about (site being renewed).
- Landscape News, (2022), Cocoa co-op concocts richer futures for farmers: Q&A with Awa Bamba, Available from: https://news.globallandscapesforum.org/58194/cocoa-co-op-concocts-richer-futures-for-farmers-qa-with-awa-bamba/. Landscape News.
- Living Income Community of Practice (Undated), Available from: https://www.living-income.com/
- Los Angeles Times (August 15, 2023) U.S. issued over imports of cocoa harvested by child labor, Available from: https://www.latimes.com/business/story/2023-08-15/cocoa-harvested-by-children-child-labor, Los Angeles Times.
- Meiji (2022), Meiji Joins the Platform for Sustainable Cocoa in Developing Countries and Declares Support for Action Plan to Eliminate Child Labour in the Cocoa Industry. Tokyo: Meiji
- Meuth Alldredge, J, Liuzzi, S. (2022), Final Report: Synthesis Review of OCFT Work in Cocoa and Fishing/Seafood, Washington, D.C.: Mathematica.
- Millennium Challenge Corporation (2023), Available from https://www.mcc.gov/where-wework/program/cote-divoire-compact/
- Ministry of Food and Agriculture, Ghana (2021), Youth in Agriculture. Available from:

 https://mofa.gov.gh/site/programmes/youth-in-agriculture#:~:text=The%20average%20age%20of%20farmer,averages%20between%2055%20%E2%80%93%2060%20years. Ministry of Food and Agriculture, Ghana.
- Ministry of Food and Agriculture, COCOBOD, Tree Crops Development Authority (2023), Ghana Tree Crops Diversification Project: Labour Management Procedure, Final Report, Accra: Ministry of Food and Agriculture, COCOBOD, Tree Crops Development Authority.
- Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection (Ghana) (Undated), Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty Program. Available from: https://leap.mogcsp.gov.gh/ Ministry of Gender, Children and Social Protection.
- Nestlé (2022), The Income Accelerator Program: How it works. Vevey: Nestlé.
- NORC (October 2020), Assessing Progress in Reducing Child Labor in Cocoa Production in Cocoa Growing Areas of Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana Final Report, Chicago: NORC.

- Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons (2023), Available from:

 https://www.state.gov/united-states-and-cote-divoire-launch-child-protection-compact-partnership-activities/. The United States Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons.
- Official Journal of the European Union (2023) Regulation (EU) 2023/1115 of the European Parliament and of the Council Of 31 May 2023 On The Making Available On The Union market and the export from the Union of certain commodities and products associated with deforestation and forest degradation and repealing Regulation (EU) No 995/2010. Brussels: The European Parliament and the Council of the European Union.
- Ofori Agyeman, E. (2023), Protocols and Guidelines for the Establishment of Child Labour Free Zones. Accra: Labour Department, Ministry of Employment and Labour Relations, Ghana.
- Okali, K., Boamah, E. F., & Sumberg, J. (2022). The Quantification of Child Labour by Ghana's Mass Media: A Missed Opportunity? Africa Spectrum, 57(2), 155-177. https://doi.org/10.1177/00020397221096166
- Oorthuizen, J., Vermaak, J., Romeu Dalmau, C., Papaemmanuel, E. (2018), Collaborative Transformation: the Art of Making International Trade More Sustainable. Wageningen: IDH, Wageningen Academic Publishers.
- OXFAM International (May 2023), Chocolate giants reap huge profits as promises to improve farmers' incomes "ring hollow", Available from https://www.oxfam.org/en/press-releases/chocolate-giants-reap-huge-profits-promises-improve-farmers-incomes-ring-hollow.
- Plan International (2020), Applying Gender responsive Human Rights Due Diligence in practice.

 Cases from the Cocoa sector, the Ready-Made Garment & the Tourism & Hospitality sector. The Hague: Plan Nederland.
- Plateforme Ivoirienne pour le Cacao Durable (2023), Available from: https://plateformecacao.org/fr/qui-sommes-nous.
- Producteurs Ivoiriennes et Ghanéennes. Available from:
 https://plateformecacao.org/fr/declaration-des-organisations-de-la-societe-civile-et-des-organisations-des-producteurs-ivoiriennes.
- Portail Officiel du Gouvernement de Côte d'Ivoire (2022), Durabilité du Cacao : La Team Europe Mobilise 450 Millions D'euros Pour Appuyer la Stratégie de la Côte d'Ivoire. Available from: https://www.gouv.ci/ actualite-article.php?recordID=14153. Partial Officiel du Gouvernement De Côte D'ivoire.

- Puratos (2023), Bridging the Gap Towards a Living Income for the Cacao-Trace Farmer
 Community in Ivory Coast. Project 2. Available from:
 https://www.puratos.com/news/Bridging_the_gap_towards_a_living_income_for_Cacao-Trace farmers
- Rainforest Alliance (2021), Project Profile: Tackling Forced Labor and Child Labor in the Ghanaian Cocoa and Gold Mining Sectors, Available from: https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/in-the-field/tackling-forced-labor-and-child-labor-in-ghana-sectors-project/. Rainforest Alliance.
- Rainforest Alliance (Undated), Cocoa. Available from: https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/commodity/cocoa/
- Rikolto International (2023), Rikoloto-2022: Sowing the Seeds for Sustainable Food Systems Annual Report, Antwerp: Rikolto International.
- Rikolto International (2023), Taking Ivorian cocoa to the higher level, Available from: https://www.rikolto.org/projects/taking-ivorian-cocoa-to-the-higher-level. Rikolto International.
- Save the Children (Undated). "Cocoa Promise", Available from: https://cotedivoire.savethechildren.net/what-we-do/sant%C3%A9-et-nutrition/cocoa-promise. Available from: Save the Children.
- Save the Children (Undated). "PACTE", Available from:
 https://cotedivoire.savethechildren.net/what-we-do/sant%C3%A9-et-nutrition/pacte-ii.

 Save the Children.
- Save the Children (Undated). "Protection des enfants dans les plantations de cacao" (CPCP), Available from: https://cotedivoire.savethechildren.net/projets/cpcp-ii. Save the Children.
- Save the Children (Undated). "Work: No Child's Business", Available from: https://cotedivoire.savethechildren.net/what-we-do/sant%C3%A9-et-nutrition/work-no-child-business. Save the Children.
- Solidaridad (Undated), Cocoa. Available from https://www.solidaridadnetwork.org/commodity/cocoa/

SimpleMind, Home. Available from: https://simplemind.eu/. SimpleMind

- Termeer, E., Vos, B., Bolchini, A., Van Ingen, E., & Abrokwa, K. FAO, Wageningen University & Research (2023), Digitalization and child labour in agriculture: Exploring blockchain and Geographic Information Systems to monitor and prevent child labour in Ghana's cocoa sector. Rome: FAO.
- Terre des Hommes (Undated), Protecting Children on the Move in West Africa. Available from: https://www.tdh.org/en/projects/west-africa-migration
- Tulane University (July 2015), Survey Research on Child Labor in West African Cocoa Growing Areas, New Orleans: Tulane University.
- The World Bank Group (2022), International Development Association International Finance Corporation Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency Country Partnership Framework For The Republic of Côte d'Ivoire For The Period Fy23-Fy27, Washington, D.C.: The World Bank Group.
- The World Bank (2023), A New Strategy to Support Economic and Social Transformation in Côte d'Ivoire, Available from: https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2023/02/02/a-new-strategy-to-support-economic-and-social-transformation-in-cote-divoire. The World Bank.
- The World Bank (2023), World Bank Supports Ghana to Modernize and Diversify its Tree Crops Sector to Accelerate Productivity, Resilience, and Industrialization. Available from:

 https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2023/06/23/world-bank-supports-ghana-to-modernize-and-diversify-its-tree-crops-sector-to-accelerate-productivity-resilience, The World Bank.
- UNDP (2022), System Change: A Guidebook for Adopting Portfolio Approaches. Bangkok: UNDP.
- UNICEF (2018), Human-Centered (Child-Centered) Design Thinking in Support of the Design Process of the New UNICEF Malawi Country Programme 2019-2023. Lilongwe: UNICEF.
- UNICEF (2019), Human-Centred Design: Accelerating results for every child by design. New York: UNICEF.
- UNICEF (2019), Ending Child Labour Through a Multisectoral Approach. New York: UNICEF.
- UNICEF (2019), Final Report UNICEF Côte d'Ivoire: Promoting the Rights of children in the Cocoa Producing Areas in Côte d'Ivoire. Abidjan: UNICEF.
- UNICEF (2020), Impacts of the Ghana Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty 1000 programme, Available from: https://www.unicef-irc.org/article/1964-final-evaluation-of-ghana-social-protection-programme-for-infants-now-available.html . UNICEF. Also see:

- UNICEF (2020), Mapping Child Labour Risks in Global Value Chains. Geneva: Better Business for Children Advancing Child Rights and Business.
- UNICEF (2021), Ending Child Labor Through a Multisectoral Approach, New York: UNICEF.
- UNICEF (2021), Fulfilling the Commitment to Child Protection in Ghana, UNICEF New York: UNICEF. Page 74.
- UNICEF (2021), Le droit des enfants à la protection: Analyse de la situation des enfants et des femmes en Côte d'Ivoire, Abidjan: UNICEF.
- UNICEF (2023), Elimination du travail des enfants dans la NAWA. Available from:

 https://www.unicef.org/cotedivoire/communiqu%C3%A9s-de-presse/elimination-du-travail-des-enfants-dans-la-nawa%E2%80%AF-0. UNICEF.
- UNSTATS SDG 8.7 (2020), SDG Indicators, Available from https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/metadata/?Text=&Goal=8&Target=8.7. UNSTATS.
- USAID (2022), Resilient Ecosystems and Sustainable Transformation of Rural Economies (RESTORE) Fact Sheet. Washington, D.C., USAID.
- US Customs and Border Protection (Undated), Forced Labor, Available from: https://www.cbp.gov/trade/forced-labor. US Customs and Border Protection.
- USDOL-ILAB (Undated), Adwuma Pa, Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/adwuma-pa. USDOL-ILAB.
- USDOL-ILAB (Undated), CACAO: Cooperatives Addressing Child Labor Accountability Outcomes, Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/cacao-cooperatives-addressing-child-labor-accountability-outcomes
- USDOL-ILAB (Undated), Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labor in West Africa by Strengthening Sub-Regional Cooperation Through ECOWAS. Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/eliminating-worst-forms-child-labor-west-africa-strengthening-sub-regional
- USDOL, ILAB (Undated), MATE MASIE project. Available from https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/mate-masie-making-advances-eliminate-child-labor-more-areas-sustainable-integrated
- USDOL, ILAB (Undated), Mobilizing Community Action and Promoting Opportunities for Youth in Ghana's Cocoa-Growing Communities (MOCA). Available from:

 https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/mobilizing-community-action-and-promoting-opportunities-youth-ghanas-cocoa-growing-0

- USDOL, ILAB (Undated), Child Labor in the Production of Cocoa, Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/our-work/child-forced-labor-trafficking/child-labor-cocoa. USDOL ILAB.
- USDOL, ILAB (Undated), Combating Forced Labor and Labor Trafficking of Adults and Children in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire (FLIP) (2016-2023), Available from:

 https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/combating-forced-labor-and-labor-trafficking-adults-and-children-ghana-and-cote
- USDOL, ILAB (Undated), Eliminating Child Labor in Cocoa (ECLIC). Available from: https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/eliminating-child-labor-cocoa-eclic-0
- USDOL, Bureau of International Labor Affairs (2022-2023), Child Labor and Forced Labor Reports: Ghana. Available from:
 https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ilab/resources/reports/child-labor/ghana. USDOL,
 Bureau of International Labor Affairs
- Verité (2023), Forced Labor Indicators Project (FLIP) in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana. Available from: https://verite.org/forced-labor-indicators-project/. Website accessed February 20, 2023.
- Verité. (2023). The ILO Forced Labour Indicators. https://verite.org/forced-labor-indicators-project/flip-resources/ilo-forced-labour-indicators/
- Verité (2019), Assessment of Forced Labor Risk in the Cocoa Sector of Côte d'Ivoire, Amherst: Verité.
- Williams, B. and Hummelbrunner, R: Systems Concepts in Action (Stanford, Stanford Business Book, 2010).
- Williams, B., Systemic Evaluation Design: A Workbook, 2nd Edition (Online Publishing, 2019).
- Winrock International (September 2022), Making Advances to Eliminate Child Labor in More Areas with Sustainable Integrated Efforts (MATE MASIE) Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (CMEP). Arlington, VA: Winrock International.
- World Bank (2019), Safety Nets: Social safety net programs protect families from the impact of economic shocks, natural disasters, and other crises. Available from https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/safetynets
- Mondelēz Cocoa Life, World Vision Ghana (2014), Mondelēz Cocoa Life Project. Accra: World Vision. Available from: https://www.wvi.org/ghana/publication/cocoa-life-project-readable-e-version-fact-sheet

World Vision (2023), Helping to Earn the Money for School. Available from: https://www.wvi.org/stories/helping-earn-money-school

Zegers, M. C. R., and Ayenor, G. K. (June 2021), Ending Child Labour and Promoting Sustainable Cocoa Production in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana, Brussels: European Commission.

Appendix B. List of Interviewees

This page has been left intentionally blank in accordance with Federal Information Security Management Act (FISMA) of 2002, Public Law 107-347.

About the American Institutes for Research®

Established in 1946, the American Institutes for Research® (AIR®) is a nonpartisan, not-for-profit institution that conducts behavioral and social science research and delivers technical assistance both domestically and internationally in the areas of education, health, and the workforce. AIR's work is driven by its mission to generate and use rigorous evidence that contributes to a better, more equitable world. With headquarters in Arlington, Virginia, AIR has offices across the U.S. and abroad. For more information, visit AIR.ORG.



AIR® Headquarters

+1.202.403.5000 | AIR.ORG

Notice of Trademark: "American Institutes for Research" and "AIR" are registered trademarks. All other brand, product, or company names are trademarks or registered trademarks of their

Copyright © 2023 American Institutes for Research®. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying, recording, website display, or other electronic or mechanical methods, without the prior written permission of the American Institutes for Research. For permission requests, please use the Contact Us form on AIR.ORG.