

Workforce Information Advisory Council

Summary of In Person Meeting

January 25, 2023

9:00 AM – 5:00 PM ET

The Workforce Information Advisory Council (WIAC) was convened for an in-person meeting at 9:00 AM on Wednesday, January 25, 2023. The Council was convened pursuant to Section 308 of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act of 2014 (WIOA) (Pub. L. 113-128), which amends section 15 of the Wagner-Peyser Act of 1933 (29 U.S.C. § 491–2) and in accordance with the provisions of the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended (5 U.S.C. App.) and its implementing regulation at 41 CFR 102-3.

Mr. Steven Rietzke, Chief, Division of National Programs, Tools, and Technical Assistance (DNPTTA), Employment and Training Administration (ETA), U.S. Department of Labor (DOL) and Designated Federal Officer (DFO) for the Council, convened the meeting. The entirety of the meeting day was open to the public and concluded at 5:00 PM on Wednesday, January 25, 2023.

In Attendance:

Members of the Workforce Information Advisory Council

Bruce Madson, Ohio Department of Job and Family Services (Chair)

Daryl Bassett, Arkansas Department of Labor

Deborah Carlson, Texas Workforce Commission

Alicia Crouch, Kentucky Community and Technical College System

Lesley Hirsch, New Jersey Department of Labor and Workforce Development

Dean Jones, Greenville County Workforce Development Board

James MacKay, MacKay Construction Services

Chelsea Mason – Placek, Washington State Labor Council, AFL-CIO

Andrew Reamer, George Washington Institute of Public Policy, George Washington University

David Schmidt, Nevada Department of Employment, Training, and Rehabilitation

Jennifer Zeller, Georgia Power Community & Economic Development

Members of the Council Not in Attendance

Adrienne Johnston, Florida Department of Economic Opportunity

Tamika Ledbetter, Alaska Department of Labor and Workforce Development

Invited Speakers

Jim Goodell, Quality Information Partners

Denise Lawson, Quality Information Partners

Danielle Saunders, Consultant, U.S. Chamber of Commerce Foundation

Staff

Steve Rietzke, Chief, DNPTTA, ETA (DFO)

Kirk Mueller, BLS

Don Haughton, ETA

Ken Robertson, BLS

Lucas Arbulu, ETA

Cynthia Forland, Forland Consulting

Lauren Fairley, ETA

Annette Summers, The GA Team

Pam Frugoli, ETA

Torrie Nickerson, The GA Team

Danielle Kittrell, ETA

Betsy Roberts, The GA Team

Julie Hatch, BLS

Others Attending for All or a Portion of the Meeting

Jake Baker, Littler

Amy Hiltunen, National Association of State Workforce Agencies (NASWA)

Jim Ireland, HR Open Standards

Yufanyi Nshom, DOL ETA

Tiffany Osborne, Equus Workforce Solutions

Tiffany Smith, DOL ETA

Proceedings: January 25, 2023 9:00 AM ET

Welcome and Review of Agenda

MR. RIETZKE convened the meeting of the Workforce Information Advisory Council (WIAC). He provided opening remarks on the agenda for the day. He shared that during the morning portion of the meeting, the Council would focus on the topic of skills.

MR. RIETZKE explained that a major goal for the afternoon portion of the meeting is to reexamine the draft recommendations, prioritize which recommendations to keep, and make edits to the recommendations that the Council members decide to move forward with.

MR. RIETZKE introduced Council Chair, **Bruce Madson**.

MR. MADSON shared that he was looking forward to the presentations and discussion on skills especially because the topic is relevant to many of the Council member's various roles in their daily jobs.

The Council members who were present at the meeting introduced themselves.

Skills Updates

MR. RIETZKE introduced **Ms. Pam Frugoli, ETA**.

MS. FRUGOLI began the morning skills session by sharing a brief presentation on the complexity of the skills topic. She outlined relevant DOL skills tools like O*NET and the Competency Model Clearinghouse and elaborated on the need for greater detail and more dynamic information as it relates to skills. **MS. FRUGOLI** shared the example of the World Economic Forum's January 2021 Report titled: *Building a Common Language for Skills at Work, A Global Taxonomy*.

MS. FRUGOLI introduced featured speakers and skills experts, **Mr. Jim Goodell, Quality Information Partners; Ms. Denise Lawson, Quality Information Partners; and Ms. Danielle Saunders, Consultant, U.S. Chamber of Commerce Foundation**.

MR. GOODELL thanked the Council members for inviting **MS. LAWSON, MS. SAUNDERS**, and himself to present to the WIAC. **MR. GOODELL** explained that he and his colleagues put together a presentation specifically for the WIAC, but he hopes their time together can be a collaborative discussion rather than strictly a presentation. He shared that the topic of their session will focus on Skills-Based Hiring and Advancement (SBHA), but more specifically, he asked the Council members to consider the question, "How can government promote the access and use of better skills information to inform policy makers, organizations, and individuals?"

MR. GOODELL provided background information on the T3 Innovation Network (T3). T3 is under the stewardship of the U.S. Chamber of Commerce Foundation and its mission is to enable the digital transformation of the talent marketplace by promoting data interoperability and harmonization across diverse stakeholders. The digital transformation will ensure the following vision of T3: that all learning counts, skill are used like currency, and learners and workers are empowered with data to pursue education and employment opportunities.

MR. GOODELL described T3 as a "network of networks" that convenes, aligns, and supports stakeholder work on core data infrastructure components to ensure harmony and alignment around the T3 vision. The networks are as follows: Data and Technology Standards (DTS) Network; Open Competencies (OC) Network; Learning and Employment Records Network (LERN); and Jobs and Workforce Data (JWD) Network. **MR. GOODELL** shared a visual representation of the organizational structure of the U.S. Chamber of Commerce Foundation, T3, the Networks, and sets of projects related to each Network. He stated that the SBHA topic that they will focus on today falls under the JWD and DTS Networks.

MS. SAUNDERS and **MS. LAWSON** presented on the SBHA Project. **MS. SAUNDERS** provided an overview of SBHA, stating that it helps employers access and expand the talent pool and increase economic mobility. She emphasized the urgency of helping employers to fill jobs and workers to find jobs. SBHA helps to fill openings through the methodology of matching a work opportunity's requirements to a candidate's capabilities through validated job requirements, robust candidate information, skills-powered guidance services, and fairer hiring and advancement experiences.

MS. SAUNDERS shared how she and the SBHA and T3 project teams define skills. They use skills very broadly as shorthand for all types of measurable statements or assertions about what an individual knows and is able to do. They find it important to talk about this information broadly as a grouping and include what some refer to as competencies from employer, education, and job candidate perspectives.

MR. GOODELL took a moment to pause the presentation and provided the Council members with the opportunity to ask questions and provide comments. In the conversations that followed, the Council members and the featured speakers discussed SBHA benefits to industry and employers, employer job coding, and the role of artificial intelligence (AI) in prediction precision.

MS. SAUNDERS outlined the future vision of SBHA, which is to predict performance. She stated that the ability to predict performance on the job means that decisions about the workforce are based on skills more than jobs; better aligned education and training and employer needs which helps to close skills gaps; and increased enrollment and completion through a clear connection between education and training programs and careers. **MS. SAUNDERS** walked the Council members through a use case overview for employers and candidates.

MR. GOODELL paused the presentation again to provide the Council members with another opportunity to ask questions and provide comments. In the conversations that followed, the Council members and the featured speakers discussed the role of industry in the SBHA initiatives, the need for innovation in governance and policy, and the relationship with state labor entities.

MS. LAWSON shared that SBHA is currently focusing on building use cases representing the view of education and training providers and looking at some of the leading practices that need to be considered when bringing education and training providers into the SBHA ecosystem. **MS. LAWSON** outlined the leading SBHA practices for education and training providers. She shared a visual representation of the SBHA future ecosystem outlining the pathways between employers, education and training providers, and the learner/worker and different tools and methods that will allow the transfer of information so that there can be a better match between the learner and the work opportunity with the employer.

MR. GOODELL provided a brief overview of how digital credentials work in this ecosystem. He shared a diagram of a digital wallet and explained how, from a technology standpoint, this is where things are going. This ecosystem enables workers and learners with their own records so that they can have more control and curate how they present themselves to employers. It also provides opportunities to have verifiable credentials that are issued by education and training providers, as well as verified records of work experiences. **MR. GOODELL** explained that resumes still do matter in this digital world. The digital resume allows the worker to curate and align their story to the job.

Even with the added benefits of current and emerging digital credential technology, **MR. GOODELL** explained that employers are not buying into digital credentials alone. Employers are interested in a larger paradigm shift. Employers need verification and validation to ensure the education and training record contents can be interpreted in ways to predict success in a position. **MR. GOODELL** stated that this is less of a technology problem and more of an alignment problem in parts of the ecosystem. For example: Is the education and training program aligned with the job? What processes are in place to keep pace with rapid changing occupations? Does the system support lifelong learning and career mobility? He provided additional mismatch examples through Bloom's Taxonomy.

MR. GOODELL concluded the presentation by sharing related U.S. Chamber of Commerce Foundation projects that support the SBHA future ecosystem. The projects are as follows: Resume CV Standard, JEDx, Experience You, Job Skills for In-Demand Employment (JobSIDE), and Competency Explorer.

Open Discussion on the Skills Based Hiring and Advancement Future Ecosystem

MR. GOODELL transitioned into the open discussion portion of the skills session. He instructed the Council members to consider the SBHA Future Ecosystem diagram and posed the following question, “How can government promote open access and better use of skills information to inform policy makers, organizations, and individuals?”

MR. GOODELL encouraged the Council members to also consider topics such as desired outcomes, challenges, and solutions.

In the conversations that followed, the Council members asked questions, debated challenges within the SBHA Future Ecosystem and government participation, and shared ideas.

The conversation resulted in the following brainstorming list of topic ideas and themes:

- Leverage public-private partnerships to create a dynamic system of systems for continuously updating skills information, e.g., federal funding as a catalyst for philanthropic, state, and employer funding and coordination of interdependent public goods.
- Support more granular task-level definitions (in context) using administrative data and AI along with survey data.
- Use AI and machine learning (ML), multiple sources, and multiple data points to refine ontologies of skills continuously and iteratively, rather than static frameworks, to keep up with rapid changes in industries.
- Address evolving skills and contextually specific skills.
- Data to inform assessment specification, i.e., how to measure and predict performance.
- Support systems of life-long-learning, recognizing that the future workforce will need to continuously re-skill and upskill.
- Work experience data can inform skills definitions in context.
- Skills data used to expose workers to opportunities and specific steps they can take.
- Remove barriers such as limited broadband preventing access to opportunity-enabling information. Some non-tech-savvy communities may continue to need support from job centers to access information.
- Instead of "job projections" DOL/BLS should work together on "skill projections" or even "task projections" reports and systems to update frequently.
- Communication of trends packaged and promoted for consumption and use by all “customers” including federal departments and policymakers as well as employers and learners/workers.
- Give more information back to businesses and education-training providers.
- Commission “tiger teams” to examine process improvement, "what will it take to get policymakers and constituents doing something differently" to take advantage of richer dynamic skills information. Answer these questions: What are the innovations in organizational practices that can match the innovations in workforce information data?
- Frame recommendations as necessary to meet existing Congressional mandates such as talent pipelines to advanced manufacturing and to fulfill mandate for evidence-based policymaking.

MR. RIETZKE thanked **MR. GOODELL**, **MS. SAUNDERS**, and **MS. LAWSON** for spending the morning with the WIAC and for their interactive presentation and open discussion session.

A copy of the T3 Innovation Network's Skills-Based Hiring and Advancement presentation is available at: <https://www.dol.gov/agencies/eta/wioa/wiac/meetings>

Discussion of Skills Updates and Council Member Panel

Cynthia Forland, Forland Consulting facilitated the discussion on skills updates and the Council member panel.

MS. FORLAND complimented the Council members on the great conversations on skills during the first half of the meeting and shared that they would continue to discuss, from a practical stance, why skills matter. She encouraged the Council members to think back to the SBHA presentation on how skills can help us navigate the employer, training provider, and individual dynamic.

MS. FORLAND shared that during the Council member panel, three Council members would share day-to-day practical examples on how they use skills and why skills are important. The perspectives would encompass the local government, state government, and economic development application of skills.

MR. MADSON spoke first. He addressed the topic of why skills matter from a state agency perspective and responsibility. **MR. MADSON** explained how state administrators wear multiple hats as they oversee and operate various public-facing programs. For example, direct programs like unemployment insurance, which is funded by the state agency, and indirect programs like WIOA and Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF), which are funded by the federal government. **MR. MADSON** also provided the example of how the state is a large employer competing for skilled workers. **MR. MADSON** outlined the different applications of why skills matter in each of these state administrator responsibility categories.

- Indirect Programs – Need to understand how and what role skills have in the success and outcomes of programs and whether the current deployment of assets and information are meeting the needs of the deliverers of the services. For example, slow or no economic recovery in certain geographic areas and the need for a broader sharing of skills data to understand how and why specific areas are not benefiting from unfilled employer opportunities.
- Direct Programs – Need to deliver program services and connect to other programs to achieve better outcomes. For example, connecting the unemployed to new jobs and assisting them in making informed consumer choices.
- Large State Employer – State agency competing for skilled workers and the need to understand its existing inventory of skills that it has. The state cannot compete financially to supply its own agency with the skills it seeks. This leads to contracting out to find those skills, which is not a desirable long-term solution.

Dean Jones, Greenville County Workforce Development Board, spoke second. **MR. JONES** presented on the importance of skills from the local workforce development board point of view. **MR. JONES** emphasized his unique perspective in being able to connect with hiring managers, training managers, business owners, training providers, and job seekers. **MR. JONES** explained the deployment of local assets to drive local services and performance in Greenville County, South Carolina and how the local workforce board serves as convenors of sector strategies for employers, businesses, and training providers. **MR. JONES** outlined several projects that the state of South Carolina has implemented to fill job vacancies, in addition to the added focus on sourcing workers from underserved communities. **MR. JONES** made special note of the ASCEND Collective. A pilot project and AI talent source platform aimed at turning job descriptions into skills profiles. **MR. JONES** shared that the state has moved away from the use of resumes and instead uses skills profiles for job candidates.

Jennifer Zeller, Georgia Power, closed out the panel. **MS. ZELLER** spoke from the economic development perspective. She provided background information on how and why Georgia Power uses data. In economic development, her organization recruits businesses to Georgia and then helps those businesses expand. There has never been a more urgent time than now to obtain skills-based data. **MS. ZELLER** emphasized the proliferation of mega projects and manufacturing projects looking to insource. While the opportunities and investment in the state are at a 30-year high, the labor force remains flat. **MS. ZELLER** explained that as new businesses are considering site locations, they are requesting job estimates and data on skill sets, and even occupational titles. The more local and granular the information they can get, the more likely they will be to select a specific site location. **MS. ZELLER** provided an example of an analysis her team conducted for a warehouse company from London interested in locating to South Atlanta. They used occupational data to analyze the ramp up of skills transferability by looking at the tasks contained in an occupation and how it relates from a 90 percent skills transferability. By isolating skill sets within the search, they were able to find matches between food service skill sets and retail workers skill sets. Therefore, they were able to show the warehouse company that employees did exist and they could be upskilled to meet the company's needs.

MS. FORLAND thanked **MR. MADSON**, **MR. JONES**, and **MS. ZELLER** for providing such helpful perspectives.

Following the Council member panel, **MS. FORLAND** led the Council members through the exercise of examining potential ideas and topics in the area of skills for future inquiry over the next two years. To better inform the discussion, she encouraged the council members to think back to the SBHA presentation from the morning session and the information the panelists had just shared.

In the discussion that followed, the group brainstormed topics and ideas to pursue:

- How to identify industry-recognized credentials or employer-accepted credentials
- Find ways to collect information from employers (e.g., deidentified application data)
- Digital wallets
- Interactive career advancement tools by industry linked to training programs
- Subcommittees on credentialing/training, employer/jobseeker
- Support states participating in key pilots (e.g., JEDx)
- Talk to agencies pursuing industry policy
- Enhanced wage records driven by need for skills
- What are skills required for?
- Apprenticeship model – a joint effort of employers and DOL
- Follow the lead of Congressional mandates
- Pursue funding from other agencies charged with workforce projects
- DOL as internal labor consultant to other federal agencies
- Soft skills

Public Comment and Other Business

MR. RIETZKE opened the meeting for the public attendees to ask questions and provide comments and feedback. No public attendees requested to speak.

In lieu of public comment, **MR. RIETZKE** provided the Council with an update on membership terms. He reviewed the Federal Register Membership Solicitation. He shared that **MR. MADSON, MS. MASON-PLACEK, DR. REAMER,** and **MS. ZELLER** have met the end of their terms. He thanked them for their service and contributions over the past two terms.

MR. RIETZKE confirmed that all 14 council slots are being reassessed. He welcomed and encouraged the remaining members to submit another nomination to serve. However, there are no guarantees for reselection. Nominations must be submitted by February 27, 2023. **MR. RIETZKE** also thanked the remaining members for their service.

The Federal Register Notice is available here:

<https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2022/12/29/2022-28344/workforce-information-advisory-council>

Large Group Discussion

MS. FORLAND led the Council through the final action item on the agenda, prioritizing and discussing specific edits to the draft recommendations. She encouraged the council members to take this opportunity to ask questions and provide comments.

MS. FORLAND displayed each subcommittee's specific recommendations on flip charts. She charged the Council members with deciding if these are the current recommendations that they wish to elevate to the Secretary. **MS. FORLAND** walked the Council members through the review of each recommendation, one by one.

In the conversations that followed, the Council members discussed and debated updates to the draft recommendations.

The following outlines the edits to the recommendations that the Council members unanimously agreed to:

- **Labor force Participation Recommendations**

- Recommendation 1: Direct the Bureau of Labor Statistics to publish additional demographic data from the existing Current Population Survey about individuals who are nonparticipants but indicate that they want to work.
- Recommendation 2: Direct the Bureau of Labor Statistics to investigate opportunities to expand the data that can be published about reasons for nonparticipation that are collected and categorized under "Other."
 - Council agreed edit: Needs a clearer explanation.
- Recommendation 3: Explore opportunities to expand the questions in the Current Population Statistics survey or supplemental surveys to capture additional details about labor force nonparticipation, particularly for individuals who report that they want a job.
- Recommendation 4: Invest in in-depth qualitative research to identify, update, and refine understanding of the reasons why individuals leave the labor force and why they remain out of the labor force. This could take the form of a competitive bidding process for focus groups organized by need, region, and/or population group. Such research should embrace principles of qualitative research that facilitate self-identification of issues and problems from among the respondents.
 - Council agreed edit: Keep this recommendation to inform recommendations #2 and #3 and move to the top.

- Recommendation 5: Fund efforts to assemble a data system focused on answering questions about labor force non-participation. Such a system should consider the feasibility of combining existing and alternate data sources to assemble longitudinal data systems that reflect the workforce system's need to understand people's journeys into and out of the labor market and the underlying reasons, barriers, and opportunities for workforce system intervention to promote success for all workers.
- Recommendation 6: Engage in stakeholder discussions to identify gaps in existing labor market information that impede our understanding of labor force. This may include state and federal health and human services agencies, the Federal Reserve system, think tanks and advocacy organizations focused on the dynamics of labor force participation, and a cross-section of state, tribal, and local governments.
 - Council agreed edit: Move this recommendation up to further inform the following recommendations (e.g., additions to CPS).
- Recommendation 7: Direct the Bureau of Labor Statistics to examine the feasibility of a system where states may provide funds to increase CPS sample size so that they may leverage the benefits of the survey as it currently stands as well as the new questions to address labor force non-participation.
 - Council agreed edit: Consider adding to the sample or publish the cost of an additional sample.
- **Marketing and Outreach Recommendations:** Encourage states to actively pursue workforce and labor market (WLMI) information-driven marketing and outreach strategies to enhance and focus job/career/training searches.
 - Council agreed edit: Remove marketing from the title.
 - Council agreed edit: Secretary encourage states...
 - Recommendation 1: Provide UI filers (not just recipients) information on job postings, training, and the location of an American Job Center (with perhaps even a contact name at the AJC). This information should be provided multiple times either through email or text messages to act as a catalyst to promote employment.
 - Recommendation 2: Utilize existing LMI to implement focused marketing strategies to reach those individuals who may be unemployed but have not filed for UI and provide them with information on jobs, training, and the availability of the AJC's and the services they offer. Similar marketing efforts should also be developed to target individuals with disabilities, with a special emphasis to connect them with AJCs so they can have access to the wide range of services an AJC can provide.
 - Recommendation 3: Encourage apprenticeship offices within the state to work with unions and trade schools to promote apprenticeship opportunities and trade school curriculum that can lead to lucrative careers. Contacting high schools and conducting outreach activities to students in their early high school years is important so students are aware of career options other than those that require a college education.
 - Council agreed edit: Encourage apprenticeship and training offices...
 - Recommendation 4: Encourage AJCs to utilize social media or other non-traditional means to conduct marketing and outreach activities to reach populations that may not be responsive to traditional outreach efforts.

- Recommendation 5: Both the U.S. Department of Labor and the state labor departments should conduct marketing and outreach activities specifically targeted to promote how labor departments can use WLMI with employers to enhance their recruitment, hiring and retention. By making employers more aware of the types of business concerns that can be addressed by labor departments, and the AJC resources, labor departments can provide a value-added service to enhance the human resource component of business.
 - Council agreed edit: Explicitly state enhancement versus enforcement.
- **Industrial Policy Recommendations:** Recommend the Secretary of Labor encourage ETA and BLS to facilitate government wide use of their WLMI resources in in policies and programs aimed at enhancing the competitiveness of key U.S.-based industries in global markets. The WIAC specifically recommends that the Secretary direct ETA and BLS to:
 - Council agreed edit: The WIAC recommends that the Secretary of Labor periodically and systematically facilitate government-wide use of their WLMI resources in policies and programs aimed at enhancing the competitiveness of key U.S.-based industries in global markets. The WIAC specifically recommends that the Secretary:
 - Recommendation 1: Create a comprehensive list of agencies with a workforce component of an industrial strategy effort;
 - Recommendation 2: Ensure that these agencies are fully aware of DOL's WLMI resources and how to access and use them; and
 - Recommendation 3: Seek to understand what improvements and adjustments, if any, these agencies would like so that they might make more productive use of the WLMI resources.

Copies of the draft recommendations are available here: <https://www.dol.gov/agencies/eta/wioa/wiac/meetings>

Closing and Next Steps

MR. RIETZKE thanked the Council members for their attention and contributions throughout the meeting. **MS. FORLAND** shared that she would rework the draft recommendations overnight, based on the feedback from the prioritization session. The first order of business during tomorrow's meeting will be to review and finalize the updated recommendations and then vote to approve.

The meeting was adjourned.